



Heriot-Watt University
Research Gateway

Audit of research on minority ethnic issues from a 'race' perspective

Citation for published version:

Netto, G, Arshad, R, de Lima, P, Almeida Diniz, F, MacEwan, M, Patel, V & Syed, R 2001, *Audit of research on minority ethnic issues from a 'race' perspective*. Scottish Executive.

Link:

[Link to publication record in Heriot-Watt Research Portal](#)

Document Version:

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

Publisher Rights Statement:

© Crown Copyright 2001. Limited extracts from the text may be produced provided the source is acknowledged.

General rights

Copyright for the publications made accessible via Heriot-Watt Research Portal is retained by the author(s) and / or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

Take down policy

Heriot-Watt University has made every reasonable effort to ensure that the content in Heriot-Watt Research Portal complies with UK legislation. If you believe that the public display of this file breaches copyright please contact open.access@hw.ac.uk providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

Further copies of this report are available priced £5.00. Cheques should be made payable to The Stationery Office and addressed to:

The Stationery Office
71 Lothian Road
Edinburgh
EH3 9AZ

Order line and General Enquiries
0870 606 5566

The views expressed in this report are those of the researchers and do not necessarily represent those of the Department or Scottish Ministers.

© Crown Copyright 2001

Limited extracts from the text may be produced provided the source is acknowledged. For more extensive reproduction, please write to the Chief Research Officer at the Central Research Unit, Saughton House, Broomhouse Drive, Edinburgh EH11 3XA.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This audit owes much to the co-operation of all those who took the time and trouble to respond to our requests for research literature (both published and unpublished). The support provided by the libraries of the Planning Exchange, the Glasgow Unit of SEMRU, Age Concern and Edinburgh College of Art/Heriot Watt University was also very helpful.

The authors would also like to express our appreciation to all those who provided us with many helpful suggestions through the peer review process, which preceded the writing of the final report. We would also like to acknowledge the contribution of Alan Bell in the writing of the chapter on education, and Leaders at Work for the design and development of the electronic database. In particular, we would like to thank Nicola Edge, the project manager at the Central Research Unit, for her prompt and efficient support, throughout the duration of this work.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION	1
CONTEXT	1
COMMISSIONING THE AUDIT	1
SCOPE AND FOCUS OF THE AUDIT	2
ETHNICITY, RACE, RACISM AND INSTITUTIONAL RACISM	4
THEORETICAL APPROACHES IN STUDIES ON MINORITY ETHNIC GROUPS	5
THE MINORITY ETHNIC POPULATION IN SCOTLAND	5
METHODOLOGY	6
STRUCTURE OF THE AUDIT	8
TERMINOLOGY	8
REFERENCES	9
CHAPTER TWO RACE AND HOUSING	11
INTRODUCTION	11
STATISTICAL SOURCES	12
HOUSING NEEDS AND PREFERENCES OF MINORITY ETHNIC COMMUNITIES	14
BARRIERS TO ACCESS TO THE SOCIAL RENTED SECTOR	15
ORIENTATION TOWARDS OWNER OCCUPATION	18
HOUSE CONDITION AND SUPPORT FROM LOCAL AUTHORITIES	19
PRIVATE RENTED ACCOMMODATION: AN UNDER-RESEARCHED SECTOR	20
HOMELESSNESS AND MINORITY ETHNIC PEOPLE: A HIDDEN PHENOMENON	21
HOUSING AND URBAN REGENERATION	22
HOUSING NEEDS OF ASYLUM SEEKERS AND REFUGEES	22
MULTIPLE DISCRIMINATION	22
MAINSTREAMING AND MULTI-AGENCY WORKING	23
OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH	23
RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	25
REFERENCES	27
CHAPTER THREE RACE AND EDUCATION	31
INTRODUCTION	31
UPDATE OF RESEARCH	31
STATISTICAL SOURCES	32
ACCESS	34
LEARNING AND TEACHING: ETHOS	36
LEARNING AND TEACHING: CURRICULUM	37
LEARNING AND TEACHING: HOME AND SCHOOL	37
LEARNING AND TEACHING: LANGUAGE ISSUES	39
LANGUAGE AND TEACHING: TEACHER EDUCATION AND STAFF DEVELOPMENT	40
ATTAINMENT	41
ETHNICITY AND EDUCATIONAL EMPLOYMENT	41
OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH	42
RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	44
REFERENCES	48
CHAPTER FOUR RACE AND SOCIAL CARE	55
INTRODUCTION	55
STATISTICAL SOURCES	56
EXPERIENCES OF PARTICULAR GROUPS IN RELATION TO SOCIAL CARE SERVICES	58
ACCESS AND USE OF LOCAL AUTHORITY SERVICES	63
ACCESS AND USE OF VOLUNTARY SECTOR PROVISION	66
MULTIPLE DISCRIMINATION	67
MAINSTREAMING AND MULTI-AGENCY WORKING	68
OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH	69
RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	71

REFERENCES	73
CHAPTER FIVE RACE AND HEALTH	78
INTRODUCTION	78
STATISTICAL SOURCES	79
HEALTH STATUS, KNOWLEDGE AND BEHAVIOUR	80
ACCESS AND USE OF HEALTH SERVICES	85
ACCESS AND USE OF SPECIFIC SERVICES	87
MULTIPLE DISCRIMINATION	90
POLICY AND PRACTICE OF HEALTH AGENCIES	90
COMPLEMENTARY ROLES OF RESEARCH ON HEALTH STATUS & ACCESS TO HEALTH SERVICES	91
OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH	92
RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	93
REFERENCES	95
CHAPTER SIX RACE AND ACCESS TO JUSTICE	104
INTRODUCTION	104
STATISTICAL SOURCES	104
EXTENT AND NATURE OF RACIAL HARASSMENT	105
MINORITY ETHNIC PEOPLE'S CONTACT WITH THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM	108
MINORITY ETHNIC PEOPLE'S CONTACT WITH THE CIVIL JUSTICE SYSTEM	110
MULTIPLE VICTIMISATION AND DISCRIMINATION	111
OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH	112
RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	114
REFERENCES	116
CHAPTER SEVEN RACE, EMPLOYMENT AND ENTERPRISE	120
INTRODUCTION	120
STATISTICAL SOURCES	121
THE EMPLOYMENT EXPERIENCES OF SPECIFIC GROUPS	124
RACE EQUALITY POLICIES AND PRACTICE IN EMPLOYMENT	127
MINORITY ETHNIC BUSINESSES/ENTERPRISES	127
OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH	130
RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	131
REFERENCES	133
CHAPTER EIGHT RACE AND POVERTY	136
INTRODUCTION	136
STATISTICAL SOURCES	136
EXPERIENCE OF POVERTY AMONGST MINORITY ETHNIC GROUPS IN SCOTLAND	138
MULTIPLE DISCRIMINATION AND POVERTY	138
OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH	140
RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	141
REFERENCES	142
CHAPTER NINE RACE AND RURAL SCOTLAND	143
INTRODUCTION	143
STATISTICAL SOURCES	144
DEBATES ON THE 'RURAL' AND THE INVISIBILITY OF MINORITY ETHNIC GROUPS	144
SOCIO-DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE	145
KEY ISSUES WHICH AFFECT THE LIVES OF MINORITY ETHNIC GROUPS IN RURAL AREAS	146
OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH	149
RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	150
REFERENCES	152

CHAPTER TEN SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	154
INTRODUCTION	154
PATTERNS OF RESEARCH	154
CROSS CUTTING THEMES	155
GAPS IN RESEARCH	164
PROPOSED TOPICS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	166
METHODOLOGICAL ISSUES	170
RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE PROPOSED LARGE-SCALE SURVEY	171
REFERENCES	172
 APPENDIX 1: QUESTIONNAIRE CIRCULATED TO AGENCIES	 173
 APPENDIX 2: TOPICS FOR THE PROPOSED LARGE-SCALE SURVEY	 181

CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION

1.1 This chapter sets out the context within which the audit of research on minority ethnic people has been commissioned. It describes the main objectives, focus and scope, and the theoretical stance that has been adopted in conducting the audit. The chapter also provides a brief description of the minority ethnic population in Scotland, considers some methodological issues and describes the structure and terminology used.

CONTEXT

1.2 Several developments have raised the prominence of issues relating to the social exclusion of minority ethnic groups in Scotland over recent years. These have included a consultation exercise on the draft Social Inclusion Strategy published in March 1998; the work of the Government's Social Exclusion Network (SEN) and the Scottish Social Inclusion Network (SSIN); the awarding of Social Inclusion Partnership (SIP) funding to the minority ethnic initiatives in Glasgow and Fife; and the establishment of the Race Equality Advisory Forum (REAF). These latter initiatives coincided with an announcement by the Scottish Executive, on the 25th February 1999, of the need for a Scottish response to the recommendations of the Macpherson (1999) report on the inquiry into the murder of Stephen Lawrence.

1.3 These developments have highlighted the need for up-to-date, comprehensive information concerning the circumstances of Scotland's minority ethnic groups. The two key existing sources of quantitative data remain the 1991 Census and the Scottish Office (1991) Survey. While both continue to be used, their relevance has diminished over the last decade. Further quantitative data will be available from the 2001 Census and the Scottish Household Survey, although the usefulness of the latter is limited by the small sample of minority ethnic people included.

1.4 In order to meet the need for reliable current information on Scotland's minority ethnic people, the Scottish Executive is developing a new programme of research to address information gaps in this area. The preparatory scoping work for this began with a workshop on 2nd March 2000, which was attended by participants from a wide range of minority ethnic voluntary organisations, mainstream voluntary organisations and statutory organisations, and the Scottish Executive. A report of the workshop was subsequently published (Scottish Executive, 2000). One of the key themes that emerged from the workshop was the need for a stock-take of existing research literature, in order to identify issues that would steer and inform the proposed programme of research. The need for this work had also been communicated to the Scottish Executive prior to the workshop by a number of interested organisations.

COMMISSIONING THE AUDIT

1.5 Following from this, the Scottish Executive commissioned a consortium of organisations and individuals, led by the Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit (SEMRU) to conduct an audit of research related to minority ethnic people in order to inform the planning of the large-scale survey and the smaller qualitative studies. The aims of the audit are:

- To identify research literature (published and unpublished) of relevance to setting a context and steer for the proposed new research programme related to minority ethnic people in Scotland
- To review the research material identified and document this in a structured, systematic and concise manner
- To identify and discuss key themes issuing from the literature
- To identify and discuss significant gaps in the literature
- Based on the literature reviewed, to make recommendations for future research on ethnic minorities, highlighting topics of relevance to the proposed new survey and associated qualitative studies
- To construct an electronically held database of relevant research material, capable of being updated and extended as required

SCOPE AND FOCUS OF THE AUDIT

The main purpose of the audit and the focus on Scotland

1.6 The main purpose of our study is to document research relating to minority ethnic people, which has been conducted in Scotland from 1990 onwards. Research which includes data collected in Scotland and which covers other parts of the UK is also considered. We are aware that considerable research has been undertaken in other parts of the UK, which may have some relevance to the Scottish context. However, there are many factors which make the consideration of research which has been conducted within Scotland particularly valuable and timely.

1.7 One of the main factors is the devolution of responsibility to the Scottish Parliament for key policy areas, including housing, education, health and social care, transport and local government. The Parliament has declared its commitment to social justice, social inclusion and equal opportunities to be at the core of its policies. More specifically, it has also made a commitment to follow up the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry report (Macpherson, 1999) through scrutiny of all public services for institutional racism. The Scotland Act 1998 enables the Scottish Parliament to encourage equality of opportunities and the observance of equal opportunity requirements. There are fresh opportunities to tackle racial disadvantage, discrimination and harassment in these areas, and evidence-based policy making is most directly and immediately informed by Scottish-based research, although much can undoubtedly be learnt from research conducted in England, Wales and Northern Ireland.

1.8 Other factors add to the value of a Scotland-based focus on research related to minority ethnic issues. These relate to differences in the minority ethnic population in England, where most of the research has been carried out; the minority ethnic population in Scotland is proportionately smaller than in England, and its ethnic composition and patterns of settlement dissimilar. Further, there are important differences in the legal system and in key administrative

structures. It has also been argued that it is not possible to draw conclusions about Scottish political processes on the basis of events in England with respect to issues related to ‘race’ given differences in structural features and historical context (Miles and Muirhead, 1986; Miles and Dunlop, 1987). Miles and Muirhead (1986) observed that one of the main differences between England and Scotland in this regard was that in the latter, racism was not acknowledged as a political problem. Since then, the Commission for Racial Equality has observed a shift in attitude towards Ministerial acknowledgement of the need to tackle institutional racism (CRE, 1999). A systematic evaluation of the extent to which research related to minority ethnic groups and conducted in other parts of the UK can be generalised to the Scottish context, has yet to be undertaken.

The focus on ‘visible minorities’

1.9 The main focus of our research will be the ‘visible minorities’, that is, those born in the Asian and African continents and their descendants. Our focus on the ‘visible minorities’ is informed by the observation that those who are most easily and immediately distinguished as ‘different’ by physical traits such as skin colour, facial appearance or hair type are likely to be particularly susceptible and vulnerable to racial discrimination and disadvantage. However, we acknowledge that other minority ethnic groups such as Jewish, Irish and Polish people also experience racial discrimination and disadvantage, and where research related to these groups has been identified, this has been included. Research on refugees and asylum-seekers and Gypsy Travellers has also been included. Due to the limited resources available to us, we have necessarily restricted our coverage to research which is primarily concerned with minority ethnic groups as opposed to studies in which ‘ethnicity’ is included along with a number of variables. However, comparative studies of minority ethnic groups and the majority population have been included, and indeed, have been given particular consideration.

Definition of research adopted

1.10 It is not the intention of this audit to critique the theoretical basis of the research undertaken or the rigour of the methodologies employed by researchers. Instead, since our main concern is to maximise the information available about minority ethnic communities in Scotland, we have adopted a broad definition of ‘research’, taking particular care to include the work of voluntary sector community organisations. This encompasses studies identifying ‘needs’ in local areas, evaluations of policies and projects, studies written on the basis of work experience by practitioners, as well as what might be considered to be ‘academic’ research. This has resulted in an extremely rich and diverse range of perspectives, including sociological studies, action- and policy-oriented research, and epidemiological studies.

The focus on research and the use of statistical data

1.11 While this audit is primarily focused on research, it also considers the availability of ethnically disaggregated statistical data. This has enabled us to consider the extent to which statistical information related to ethnicity is currently and readily available, and the extent to which quantitative or qualitative research is needed to fill in existing gaps. One of our main sources of information relating to the availability of statistical data is a publication produced by the Scottish Executive (2000) entitled *Equality in Scotland: Guide to Data Sources*.

Database of research

1.12 References cited in this audit have been entered into an electronic database which is capable of being updated and extended. This will allow a database of research in this area to continue to be maintained on a planned and regular basis in the future. The database is intended to make the studies identified through this audit readily accessible to interested individuals where this is possible.

ETHNICITY, RACE, RACISM AND INSTITUTIONAL RACISM

1.13 In undertaking this audit, we feel that it is important to acknowledge that all the four terms above remain contested and problematic in the way they are conceptualised and used in public discourses, including research. For example, many commentators have argued that the term 'ethnicity' has become a euphemism for 'race' and weakens the struggle against racism (Miles, 1982; Sivanandan, 1982). Indeed, commentators on studies in health have noted that the terms 'race' and 'ethnicity' are 'increasingly being used synonymously' (Bhopal, 1998: 316). The current discourse on 'institutional racism' following the publication of the Macpherson report (1999) has again highlighted the importance of recognising the distinctive ways in which each of these competing terms is conceptualised and deployed in research and policy.

1.14 In spite of the contested nature of both ethnicity and 'race', few would now deny that the latter is a social and not a biological definition (Bhopal, 1998; Bradby, 1996; MacEwen et al, 1994). It continues to be a global term, particularly in the context of current social justice discourses on 'gender', 'class', disability and sexual orientation, and is used as a focus for resistance against racism. As MacEwen et al have noted:

“the fact that discrimination is frequently based on physical traits such as skin colour, facial appearance or hair type, justifies the categorisation of ‘race’ as well as ‘black’ as of enduring social and political significance.” (MacEwen et al, 1994: 4).

A definition of racism, which we will draw on, is:

“a belief that some races are superior to others, used to devise and justify actions that create inequality between racial groups.” (Bhopal, 1998: 1970).

1.15 The Race Relations Act 1976 and its principal amendment, the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, continue to make it unlawful to discriminate on 'racial grounds' defined as "colour, race, nationality or national and ethnic origins". The Act refers to both direct and indirect racial discrimination. This has now been extended in the Amendment to include 'institutional discrimination' defined in the Macpherson report as:

“The collective failure of an organisation to provide an appropriate and professional service to people because of their colour, culture and ethnic origin. It can be seen or detected in processes, attitudes and behaviour which amount to discrimination through unwitting prejudice, ignorance, thoughtlessness, racist stereotyping which disadvantages minority ethnic people.” (Macpherson, 1999, 6.34)

1.16 In this audit we have adopted the use of the construct 'race' in a broad political sense. This makes explicit the social inequalities which impact on minority ethnic communities as a consequence of all forms of racism in relation to a broad spectrum of areas, including housing, education, social care, health, employment and enterprise, poverty, rural issues and access to justice. In so doing, we recognise the diversity between and within the range of minority ethnic communities who have different traditions, aspirations and lifestyles, but who are likely to share the experience of discrimination and disadvantage in Scotland.

THEORETICAL APPROACHES IN STUDIES ON MINORITY ETHNIC GROUPS

1.17 Studies concerning the experiences of minority ethnic groups have largely been founded on two main approaches, the multi-cultural and anti-racist perspectives. The former is largely concerned with acknowledging and responding to diversities in language, religion, cultural norms and expectations, which can prevent effective communication and create misunderstanding between the majority and minority ethnic communities. In contrast, the second perspective takes the view that an appreciation and sensitivity to these differences is not sufficient to understanding the position of minority ethnic communities. According to this view, the current political, social, and economic position of racialised minorities cannot be divorced from historical legacies of colonialism and post-colonial relationships (Dominelli, 1989). Following from this, anti-racist approaches have highlighted structural disadvantages and the experiences of racism faced by minority ethnic communities (Atkins and Rollings, 1993). Such approaches have tended to minimise the influence of cultural differences.

1.18 There is however, a third approach that has also been taken and it is this theoretical stance which has been adopted in conducting the audit. This position acknowledges the value of the anti-racist approach in acknowledging structural disadvantages in the position of minority ethnic groups, but recognises that those who are subjected to this experience, draw on their cultural and religious resources in their forms of resistance to racism (Ahmad and Atkin, 1997). In our view, such an approach is alert to the importance of recognising differences in language, culture and religion, which may give rise to misunderstanding or dissatisfaction with service delivery. It also takes cognisance of wider exclusionary forces, which hinder equal access to and use of services and employment opportunities.

THE MINORITY ETHNIC POPULATION IN SCOTLAND

1.19 The main statistical sources about the minority ethnic population in Scotland are the 1991 Census and the 1991 Scottish Office Survey. Dalton and Hampton's (1994) analysis of the Census data identifies the three main groupings - the Pakistanis, Chinese and Indians, as well as the Black community and the category labelled as 'Other' while Bailey et al's (1997) analysis of the same data focuses on the three main groupings. Dalton and Hampton take care to point out the diversity within the three main groups as well as the other smaller groupings while Bailey et al describe the differences in ethnic composition across the twelve local authorities with the largest proportions of minority ethnic persons. Analysis of spatial distribution in the 1991 Census reveals a largely urban population concentrated in Scotland's 4 main cities, with 1 in 3 of all ethnic minorities living in Glasgow. The lowest percentages of ethnic minorities are found in the Borders, Shetlands, Western Isles and Orkney (Dalton and Hampton, 1994). Significantly, the Chinese population is represented in every Scottish local authority area (Bailey et al 1997).

Other Minority Ethnic Groups

1.20 The report of the ninth Advisory Committee on Scotland's Travelling People (Scottish Executive, 2000) sets out a number of recommendations, including the development of an information base through seasonal counts of Gypsy Travellers undertaken by local authorities and administered by the Scottish Executive. However, it is difficult to estimate the numbers of asylum-seekers and refugees who are currently in Scotland; this population is reported to be extremely diverse, including those from Afghanistan, Sri Lanka, Iraq, Iran, Bosnia and Kosovo, Sudan, Somalia, Russia, Estonia and Chile (Macaskill, and Petrie, 2000)

ISSUES OF IDENTITY

1.21 Few studies examining issues of either identity or involvement in the democratic process have been identified. A doctoral thesis explores the experiences and changes in identity of migrants from Hong Kong, arguing that 'multiple' and 'fluid' identities together reveal how minority ethnic individuals see themselves (Gaag, 2000). A forthcoming project will also consider issues of identity among young Chinese people in Glasgow (Chau, forthcoming). Minority ethnic people's own perception of their identity and the factors which influence individuals' sense of belonging were also considered in a project by the Centre for Human Ecology, reported in a publication called 'Who's a real Scot?' (Centre for Human Ecology, 2000). Initiated soon after the May 1999 elections confirmed that no black and ethnic minority groups would be represented in the parliament, the project aimed to facilitate greater participation in the Scottish democratic process, and to provide a platform for debate on both multiculturalism and action against racism. The study recommended 10 Action Points for MSPs.

METHODOLOGY

1.22 The methodology employed for the audit drew on desk-based searches of published and unpublished literature together with an extensive postal survey to a wide range of organisations. The audit was also publicised, with the aid of a press statement, through a variety of organisational newsletters and electronic networks.

Desk-based searches of literature

1.23 These consisted of reviews of material and electronic databases from university libraries and other public libraries, including the libraries of the Planning Exchange, the SEMRU Unit in Glasgow, Age Concern and Edinburgh College of Art/Heriot Watt University.

Postal Questionnaire

1.24 A postal questionnaire was designed for the purpose of eliciting information on past, current and ongoing research from a wide range of organisations and individuals. A cover letter explained the purpose of the audit and its main objectives, and requested that respondents return the questionnaire even if they had a nil response. Respondents were also asked to provide contact details of others that had conducted relevant research (Appendix 1).

1.25 The postal questionnaire was extensively circulated by the Edinburgh Unit of SEMRU and the Centre for Racial Equality for Education in Scotland (CERES). The rationale underpinning this wide trawl was two-fold: to publicise the purpose and scope of the audit to a wide range of organisations and to obtain information relevant to the scope of the audit.

1.26 CERES had undertaken surveys of research related to race and education in 1995, 1996 and 1999 and had already identified key contacts for education in community-based organisations, local authorities, universities, various public bodies, funding councils for research, political parties and other key organisations. In addition, a list of participants who had been invited for the consultative discussions of the Race Equality Advisory Forum (REAF) meetings and the 2nd of March Workshop was made available to us by the Scottish Executive. This was supplemented by a directory of contacts compiled by PAiH (Positive Action in Housing) and a list of community-based organisations from all 6 Scottish Race Equality Councils.

1.27 The identification of key contacts for other areas was more painstaking: contacts in all 32 local authorities were identified through telephone calls. About 50 national mainstream voluntary organisations with relevant remits were selected from a directory produced by the Scottish Council of Voluntary Organisations. The websites of 13 Universities in Scotland were searched to identify heads of relevant departments (including Social Policy, Law, Business Schools, Social Sciences and Public Health) and research units. Heads of departments were requested to pass on the questionnaire to members of staff who had an interest in their area. Contacts for all branches of Scottish Enterprise were identified through their website. Contact was also made with the Health Education Board for Scotland (HEBS) which undertook to electronically circulate the questionnaire and covering letter to a network of representatives from NHS Trusts and Health Boards who had a research-related remit in their organisations. In total, more than 600 postal questionnaires were sent out by SEMRU and 400 by CERES.

1.28 After two weeks, follow up calls were made to selected organisations, including all local authorities who had not responded, heads of departments in universities and organisations with a lead responsibility in the areas covered by the audit. The rate of response was typically poor for a postal questionnaire: about 50 positive responses were returned, and 50 other responses were returned from organisations which had not conducted relevant research, with several stating an interest in the area and the outcome of the audit. This might be explained by several factors, including the low priority accorded to completing the questionnaire due to other competing organisational pressures, the typically busy pre-Christmas period when the questionnaire was circulated and some uncertainty as to what was considered research. 4 weeks after the questionnaire had been sent out, and in an effort to increase the returns, organisations and individuals known to have either commissioned or conducted research, were requested to simply send us relevant research reports or summaries. This resulted in several additional reports being included in the audit.

Limitations of the Methodology Employed

1.29 The two main limitations of the study were the tight time-scale and limited resources. Those organisations and academics that had commissioned or undertaken a considerable amount of research in the field found the short time-scale particularly problematic.

Consequently, two months after the original deadline we were still continuing to receive responses and, as the deadline for completion approached, it became increasingly difficult to incorporate all the new material being received, as a result of an increased awareness of the study through informal networks. Despite these difficulties, we have sought to include all relevant material available to us at the time of writing but it is nevertheless possible that the impact of the short time-scale will have given rise to some unevenness of coverage in parts.

1.30 A further limitation of the audit resulted from the variable quality of the responses received. Some questionnaires were returned without supportive material, or had incomplete accompanying details. Finally, the scope of the audit, which was limited to research conducted from 1990 onwards, has meant that we have not been able to include earlier studies whose findings have continuing relevance.

STRUCTURE OF THE AUDIT

1.31 Following this introductory chapter, we present the findings of the audit under the following headings: housing, education, social care, health, access to justice, employment and enterprise, poverty and rural issues. At the end of each chapter, an overview is presented which includes a summary of the scope, methodologies, main themes and gaps in research. This forms the basis for recommendations for topics or areas for future research. Chapter 10 draws together the findings of the audit, describing patterns of research, cross-cutting themes and the main gaps in research identified. Some recommendations for the proposed programme of research are then provided.

TERMINOLOGY

1.32 Given the above discussion on the various theoretical approaches in this area, it is not surprising to find inconsistencies in the use of terminology in the numerous research reports that we have read in the course of conducting this audit. A variety of terms have been used to describe members of minority ethnic communities; for example, 'black', 'black and minority ethnic groups', 'ethnic minorities' and 'minority ethnic groups'. In recognition of the theoretical and political significance of the choice of terminology, we have retained the terminology that has been employed in these reports. Where we have drawn together themes and strands arising from a number of reports, we have used the term 'minority ethnic', recognising that other terms may be equally valid.

1.33 Except where it is stated otherwise, the term minority ethnic refers to the 'visible' minority ethnic communities in Scotland, as described above. 'South Asian' has been used to collectively describe those people who were born in Bangladesh, India or Pakistan and their descendants. Similarly, the term 'African-Caribbean' has been used to describe those of African origin who were born in one of the Caribbean islands and their descendants born in the UK. Both terms are used in the awareness that the peoples to whom they are applied may themselves neither identify their ethnicity as such nor share a common culture.

REFERENCES

- Ahmad, W.I.U and Atkin, K (1997) *'Race' and Community Care*. Buckingham: Open University Press
- Atkins, K. and Rollings, J (1993) *Community care in a multi-racial Britain: a critical review of the Literature* London: HMSO
- Bailey, N, Bowes, A M and Sim, D F (1997) 'The demography of minority ethnic groups in Scotland' In Bowes, A M and Sim, D F (eds.) *Perspectives on Welfare*. Aldershot: Ashgate
- Bhopal R (1998) 'Spectre of racism in health and health care: lessons from history and the United States' *British Medical Journal*: Vol. 316: pp 1970 -1973
- Bradby, H (1996) 'Genetics and Racism' In Marteau and Richards, M (eds.) *The troubled helix: social and psychological implications of the new human genetics* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Centre for Human Ecology (2000) *Who's a Real Scot? Report of the Embracing Multicultural Scotland Project* Edinburgh: CHE
- Chau, L (forthcoming) *Promoting Social Inclusion for young Chinese people in Glasgow* Glasgow: Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centre/Glasgow Anti Racist Alliance
- Commission for Racial Equality (1999) *Race equality matters: an agenda for the Scottish Parliament*. Edinburgh: Commission for Racial Equality
- Dalton, M. and Hampton, K. (1994) *Scotland's ethnic minority community 1991 A Census Summary* Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit Fact Sheet Number 1, Glasgow Caledonian University
- Dominelli, I (1989) 'A caring profession? An examination of racism in social work' *New Community* Volume 15, Number 3: pp 391-403
- Gaag, S (2000) *Transnational experiences of identity: a biographical approach to the study of migration from Hong Kong*. Geography Department, University of Dundee
- Macaskill, S. and Petrie, M. (2000) *I didn't come here for fun—listening to the views of children and young people who are refugees or Asylum-seekers in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Save the Children
- MacEwen, M, Dalton, M and Murie (1994) *Race and Housing in Scotland: A Literature Review and Bibliography* Research Paper No 58, Edinburgh College of Art/Heriot Watt University
- Macpherson, Sir W (1999) *The Stephen Lawrence Enquiry*, London: HMSO
- Miles, R (1982) *Racism and Migrant Labour* London: Routledge and Kegan Paul

Miles R and Dunlop, A (1987) 'Racism in Britain: the Scottish Dimension' in P. Jackson (ed) *Race and Racism*, London: Allen Unwin

Miles R and Muirhead, L (1986) 'Racism in Scotland: A Matter for Further Investigation?' In D. McCrone, (ed.) Edinburgh: *Scottish Government Yearbook*

Scottish Executive (2000) *Researching Ethnic Minorities in Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Scottish Office (1991) *Ethnic Minorities in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Office

Sivanandan A (1982) *A Different Hunger: Writings on black resistance* London: Pluto Press

CHAPTER TWO RACE AND HOUSING

INTRODUCTION

2.1 Following on from the Green Paper *Investing in Modernisation - An Agenda for Scotland's Housing* (Scottish Executive, 1999) and the consultation document, *Better Homes for Scotland's Communities* (Scottish Executive, 2000a), the introduction of the Housing (Scotland) Act 2001 provides a legislative framework for addressing housing needs in the context of developing community ownership of social housing. Its vision is to provide

“better rights for tenants, which focuses resources where they are most needed and which ensures as far as possible a level playing field in housing.”
(Scottish Executive, 2000a:2)

2.2 The Act contains measures that are intended to:

- prevent and alleviate homelessness and alleviate the rights of homeless people
- enhance the rights of tenants in the social rented sector
- create a stronger regulatory system in the social rented sector
- replace Scottish Homes with a new executive agency directly under the control of Scottish Ministers
- give councils stronger powers and duties to tackle housing needs
- extend the scope of grants available to private owners for improving and repairing their houses

2.3 The Homelessness Task Force, established in August 1999, has been assigned the responsibility of reviewing the causes and nature of homelessness in Scotland, to examine current practice in homelessness and to make recommendations on how it can be prevented and tackled effectively.

2.4 The introduction of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 will place a positive, enforceable duty on local authorities and registered social landlords to promote racial equality. This legislative context provides us with a timely opportunity to consider the housing needs of minority ethnic people in Scotland, which research has shown to have experienced substantial racial discrimination and disadvantage.

2.5 Housing has been acknowledged by the White Paper *Caring for People* (Department of Health, 1989) as “a vital component of community care” and as “the key to independent living”. Close collaboration between housing, social care and health agencies is therefore vital to the effective implementation of community care policies.

2.6 This chapter will draw from a useful review of published and unpublished research titled 'Race and Housing in Scotland' (MacEwen et al, 1994) commissioned by Scottish Homes, as part of a larger research project which examined the housing experiences of minority ethnic groups across Scotland. The review drew on Scottish-based research, and made reference to research carried out in England. The generalised conclusion from this review is that minority ethnic people in Scotland have suffered very substantial restrictions on their housing choice as a consequence of direct and indirect discrimination.

2.7 We begin by considering the implications of some statistical data which are relevant to a consideration of the housing circumstances and needs of minority ethnic people. We then take a thematic approach in considering research related to the housing needs and preferences of minority ethnic people, the barriers to access in the social rented sector and their orientation towards owner-occupation. This is followed by considering research related to house condition, the private rented sector, homelessness, the needs of Gypsy Travellers and refugees and the impact of urban regeneration on housing. We then consider research related to multiple discrimination, mainstreaming and multi-agency working. Finally, we provide an overview of the research in this chapter categorised under scope, perspectives/methodologies and funding of the studies. Main themes, identified gaps, and some recommendations for future research are also provided.

STATISTICAL SOURCES

2.8 The statistical data, which are of primary relevance to a consideration of the housing needs and circumstances of minority ethnic people, include their spatial distribution, household size and household structure, and housing characteristics. Chapter 1 provides some information about the spatial distribution, household size and household structure of the minority ethnic population, based on analysis of the 1991 Census and the 1991 Scottish Office Survey. Broadly, the picture that is provided is of a thinly dispersed population, concentrated in the urban areas. The average size of minority ethnic households is larger than the white population, particularly among Pakistani households. The average size of the Chinese household is smaller than Indian and Pakistani households due to a combination of fewer children and the presence of a large number of single, non-pensioner households.

2.9 The 1991 Scottish Office Survey revealed significant differences in housing type and circumstances between ethnic minority households and white households, as well as differences between cities:

- ethnic minority households were more likely to live in flats, maisonettes and bedsits (64% compared to 56% of white households) and less likely to live in houses (36% and 44%, respectively). These differences were greater in the home ownership sector than in the council rented sector
- the differences between ethnic minority households who lived in flats, maisonettes and bedsits and white householders who lived in the same housing type was greatest in Aberdeen
- ethnic minority householders were also more likely to live in densely occupied households (22% lived in housing with more than 1.5 persons per room compared with 2% of white households)

- Pakistani households were most likely to live in densely occupied housing (29% lived in homes with more than 1.5 persons per room)
- ethnic minority groups living in Glasgow were more likely than those living elsewhere to live in densely occupied housing (Scottish Office, 1991)

2.10 In contrast to the 1991 Scottish Office Survey, analysis of the 1991 Census has found a higher proportion of minority ethnic population lacking or sharing facilities, and lacking self-contained accommodation, which is attributed to the high proportion of minority ethnic households in the private sector (Bailey et al, 1997). This analysis has also found that the Pakistani population is most likely to lack central heating.

2.11 In relation to tenure type, the 1991 Scottish Office Survey revealed significant differences between ethnic minority households and white households:

- ethnic minority households were much more likely than white ones to own their own homes (79% as opposed to 51%)
- they were less likely to rent from the local authority (12% compared to 35%)
- ethnic groups were under-represented in council housing, SSHA (Scottish Special Housing Association, now Scottish Homes) housing, in housing associations and in private rented sector-unfurnished housing

2.12 Analysis of the 1991 Census data concurs with the 1991 Survey in finding a greater propensity to buy rather than to rent among minority ethnic households. Analysis of Census data has also revealed differences in tenure type between minority ethnic groups:

- the Chinese tend to have lower rates of home ownership than Pakistanis and Indians
- a larger proportion of minority ethnic people rent privately, than the general population, with the Chinese being the most highly represented in privately rented property
- in the Black Caribbean group, the proportion of households which rent from social landlords is closer to the Scottish average than in other minority ethnic groups although absolute numbers are small (Bailey et al, 1997)

2.13 Analyses of tenure patterns in the four main cities has revealed significant differences across cities:

- Aberdeen has the lowest rates of owner-occupation among Indians, Chinese and Pakistanis and the highest levels of local authority renting
- a relatively higher proportion of Pakistanis are in council housing and Scottish Homes housing in Dundee compared to Glasgow and Edinburgh (Bailey et al, 1997)

2.14 Other statistical data which would be of relevance would be that obtained from Household Projections, Housing Trends (which provide information on elderly and disabled people by type of housing and sector) and the Scottish House Condition

Survey (Scottish Executive, 2000b). Data on the first two are not ethnically disaggregated but the third is.

HOUSING NEEDS AND PREFERENCES OF MINORITY ETHNIC COMMUNITIES

2.15 The first national study in this area was an in-depth qualitative study commissioned by Scottish Homes (Wainwright et al, 1994) amongst households from a wide range of tenures, ages and ethnic origins throughout Scotland. Some studies have considered the housing needs of minority ethnic people in a particular location: ethnic minorities living in local areas such as Govanhill (Dalton and Hampton, 1996) and Leith (Wainwright et al, 1995), in Glasgow (Bowes, McCluskey and Sim, 1990a; Bowes et al, 1991; Glasgow City Council, 1993; Dowie, 1996) and in Fife (Naseem and Shek, 1997). Other studies have considered the needs of particular groups of minority ethnic people: Pakistanis in the social rented sector (Bowes, Dar and Sim, 1997a), older people (Carlin, 1997; PAiH, 1999a); those with special needs (Brailey, 1991) and minority ethnic commuters to Renfrew (Bowes et al, 1997b). Scottish Homes is planning to commission research on the housing needs of minority ethnic people in West Dunbartonshire, which will examine the nature of minority ethnic housing needs in the regions to support the revision of regional context statements.

2.16 The main themes that have emerged from the research conducted to date are:

- the need for greater sensitivity on the part of housing providers in relation to the housing needs of minority ethnic people
- lack of understanding among minority ethnic people of the procedures involved in obtaining accommodation, transfer and relocation in local authority housing
- lack of knowledge of the range of accommodation available in other parts of the social rented sector
- the need for a wide range of house type and size which takes into account the demand for larger accommodation, particularly for Pakistani households, as well possible changes in the family structure
- the importance of living in an area which is safe from racial harassment
- the importance of access to local amenities and shops catering for their needs and proximity to work
- increasing levels of demand for specialised forms of housing for older people in the future

2.17 Inability to have housing needs met (particularly in relation to the size of the dwelling) has sometimes resulted in an orientation towards owner-occupation (Littlewood and Kearns, 1998; Third et al, 1997). Conversely, Bowes et al (1997a) found that Pakistanis in their Glasgow-based sample were willing to move from their local authority housing into private rented accommodation for the same reason.

2.18 Safety from racial harassment is a major concern (Cullen, 1994) and was a key factor in determining choice of housing. Some studies have noted a perception among minority ethnic people that they are less likely to experience harassment in areas which are populated by

other members of their communities and where they are less 'visible' (Bowes et al. 1991; Bowes et al, 1997a, Positive Action in Housing 1999b).

2.19 Housing strategies employed by Pakistani people have also been the subject of research interest (Bowes et al 1997c and d; Bowes et al 1998a). Research into tenure preference and housing strategies of Pakistani people, which involved data collected from Glasgow, Bradford and Luton, has reinforced the importance of size and space requirements. It has also highlighted the need for appropriate provision for smaller households such as single parents and older people living on their own (Bowes et al, 1998a).

2.20 Conflicting findings have emerged on the quality of provision of housing-related information by voluntary sector agencies. A survey has been conducted by HomePoint, the housing and information unit of Scottish Homes, to investigate how current housing information and advice was provided and used in Scotland. This revealed low levels of training among staff in black and minority ethnic agencies in housing-related issues and racial harassment although both were common areas of enquiry (Positive Action in Housing, 2000a). Further, links between mainstream agencies and black and minority ethnic agencies were not well-established. However, an evaluation of the development support provided by Housing Association Charitable Trust (HACT) on housing issues to black and minority ethnic organisations was positive of the role played by such agencies in the communities they served to meet their housing needs (Patel, 1999). Related to the recruitment and employment of minority ethnic people in the field of housing management, Bowes et al (1998b) have conducted an evaluation of the Positive Action for Training in Housing (PATH) Scheme for Scottish Homes.

BARRIERS TO ACCESS TO THE SOCIAL RENTED SECTOR

2.21 Minority ethnic households are much less likely than white households to be renting in the public sector (local authorities, housing associations, Scottish Homes and New Towns) despite being statistically more likely to experience certain characteristics of 'housing need'. It is therefore not surprising that a major focus of research activity has been directed towards investigating the barriers which hinder minority ethnic people's access to good quality housing in relation to the policies and practice of housing associations (Sim, 1991; Dalton, 1991; Brailey, 1991; CRE, 1993; MacEwen et al, 1994; Dowie, 1996) and local authority housing (MacEwen, 1991a and b; Bowes et al, 1997a; Chakal, 2000; Third and MacEwen, 1998). A recently published audit of race equality policies and practice in Scottish local authorities and housing associations will undoubtedly provide much useful information (Bowes et al, 2001).

2.22 Previous research has established that there are several areas of institutional discrimination against minority ethnic applicants in the policy and practice of local authorities. These include allocation criteria such as waiting times and local connection points and discretionary allocation procedures as well as a failure to publicise the housing opportunities offered by local associations. The lack of appropriate-sized housing in the social rented sector has also been highlighted as a problem in housing associations (Dowie, 1996) as well as local authority housing (Bowes et al, 1997a; Littlewood and Kearns, 1998).

Housing associations

2.23 Other additional barriers that were highlighted were the lack of implementation of race equality policies (CRE, 1993; Dowie, 1996). An investigation undertaken by the CRE revealed that although some organisations carried out ethnic monitoring, this was restricted to only the number of applicants who had been let tenancies. Further, few associations had acted on the results of the monitoring process. Dowie's Glasgow-based study found that, although housing associations provide a large proportion of stock in the social rented sector and have the potential to meet the needs of the ethnic minority population, the movement was under-performing in proportion to population levels, housing needs and housing demand, as evidenced by waiting list applications.

2.24 Another study which has evaluated the performance of housing associations with respect to race equality has been an evaluation of Scottish Homes Race Equality Strategy (Scott, 1999). Encouragingly, this study found substantial increases in the proportion of housing associations undertaking some form of ethnic monitoring between 1993/94 to 1996/7. However, the study also found that amongst those which had undertaken some ethnic monitoring, there had been a fall in minority ethnic tenancies in percentage terms but a rise in absolute terms, which was attributed to stock transfer. Disappointingly, the same study found there had been decreases in the minority ethnic composition on housing association management committees, the significance of which is highlighted by Dowie (1996)'s finding that minority ethnic applications only approximated minority ethnic allocations where membership of the Housing Association committee included minority ethnic representation.

Local authority housing

2.25 MacEwen et al (1994) observed that with the progressive erosion of the fiscal and political autonomy of local government, the mandatory sale of council housing and cuts in new build, the potential for general access to public housing, and its arm in promoting racial equality, had diminished considerably. However, a more recent study (Third and MacEwen, 1998) points out that council housing still accounts for more than a third of all occupied dwellings in Scotland (in contrast to less than 20 per cent in England).

Supply of local authority housing

2.26 Policies affecting the supply of housing initially determine how effective current allocation policies can be in providing access to more desirable housing. MacEwen et al (1994) noted that low rates of new building by local authorities and new towns in Scotland had coincided with the effects of the sale of dwellings in determining the pattern of relets. Public sector landlords had few new dwellings to let and the profile of their stock and relets was affected by the differential rates of sale of different dwelling types. An increasing proportion of stock consisted of tenements and flats and the more popular house types and locations were likely to have been sold. Thus, as households from minority ethnic groups have gained eligibility and priority for council housing, the quantity and quality of the dwellings for which they qualify has declined.

Race equality policies and practice

2.27 MacEwen et al (1994) highlighted the extent of continuing disadvantage in access and allocation and the need for greater awareness of racism, the monitoring of housing allocations and the impact of management policy. The review cited studies which indicated that housing officials' notions of 'class', 'suitability' and 'deserving' proved to be key determinants of outcome, and were significantly and proportionately detrimental to black applicants.

2.28 Undertaken one year after local government reorganisation, the returns from Third and MacEwen's (1998) postal questionnaire from all 32 new local authorities, revealed that less than a third of Scottish local authorities conduct ethnic monitoring of applicants, and the proportion who monitored allocations and nominations was even lower. Further, nominations to Scottish Homes stock was also not monitored for ethnic group.

2.29 The study also found that most Scottish local authorities do not routinely provide front-line members of staff with training on equal opportunities, including racial discrimination. Third and MacEwen express particular concerns about the tendency of rural authorities to make assumptions about the needs and preferences of minority ethnic residents. They point out that making such assumptions can lead to their exclusion from the range of housing opportunities which they are entitled to and contribute to their marginalisation in the wider context.

2.30 Further, Third and MacEwen (1998) found that about half of Scottish local authorities do not monitor racial attacks and harassment at all. Those who did have monitoring structures in place reported that incidents were rarely reported to them. This contrasts with the high number of racial incidents reported to Scottish Race Equality Councils and evidence of racial harassment particularly (although not exclusively) in local authority housing (Bowes et al, 1990b; MacEwen et al, 1994; Lee et al, 1996; Black Community Development Project, 1998). Third and MacEwen conclude that Scottish local authorities are failing to meet their legislative duties under Section 71 of the Race Relations Act 1976 in respect of the promotion of 'equality of opportunity.'

Matching

2.31 MacEwen et al (1994) highlighted a shift from an examination of policies which do not exclude households from consideration for council housing, towards an analysis of what dwellings are offered to them, that is, the process of 'matching' minority ethnic people with dwellings. As the council housing stock has become more varied in age, design, condition and reputation, the issue of the type of council housing which is offered has become increasingly important. MacEwen et al suggest that the concentration of minority ethnic groups in particular areas and dwelling types in council housing was only in part a reflection of choice, and that various rules and procedures systematically disadvantaged minority ethnic households. Reference to the pressures placed on officers in managing the allocation process offers a perspective on the importance of policy implementation and practice rather than formal housing policies and expressions of preference, but this is an area which remains under-researched.

2.32 However, it is encouraging that a few local authorities (West Dunbartonshire, East Renfrewshire and Fife Councils) have either conducted or commissioned research which have included an assessment of housing needs. It is also encouraging that a few local authorities are planning to commission research related to the housing needs of minority ethnic people. These include an assessment of the housing and care needs of older Chinese people in Perth and Kinross, and the housing needs of black and minority ethnic communities in East Renfrewshire.

ORIENTATION TOWARDS OWNER OCCUPATION

2.33 A number of studies have noted owner-occupation as the preferred option (Bowes et al, 1991; Wainwright et al, 1994; Bowes et al, 1997a; Littlewood and Kearns, 1998; Naseem and Shek, 1997; Third et al, 1997). However, the same studies have also noted 'reluctant' homeowners who had been forced into this sector due to fear or experience of racial harassment, lack of affordable, suitably sized accommodation for large households or a strong preference for a particular area. Third et al found that as many as a quarter reported that they would have preferred an alternative option.

2.34 Other studies have noted that the under-representation of minority ethnic people in the local authority sector has led to a low take-up of Right to Buy. This group has therefore missed out on the opportunity to enhance capital gain through the purchase of heavily discounted council homes (Pieda, 1995; Third et al, 1997; Third and MacEwen 1998). They note that the effect of this is particularly striking in Scotland given that one third of owner-occupiers here became owner-occupiers through Right to Buy, supporting a more general view that black communities are excluded from investment in housing through a variety of means (Mullings, 1991).

Financing patterns for house purchase

2.35 The 1991 Scottish Office Survey revealed that financing patterns for house purchase between minority ethnic households and white households were different:

- ethnic minority households were more than twice as likely to use household savings to buy their house as a sample of white households (42% compared with 19%)
- they were less likely than the white sample to have 100 per cent mortgages and not to require a deposit (15% compared to 32%)
- both white and ethnic minority householders depended on building society mortgages or loans with whites being more likely than ethnic minority respondents to have these (77% and 69%, respectively)
- ethnic minority households were slightly more likely than white owners to own their property outright (36% and 31% respectively)
- they were more likely to have obtained loans from the local authority under the small loan schemes (6 per cent and under 0.5 per cent), with the Pakistani community using this source of finance substantially more than others (10% of Pakistanis with mortgages/loans)

2.36 MacEwen et al (1994) suggest that the last finding may be related to the capital value of property acquired by Pakistani households being lower than that of other households. More generally, they point out that patterns of financing are linked to the patterns of employment of the minority ethnic population, including the high rate of self-employment and the role of inter-familial transfers. More recent research has tended to support the financing patterns described above, with Littlewood and Kearns (1998) reporting that minority ethnic households were more likely to have bought their homes outright. However, other research has found that most Pakistani owners believe that it is appropriate to finance house purchase through mortgages, although a significant group prefer not to borrow and to finance the purchase through savings (Bowes et al, 1998a).

2.37 Differences in the nature of mortgage arrangements between white and ethnic minority respondents have also been found by Third et al (1997) who found that minority ethnic home owners were paying significantly higher mortgage repayments, although their incomes were lower and less secure. Not surprisingly, they also faced greater difficulties in meeting monthly payments and were more likely to have mortgage arrears. These findings support the observation by MacEwen et al (1994) that the role of the gatekeepers to owner occupied housing - solicitors, estate agents, building societies and banks amongst others - is critical, and leaves room for discriminatory decisions to be made. Qualitative research investigating the patterns of financing house purchase would usefully complement the statistical findings of the Scottish Office 1991 Survey. The openness of market institutions to minority ethnic groups is also worthy of further investigation.

HOUSE CONDITION AND SUPPORT FROM LOCAL AUTHORITIES

2.38 A number of studies have examined the house condition of minority ethnic people, particularly owner-occupiers, and their ability to improve its condition through support from local authority grants. Third et al (1997) have found that minority ethnic owner occupiers were more likely to have bought houses which were in need of major repair or improvement but much less likely to have carried out those repairs. This is supported by Littlewood and Kearns's (1998) study, which found that minority ethnic households in BTS housing were concentrated in owner-occupation. Further, they found that:

- minority ethnic householders were over-represented in BTS housing
- Pakistani households were most likely to live in households which lacked amenity while the other minority ethnic groups were more likely to live in housing which was in a state of severe disrepair
- Pakistani, Indian and Bangladeshi households were also more likely to live in BTS housing than other minority ethnic groups and the general population
- the same ethnic groups were also more likely to experience multiple housing problems, as well as to experience multiple social and economic problems.

Adding to this dismal picture, Bowes et al (1998a) found that some Pakistani households would be unlikely to sustain owner-occupation due to the poor condition of many of the properties.

2.39 The 1991 Scottish Office Survey found that similar proportions of white and ethnic minority respondents had carried out improvements or repairs with the help of local authority grants (22% and 23%, respectively). Pakistani respondents were more likely to have received improvement grants than Indian and Chinese ones (30%, 17% and 16%, respectively). However, this apparent equality in the allocation of grants between white and ethnic minority respondents is misleading, given that the rates of owner-occupation by ethnic minority respondents in all four cities is considerably higher (the difference between white and ethnic minority owner-occupiers is highest in Glasgow, Bearsden and Bishopbriggs at 44%, and is 12% in Edinburgh, 12% in Dundee and 15% in Aberdeen). Given these differences in owner-occupation, it might have been reasonable to expect that the allocation of grants to minority ethnic respondents was significantly higher than the allocation of grants to white respondents.

2.40 Similarly, the finding of the 1991 Scottish Survey that ethnic minority respondents living in Glasgow were more likely to have received grants than those living outside of this city may be a reflection of the much higher percentage of ethnic minority owner-occupiers in this city, as well as possible local variations in the implementation of policy. It is worth noting here that Bowes et al (1991) survey of 341 black ethnic minorities in Glasgow found that only 25.9% were aware of how people qualified for a grant or loan for repairs or improvements. This suggests that many had missed out on opportunities to improve and repair their properties. Further research into the allocation of grants or loans by local authorities to support homeowners would be useful.

PRIVATE RENTED ACCOMMODATION: AN UNDER-RESEARCHED SECTOR

2.41 The Scottish Office survey (1991) found that in relation to private rented accommodation:

- there were no significant differences between the percentage of minority ethnic people renting furnished and unfurnished accommodation
- however, in respect of ethnic groups, the Chinese community virtually exclusively rented furnished accommodation (6%)
- the majority of ethnic respondents who rented from an individual private landlord rented from an Asian person

More recent local studies in Fife (Naseem and Shek, 1997) and Govanhill (Dalton and Hampton, 1996) have also shown a substantial proportion of minority ethnic people in the private rented sector.

2.42 While evidence from the Scottish Household Survey of 1999 should be interpreted with caution because of the relatively small size of the ethnic minority sample (146 or 1/100th) of the total, this suggests that the extent of home ownership has changed significantly in the intervening years from the 1991 Census. It would appear that 50% of ethnic minorities are now homeowners (compared with 61% of the remaining population) while some 66% were homeowners in 1991 (compared with 53%). Recent figures on the rented sector also suggest that marked differences in tenure patterns exist with 24% of ethnic minorities renting in the private sector compared with 7 % of the majority community (SE 2000b). It is possible that this might indicate a shift in

housing choices in the minority ethnic population from home ownership into the private rented sector, but this merits further investigation.

HOMELESSNESS AND MINORITY ETHNIC PEOPLE: A HIDDEN PHENOMENON

2.43 Certain factors suggest that homelessness is a serious and possibly disguised issue, including the well-established finding of significantly higher rates of overcrowding among certain minority ethnic groups, statutory overcrowding being one definition of homelessness (MacEwen et al, 1994). It is likely that many homeless people from minority ethnic groups do not negotiate the four hurdles of priority need, intentionality, vulnerability and local connection (Webb et al, 1995).

2.44 Experiences of current or past homelessness among minority ethnic people are well-documented (Wainwright, 1994 et al; Dalton and Hampton, 1996). Littlewood and Kearns (1998) also noted a number of hidden households in their study of Below Tolerable Standard (BTS) housing. The finding from the 1991 Scottish Office Survey that there are more “horizontally-extended” minority ethnic households also suggests that hidden homelessness might be an under-recognised problem. The creation of a Homelessness and Racial Harassment Crisis Support Service by Positive Action in Housing in 1998 (Positive Action in Housing, 1999b) is a further indication of the growing scale of the problem. A dissertation which dealt specifically with the needs of homeless black young people highlights the dearth of information in this area and examines the role of the Saffron project, a Glasgow-based project which provides supported accommodation for this client group (McWilliams, 2001).

2.45 Issues relating to the law and homelessness are recurrent themes of concern. MacEwen (1990) concludes that the law and its interpretation is critical for ethnic minorities in the following areas:

- the definition of key terms which may access or close opportunities
- the quality and quantity of available stock
- the nature of temporary accommodation
- the recognition and recording of need in housing waiting lists, including dependents overseas
- issues relating to dependence on public funds
- the use of judicial review
- the attitudes of the courts

2.46 However, there is a lack of contemporary literature on the current interpretation and impact of the law and policy on minorities in Scotland. Shelter is in the process of commissioning a major project on homelessness in black and minority ethnic communities, but

the extent to which the situation in Scotland will be addressed is currently unclear. Clearly, needs and experiences of homelessness among minority ethnic people require to be more closely monitored.

HOUSING AND URBAN REGENERATION

2.47 Chakal (2000) has found that renewal policies often ignore the diverse needs of communities in local areas, including those of minority ethnic communities, due to the lack of information available. Bowes et al (1998a) raised concerns that in programmes of area regeneration, the then Scottish Office partnership areas had focused on peripheral council estates, along with Scottish Homes funding for housing associations. Since minority ethnic communities are predominantly located in inner city areas, this had had a disproportionate effect across all tenures. This highlights the need for urban regeneration programmes to be informed by research that profiles the current and projected population of minority ethnic people in the area and the extent of their housing need.

HOUSING NEEDS OF ASYLUM SEEKERS AND REFUGEES

2.48 MacEwen et al (1994) noted that the Immigration and Asylum Act 1993 had imposed very severe restrictions on immigrants seeking to achieve refugee status. This included restrictions to their access to housing: refugees were not to be considered homeless where they were living in temporary accommodation, in the same way that other housing applicants might be, almost irrespective of the extent to which such accommodation failed to meet their housing needs. The study also observed that the major institutions including the Scottish Office, COSLA and Scottish Housing Authorities (including Scottish Homes), had done too little to ameliorate the position of refugees throughout Scotland.

2.49 In addition to several studies, which have considered the experiences of refugees in Scotland, as considered in the Chapter on Race and Social Care, one study has focused on the difficulties experienced by refugees in relation to housing in Scotland, specifically, the barriers to housing association tenure (Dalton and recent provisions, the Immigration and Asylum Act 1999, imposed a new regime with important implications for housing providers. The provisions of the 1999 legislation have yet to be fully implemented and assessed. The role of the National Asylum Support System, as the agency negotiating arrangements with local authorities such as Glasgow and private contractors has been the subject of some criticism although rounded judgement must be awaited (Scottish Refugee Council, 2000; Bolt and Craig, 2000). It is possible that block tender arrangements may result in the provision of sub-standard accommodation and inadequate support for a vulnerable and often visibly identifiable minority.

MULTIPLE DISCRIMINATION

2.50 Evidence of multiple discrimination in housing provision is largely evidenced by the failure to acknowledge and accommodate 'special needs' among minority ethnic people. This includes the need for specially designed or adapted housing, for example, for those with physical disabilities, and for those who need care and support as a component of their housing (Brailey, 1991). MacEwen et al (1994) noted the lack of provision for minority ethnic people with special housing needs, including those escaping domestic violence, older people and

people with medical needs (sic). In particular, the study observed that older minority ethnic people had not benefited as much as their white counterparts from a growing volume of sheltered community housing produced in both the public and private sectors. The effects of this are compounded in the light of research more fully documented in the chapter on Race and Social care which has revealed that older minority ethnic people tend to receive low levels of formal support such as home helps, meals on wheels and other services.

2.51 The lack of knowledge of the scale and nature of special needs among ethnic minorities has been identified as one of the main factors which hinder the provision of appropriate housing for minority ethnic people (Brailey, 1991; Dowie, 1996). This largely remains the case: no research has been conducted on the housing needs of those escaping domestic violence, people with disabilities and other vulnerable groups, although two studies have investigated the housing needs of older people (Carlin, 1997; PaiH, 1999b). Further research in this area that takes into account population projections, settlement patterns, the housing needs of various special needs categories and the potential impact of community care policies would undoubtedly be useful.

MAINSTREAMING AND MULTI-AGENCY WORKING

2.52 While the importance of mainstreaming the needs of minority ethnic people into the planning and provision of housing is widely acknowledged, MacEwen et al have noted a “growing agitation” for black-led housing associations, which continue to be absent in Scotland in contrast to their growing presence in England (HEAU 1992). The failure of Scottish Homes to support the development of such associations has attracted stringent criticism in the external evaluation of the strategy in 1998 (Scott, 1999). The review concluded that the ambiguity in the current policy made it “exceedingly difficult” to implement. The revised policy (Scottish Homes, 2000) retains the previous emphasis on mainstream support, an approach continuing to attract criticism (REAF, 2000; Positive Action in Housing, 2000b).

2.53 Research documented in this chapter has amply revealed the need for multi-agency working between various housing providers. However, in the context of community care schemes, it is also worth noting the importance of research which considers the nature and extent of multi-agency work between planners and providers in housing, social work and health departments in relation to minority ethnic people.

OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH ACTIVITY

2.54 This section of the chapter will present the main themes, scope, perspectives and funding of the research. Gaps will also be identified.

Scope

2.55 Although many studies broadly consider the needs of minority ethnic groups, where they have examined the circumstances, needs and preferences of a single ethnic group, research has tended to focus on the Pakistani community. The housing circumstances of the

Chinese, those of African descent and other communities have not been the focus of research, even though there is evidence to suggest that there are significant differences in their housing needs and circumstances.

2.56 Geographically, there have been few national studies (Bailey et al, 1997; Wainwright et al, 1994; Third et al, 1997; Third and MacEwen, 1998). The region that has attracted the most research attention has been Strathclyde. Other cities have been much less well researched, although the evidence reveals that there are considerable variations in tenure across cities. Few studies have included rural areas in their scope.

Funding

2.57 Scottish Homes has been a lead funder of research in this area, having commissioned at least eight studies (MacEwen et al, 1994; Wainwright et al, 1994; Dowie, 1996; Bowes et al 1997; Wainwright et al 1997, Third et al, 1997; Littlewood and Kearns, 1998; Scott, 1999). A few local authorities have also undertaken or commissioned research in this area. Other funders of research have been universities and voluntary organisations.

Methodologies/Perspectives

2.58 Several studies could be categorised as needs assessment studies, involving interviews with minority ethnic people to examine their housing needs and circumstances. While the majority of these studies were small-scale qualitative studies, a few were large-scale, involving samples of more than 200 people (Bowes et al 1991; Third et al, 1997), with the largest involving 1200 minority ethnic and white households (Littlewood and Kearns, 1998).

2.59 A number involved surveys of housing providers (CRE, 1993; Dowie, 1996; Carlin, 1997; Third and MacEwen, 1998; Bowes et al, 1997; Positive Action in Housing 2000a). Two studies were evaluative studies for Scottish Homes (Bowes et al, 1998b; Scott, 1999) while another study informed the development funding strategy of its Glasgow District Office (Dowie, 1996).

RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Main Themes	Identified Gaps	Recommendations
<p>Considerable research activity has concentrated on examining the circumstances of minority ethnic people, and revealing the restricted housing choices available to them. Research reveals that generally these communities are more likely to live in over-crowded housing and in accommodation where amenities are absent or shared.</p>	<p>Little is known about the demand for special needs housing in minority ethnic communities, although a growing demand for specialised housing for older people has been noted.</p>	<p>Research on special needs housing for minority ethnic people including disabled people and those escaping domestic violence, is a priority. This might take the form of a feasibility study of the role that could be played in this provision by black- and minority ethnic-led housing associations.</p>
<p>The housing circumstances of Pakistani households have received the most research attention. These households were most likely to live in overcrowded housing and in homes that lacked central heating. Along with Indians and Bangladeshis, these households are also more likely to live in Below Tolerable Standard Housing.</p>	<p>Relatively little is known about the housing circumstances of the Chinese community although some interesting differences have emerged, such as their high representation in privately rented property and low rate of owner-occupation.</p>	<p>Research on the housing circumstances of Chinese people, including older people, would add to our understanding of the diversity of housing circumstances of minority ethnic people.</p>
<p>Issues in relation to minority ethnic housing needs include: the importance of safety from racial harassment, homelessness, demand for a wide range of accommodation type and size, lack of familiarity with the procedures involved in obtaining local authority housing, other social rented housing and a requirement for greater sensitivity to minority ethnic issues on the part of housing providers.</p>	<p>Despite the rising prominence of homelessness on the policy agenda and growing evidence of homelessness in minority ethnic communities, the extent, nature and experience of homelessness among minority ethnic people has not been investigated to date. Neither has the impact of law and policy on the extent and quality of provision been recently considered.</p>	<p>Research into the nature and extent of homelessness among minority ethnic communities is a priority. Such research could usefully consider routes into homelessness, hidden homelessness, the ethnic monitoring of homelessness by housing providers and the adequacy and appropriateness of existing provision for minority ethnic people.</p>
<p>A major focus of research has been that of access to different housing tenures and the role of a range of gatekeepers involved in negotiating access to housing.</p> <p>Research has found that minority ethnic groups are excessively affected by poor housing but are under-represented in the social rented sector. This may be as much a reflection of the barriers of access to public housing as the positive attraction of home ownership.</p>	<p>The implications of the Housing (Scotland) Act 2001, which provides a legislative context for addressing housing needs in the context of developing community ownership of social housing, have yet to be fully considered in relation to minority ethnic communities.</p> <p>The housing management process, particularly with regard to matching minority ethnic households to dwelling types, is under-researched.</p>	<p>A study of the implications of the Housing (Scotland) Act 2001 for minority ethnic communities is a priority. It is important to consider its likely impact on a group, which has been shown by research to be considerably disadvantaged.</p> <p>Research on the role and experience of housing officers with regard to management of the housing allocation process for minority ethnic households would offer a useful perspective.</p>

<p>Research has revealed that the under-representation of minority ethnic people in the local authority sector has meant that few minority ethnic households have had the opportunity to invest in housing through Right to Buy.</p> <p>Limited statistical data from the Scottish Household Survey seems to indicate a growth in minority ethnic households in the private rented sector and declining owner-occupation; the converse has been found for the majority population.</p>	<p>There is a lack of data on (changes in) the tenure patterns of ethnic minority households and therefore the impact of tenure change on the circumstances of minority ethnic households remains poorly understood.</p>	<p>Comparative research on changes in tenure patterns over the last ten years would reveal the changing housing circumstances of minority and majority communities.</p> <p>A qualitative investigation of the routes of minority ethnic households into, within, and out of the private rented sector would also provide a valuable perspective.</p>
<p>There is substantial evidence to suggest that there are differences in house purchase financing patterns between the majority and minority ethnic communities. Minority ethnic households are more likely to buy their house outright and less likely to have 100% mortgages. There is also evidence that minority ethnic households pay significantly higher mortgage repayments although their incomes may be lower and less secure.</p>	<p>There is little research that examines the views and experiences of minority ethnic communities with respect to financing patterns for house purchase.</p> <p>The role of gate-keepers to home ownership, such as banks and building societies is critical and leaves room for discriminatory decisions to be made; however this area remains under-researched.</p>	<p>Research into financing patterns for house purchase among minority ethnic communities would play a valuable role in revealing the choices and constraints faced by these communities. This could usefully take the form of a two-part study to investigate a) the views and experiences of minority ethnic households and b) the policies and practices of financial institutions.</p>

REFERENCES

- Bailey, N, Bowes, A M and Sim, D F (1997). The demography of minority ethnic groups in Scotland. In Bowes, A and Sim, D (eds.) *Perspectives on Welfare*. Aldershot: Ashgate
- Black Community Development Project (1998) *Second needs survey report*. Edinburgh: BCDP
- Bolt, K and Craig, S (2000) 'Unworthy Treatment of Asylum Seekers', *SCOLAG Journal*, Issue No 270, pp 5-7
- Bowes, A M, McCluskey, J and Sim, D F (1990a), 'Ethnic Minorities in Council Housing in Glasgow' *New Community* Vol. 16, No. 4, pp 523 -532
- Bowes, A M, Dar N S and Sim D F (1990b) 'Racism and Harassment of Asians in Glasgow'. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* Vol.13 No.1 pp 71-79.
- Bowes, A M, McCluskey J and Sim, D F (1991) 'Ethnic minorities and housing in Glasgow' In Bowes, A M and Sim, D F (eds) *Demands and Constraints: Ethnic Minorities and Social Services in Scotland*, Edinburgh: Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations
- Bowes, A M. Dar, N S and Sim D F (1997a) 'Pakistanis and social rented housing: a study in Glasgow' in Bowes, A M and Sim, D F (eds.) *Perspectives on Welfare* Aldershot: Ashgate
- Bowes, A M, Neale, J and Sim, D F (1997b) '*The housing preferences and needs of minority ethnic commuters to Renfrew*' Edinburgh: Scottish Homes
- Bowes, A M, Dar, N S and Sim, D F (1997c) 'Tenure Preference in Housing Strategies: An Exploration of Pakistani Experiences' *Housing Studies* Vol.12, No 1, pp 63-84.
- Bowes, A M, Dar, N S and Sim, D F(1997d) 'Life Histories in Housing Research: The Case of Pakistanis in Glasgow' *Quality and Quantity* Vol. 31 No. 2, pp 109-125.
- Bowes, A M, Dar, N S and Sim, D F (1998a) '*Too white, too rough and too many problems...*': A study of Pakistani housing in Britain. Stirling: University of Stirling/Joseph Rowntree Foundation
- Bowes, A M, Dar, N S and Sim, D F (1998b) *Evaluation of Positive Action for Training in Housing (PATH) Scheme*, Edinburgh: Scottish Homes
- Bowes, A M Sim, D F and Wilson M (2001) *Race Equality Policy and Practice in Scottish Housing* Stirling: University of Stirling/PATH (Scotland)
- Brailey, M (1991) 'Ethnic Minorities and Special Needs Housing Provision' in Bowes, A M and Sim D F (eds.) *Demands and Constraints: Ethnic Minorities and Social Services in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations
- Carlin, H (1997) 'The housing needs of older people from minority ethnic groups' in Bowes, A M and Sim D F (eds.) *Perspectives on Welfare* Aldershot: Ashgate

Chahal, K., (2000) 'Ethnic Diversity, Neighbourhoods and Housing', *Joseph Rowntree Foundations No 110*, York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation

Commission for Racial Equality (1993) *Housing Associations and Racial Equality, Report of a Formal Investigation into Housing Associations in Wales, Scotland and England*, London: CRE

Cullen, J (1994) 'The Race to Raise Awareness in Dundee' *Inside Housing*, Vol 11, No 26 pp 10-11

Dalton, M (1991) 'Housing association access: achieving racial equality' in Bowes, A M and Sim, D F (eds) *Demands and Constraints: Ethnic Minorities and Social Services in Scotland*, Edinburgh: Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations

Dalton, M and Daghlian, S (1994) *Barriers to Access: Black Applicants and Housing Association Tenure*, Research Paper No 9. Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

Dalton, M and Hampton, K (1996) *Housing Needs of Ethnic Minorities in Govanhill: A Community Perspective*, SEMRU Research Paper No 3, Series Two. Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

Department of Health (1989) *Caring for People: Community Care in the next decade and beyond* HMSO: London

Dowie, D (1996) *Ethnic Minority Housing in Glasgow: Scottish Homes Glasgow District Office Development Fund Strategy* Glasgow: Scottish Homes

Glasgow City Council (1993) *Ethnic Minority Residents' View of Council Services*. Glasgow: Glasgow City Council

Housing Equality Action Unit (1992) 'The Way Forward' National Conference. Edinburgh

Lee, C, Nasra N and Egan A (1996), *Whose Community? The needs of Black and Minority Ethnic People in Wester Hailes*. Edinburgh: Wester Hailes Anti-Racism Project

Littlewood, A and Kearns, A (1998) *Below Tolerable Standard Housing and Ethnicity in Glasgow*. A Scottish Homes Working Paper. Edinburgh: Scottish Homes

MacEwen, M (1990c) 'Homelessness, Race and Law' *New Community* Vol 16 No. 4 pp: 55-521.

MacEwen, M (1991a) "*Housing, Race and Law: the British Experience*", London, Routledge,

MacEwen, M (1991b). Housing allocations and the law: ethnic minorities in Edinburgh in Bowes, A M and Sim, D F (eds) *Demands and Constraints. Ethnic Minorities and Social Services in Scotland*, Edinburgh: Scottish Council of Voluntary Organisations

MacEwen, M, Dalton, M and Murie, A (1994) *Race and Housing in Scotland: A Literature Review and Bibliography*, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit/School of Planning & Housing, Edinburgh College of Art/Heriot-Watt University

McWilliams, J, 2001 *The problems experienced by black/minority ethnic homeless young people: an examination of existing service provision*. MA dissertation, School of Planning and Housing, Edinburgh College of Art/Heriot Watt University

Mullings, B (1991) *The Colour of Money: the impact of housing investment decision-making on black housing outcomes in London*, London: London Race and Housing Research Unit.

Naseem, S and Shek, E (1997) *Right Key to Access: A Research Paper on Housing Issues for Minority Ethnic Communities in Fife*, Minority Ethnic Housing Rights Project.

Patel, Vijay K P(1999), *Bridging the Chasm; an evaluation of HACT's project to provide development support on Housing issues to Black and minority organisations in Scotland*. RSVP Associates, Dundee

Pieda (1995) *Second Study of Consumer Preferences in Housing*, Edinburgh: Scottish Homes

Positive Action in Housing (1999a) *Homelessness and Racial Harassment Crisis Support Service*. Glasgow: PAiH

Positive Action in Housing (1999b) *Promoting Choice and Opportunities in Housing for Older People from Black and Ethnic Minority Communities*, Glasgow: PAiH

Positive Action in Housing (2000a) *The Housing and Information Training Service Survey Report*. Glasgow: PAiH

Positive Action in Housing (2000b) *'Response to Better Homes for Scotland's Communities: the Executive Proposals for the Housing Bill'* Glasgow: PAiH

Racial Equality Advisory Forum (2000), *Draft Action Plan*, REAF - Housing Working Party; Edinburgh: REAF

Scott, J. (1999) *An Evaluation of Scottish Homes Race Equality Activity* Edinburgh: Scottish Homes

Scottish Executive (1999) *Investing in Modernisation - An Agenda for Scotland's Housing*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Scottish Executive (2000a) *Better Homes for Scotland's Communities: The Executive's Proposals for the Housing Bill*, Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Scottish Executive (2000b) *Equality in Scotland - Guide to Data Sources*, Edinburgh: Central Statistics Unit, Scottish Executive

Scottish Homes (2000) *Race Equality Policy*. Edinburgh: Scottish Homes

Scottish Office (1991) *Ethnic Minorities in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Office

Scottish Refugee Council (2000) *The Immigration and Asylum Act 1999*, Edinburgh: Scottish Refugee Council

Sim, D F (1991) 'Ethnic Minority Access to Housing Associations' in Bowes, A M and Sim, D F (eds) *Demands and Constraints. Ethnic Minorities and Social Services in Scotland*, Edinburgh: Scottish Council of Voluntary Organisations

Third, H. and MacEwen, M. (1998) 'Recent research and some legal conundrums' in D. Cowan (ed.) *Housing Participation and Exclusion*. Aldershot: Ashgate

Third, H, Wainwright, S and Pawson, H (1997), *Constraint and Choice for Minority Ethnic Home Owners in Scotland*, Edinburgh: Scottish Homes

Wainwright, S, Murie, A and MacEwen, M (1994) *The Experience of Households from Minority Ethnic Groups in the Scottish Housing System*, Research Report No 29 Edinburgh: Scottish Homes

Wainwright, S, Pawson, H and Third, H (1995) *Housing Needs and Preferences of Households in Leith*. Edinburgh, Edinburgh College of Art/Heriot Watt University

Webb, S, Edwards, L, Murie, A and Yanetta, A (1995) *The Nature, Extent and Experience of Homelessness in Tayside* Research paper No. 64. School of Planning & Housing, Edinburgh College of Art.

CHAPTER THREE RACE AND EDUCATION

INTRODUCTION

3.1 The Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 which came into force in April 2001 will require all public sector services (including further and higher education providers) to promote racial equality and prevent racial discrimination. Robust research providing quantitative and qualitative data will be necessary to enable local authority and other education service providers to develop appropriate and effective policies to meet their legal obligations. The Standards in Scotland's Schools etc. Act 2000 will also impose an obligation on every education authority to produce an Annual Statement of Improvement Objectives outlining proposed action plans to prevent unlawful discrimination and promote equal opportunities.

3.2 The Scottish Parliament declares at its core a commitment to social inclusion and equal opportunities. It is also committed to ensuring that the challenges laid down by the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry report (Macpherson, 1999), that each public service scrutinises its practice for institutional racism, be adhered to. In setting up the Race Equality Advisory Forum (REAF), the Social Justice Minister has also ensured there is a small sub-group within REAF focusing specifically on embedding racial equality into Scottish education at all levels.

3.3 Her Majesty's Inspector of Schools have given an explicit commitment to ensure racial equality becomes a feature within any drive for effective and inclusive schools. Similarly, the Scottish Executive Education Department has commissioned a year long project for the development of materials to assist teaching staff develop their knowledge and understanding of anti-racist and racial equality issues in general. The work for this initiative is being done by the Centre for Education for Racial Equality in Scotland (CERES) in collaboration with Learning and Teaching Scotland and the City of Edinburgh Council Education Department. Most importantly, research evidence to date clearly shows racism and racial harassment to be alive and present in schools, playgrounds and in Scottish society at large (Hampton, 1998; EIS, 1999).

UPDATE OF RESEARCH

3.4 A useful review of published and unpublished research on race issues in education in Scotland, 'Education of Minority Ethnic Groups in Scotland', was published in 1998 by the Scottish Council for Research in Education (Powney et al 1998). In it the authors of the report state that

"most of the Scottish work in the area of education and minority ethnic groups has been small scale, conducted by committed and enthusiastic, [sic] individuals ... (but) has tended to be pragmatic and problem-based and therefore almost parochial...(making) little contribution to vigorous, theoretical debate concerning education and minority groups." (1998: 66)

Similarly, in the first major review of research on gender equality, Brown et al (1994) report that:

“there are few major studies which have resulted in the publication of substantial works. There is an almost total absence of studies which attempt to provide an overview or framework, within which to situate smaller scale studies, or from which advances in analysis or theory can be made.” (1994: 92)

And in relation to the issue of race equality, they cite just five small-scale studies and conclude that “the picture in terms of research output and funding is even bleaker” (1994: 94).

3.5 However, Powney et al add that despite this “doleful picture” there is, in Scotland, the

“opportunity to develop a strategy for ensuring that there is support for all researchers to deploy appropriate and rigorous methods as well as defining priorities for research topics.” (1998: 66)

3.6 Since then there have also been legislative changes, which place equal opportunities at the heart of quality assurance and service provision. This audit does not repeat the work already carried out by Powney and her colleagues. Rather, we seek to identify and refer to work that has been completed since the publication of their findings, although any work produced before 1998 but not mentioned in the review has been included here. We also attempt to gauge the extent to which Powney et al’s suggestions for future research projects have been put into practice and refer to further priorities suggested by additional material identified in this audit.

3.7 In addition to Powney et al’s work, which in part drew on the Centre for Education for Racial Equality in Scotland’s (CERES) race and education annual research trawls, we have relied on submissions made to us in response to our request for details of research (as detailed in the section on methodology). Although Powney et al do not consider Gypsy Travellers, refugees or asylum seekers in their review, these groups are included in this audit. The same is true of the field of Special Educational Needs: relevant studies have been reported here. While we recognise that there is racial discrimination against non-visible minorities such as the Irish and prejudice against Catholicism in Scotland (Paterson, 2000a, 2000b and 2000c), we concentrate our attention on the experience of visible minority ethnic groups, for the reasons given in Chapter 1. The audit also reflects the fact that a large proportion of the texts identified focus on ‘visible’ minority ethnic people in the compulsory school system. Relatively little material exists on the pre-and post-school sectors.

3.8 For reasons of consistency and clarity we adopt Powney et al’s thematic approach. The material is therefore divided as follows: statistical sources, access, learning and teaching: ethos, learning and teaching: curriculum, learning and teaching: home and school, learning and teaching: language issue, learning and teaching: teacher education and staff development, attainment, ethnicity and educational employment.

STATISTICAL SOURCES

“There is a lack of accessible statistical information on which to base enquiry and conclusions.” (Powney et al, 1998: 9)

3.9 The review by Powney et al recommends that a better basis on which to conduct all research, but especially that of a quantitative/comparative nature, might be created if all relevant Scottish databases contained information and analyses of ethnicity relating to:

- Scottish pupils’ stages of education and their attainment
- Scottish teachers including level and area of work
- school leavers and their post-school destinations
- parents in PTAs and School Boards
- access and attainment in further and higher education
- the level and area of work of staff in further and higher education

3.10 There has been some work on statistical monitoring of minority ethnic issues in education. These issues have included attendance and attainment patterns of traveller pupils (Carroll and Jordan, 1995; Jordan, 1998; Jordan et al, 1998; Jordan and Padfield, forthcoming), attainment of minority ethnic pupils (Sharp and Fitzpatrick, 1991), recruitment of minority ethnic students into higher education (Ainsworth and Johnson, 1990; Walsh et al, 1995) and monitoring of racial incidents by local authorities such as in Strathclyde (1989 – 1996) Lothian (1994 –6) and Fife (1998) onwards. The Educational Institute of Scotland (EIS), the largest teaching union in Scotland, ethnically monitors its membership. In 1999-2000, the union estimates that of its total membership of approximately 51,290 members, around 230 (0.05%) identified themselves as from a minority ethnic group. Apart from the EIS data, there is no other information on the overall ethnic profile of the Scottish teaching force, though the former Strathclyde and current Glasgow councils have gathered ethnic data on their teaching force since the early 1990s.

3.11 Since the Powney et al research, the Scottish Executive Central Statistics Unit has produced a series of ‘Equality in Scotland’ factsheets. One of the series concentrates on minority ethnic people and within this particular publication only one set of statistics relates to education, that of the number of the UK domiciled students attending Higher Education Institutions (HEI) in Scotland. The source of these was the Further and Higher Education Statistics of the Scottish Executive. According to the HESA (Higher Education Statistics Agency) Student Returns for Academic Year 1998/1999, the percentage of UK Domiciled students, of Known Ethnicity, studying in Scottish Institutions who were non-white was 3.9. This figure, issued recently by HESA to CERES does not match the one given in the recent Scottish Executive publication on minority ethnic people mentioned earlier.

3.12 Another source of data on education is the Annual School Census, which reintroduced a question on the ethnic background of pupils in September 1999. The Census is conducted at two stages, Primary One (P1) and Secondary Two (S2). The Scottish Executive takes care to point out that the quality of ethnicity information depends on the quality of data recording of each particular school. In the 1999/2000 school session the ethnic background of 10% of overall P1 or S2 pupils was either not known or not divulged: 3% of overall primary one, secondary two and special school pupils were recorded as from a minority ethnic background.

3.13 Other areas for which the Scottish Executive collects data but where there is no ethnicity component include:

- Teacher Census (which gives the profile of the Scottish teacher workforce; data was last collected in 1998)
- Scottish Qualifications Authority (SQA) Examination results¹ (though pupils requiring the use of bilingual dictionaries are recorded manually)
- School Leavers and Destinations (data collected from careers services companies and managers of independent and grant-aided schools)
- Scottish School Leavers Survey (age cohorts are surveyed, at age 17, 19 and 23 on school experience, activities since leaving school, industry and occupation of work and so forth)

However it must be noted that some local authorities may have collated data for the above categories. For example, the former Strathclyde and current Glasgow councils have included ethnicity in their leaver surveys since 1990.

3.14 In their national consultation with community groups, black/minority ethnic parents and education practitioners, the Race Equality Advisory Forum (REAF) Education Sub-Group identified the absence of data on race and ethnicity matters as a key concern. REAF in their report to the Social Justice Minister called for prioritisation to ensure the Scottish Executive and local authorities mainstream ethnicity into data gathering mechanisms. Such data, for all levels of education, has been identified as a prerequisite to improvement in performance, recruitment, selection and related areas. Some local authorities have taken their own initiatives in gathering data on ethnicity in the field of education.

3.15 The inclusion of ethnicity into education data collection frameworks is being addressed by the National Management Information System (NMIS). The NMIS project is based on the principle of common standards for the electronic exchange of data to be collected on individual pupils and all individual teachers in Scotland. Collecting information via NMIS will allow analysis of all types of educational data by ethnic background, religion, main language spoken by the pupil, Special Education Needs and/or Record of Needs. Due to the magnitude and ambition of the NMIS project, it will be phased in over time. Plans are currently being drawn up on how to implement NMIS in practice and the NMIS Working Group has recognised the growing demand and priority for education data by ethnic background. In the short term, the NMIS project will be focused on obtaining information from the primary and secondary school sectors. In the future it is hoped to expand the project into the pre-school sector, further and higher education and other related sectors.

ACCESS

¹ It should be noted that the SQA are planning to collect ethnicity data on candidates in the future

“Whilst there are a number of studies which provide insight into access in education, they are often small in nature and are focused on particular issues.” (Powney et al, 1998: 18)

3.16 A key issue is the lack of a coherent picture in relation to minority ethnic access to a range of educational services and provision covering nursery, compulsory and post-compulsory education.

3.17 There has been a range of small-scale pieces of research which have focussed directly on access related issues (Bamford, 1990; Weir, 1992; Clayton, 1995; Clayton and McGill, 1998; Walsh et al, 1995; Hampton et al, 1997). Other pieces of work identifying the needs of minority ethnic learners have a bearing on access issues but access has not been the main focus (Cameron, 1995; Bell and Elkind, 1997). Since the Powney review, two pieces of work addressing barriers to learning for the post-compulsory sector have come to light: Peters (2000) explores barriers to learning, investigating the learning needs of students, the availability of support mechanisms for students and the development of policy and practice. Irvine and Rice (2000) consider the accessibility of a variety of learning opportunities in Glasgow for English Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL) and evaluate the extent to which their requirements have been met. Prior to these reports, the last survey of this kind was conducted by Weir and Matheson (1988). It should be noted that both projects received funding from the same source, Scottish Enterprise.

3.18 Further reports by Dodd et al (2000a, b and c) examines the ways in which young Gypsy Travellers face issues of accessing services and social exclusion. Their research is approached from a community education (non-formal sector) perspective. Milburn and Yusuf (2001) examine the perspectives and experiences of young minority ethnic people from a community education perspective in a recent study. Hussain and Pimm (1994) also take a community education approach. There are further research studies currently in progress which focus on access into adult and continuing education (Clayton et al, 2001) and the rights of minority ethnic families and children to services and representation (Almeida Diniz, forthcoming; Almeida Diniz, Pilgrim and Usmani, forthcoming).

3.19 No other significant known pieces of work addressing access as a key concern have emerged. Access to provision does, however, appear as a strand in some pieces of work. For example, in relation to the needs of refugees (Arshad et al, 1999; Closs et al, 2000), further and higher education (Bamford, 1990; Weir, 1992; Cameron, 1995; Clayton, 1995), Travellers (Evans, 1999; Evans et al, 1999; Hendry, 2000, Jordan, 2001, Jordan, 1993, Lloyd, 1996, McKinney, 2001) and parental involvement (Arshad and Pattie, 1994; Jordan et al, 1999; Arshad and Syed, 2001).

3.20 A common finding peppered across all these pieces of work is the need for education establishments and providers to improve consultation and communication on an informed basis with minority ethnic communities and families. Repeated failure to do so results in inappropriate provision or no provision.

LEARNING AND TEACHING: ETHOS

“Almost every agency concerned with education for schools and teachers advocates addressing issues concerned with the education of minority ethnic groups. Despite these exhortations, there has been no distinctively Scottish agenda of major research related to learning and teaching in the context of a pluralistic society”. (Powney et al, 1998: 21)

“Racism is a largely neglected issue in research and does not provide a basis for teachers to develop anti-racist strategies.” (Powney et al, 1998: 27)

3.21 Significant contributions to the development of school ethos have been made in Scotland. One of the most recent publications (Murray and Closs, 2000) by the Scottish Schools Ethos Network, which is funded by the Scottish Executive and located within the Faculty of Education, University of Edinburgh, profiles 13 schools across Scotland. Unfortunately, it does not acknowledge or address issues of ethnicity, multiculturalism, bilingualism or racism in any of the case studies. In the wake of the Macpherson Inquiry report (1999) and the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, the continued invisibility of race issues within research in Scottish education in the area of school ethos is a cause for concern.

3.22 Since the Powney review, several pieces of work that are likely to have bearing on ethos-related issues can be identified. This includes one small-scale study produced by a voluntary sector race-related organisation which has looked at issues of racism within schools (Borthwick, 1999) and a student dissertation which has examined racism within education in general (Johnston, 1999). Prior to this, there were five pieces of work which dealt with racism within schools and pupil attitudes, ethos and teacher expectations (Bell, 1990; Hawkes, 1994, Hamilton et al 1995, Jordan, 1997, Kennedy, 1996, Stronach, 1995). The Hamilton et al study which was a piece of action research by three Central Region primary teachers provides substantial evidence for the need to embed racial equality into all aspects of teaching and learning. Arguably, it remains to date one of the most useful examples of Scottish-based research to have emerged that can be applied to develop multicultural and anti-racist education practice with authorities and in particular primary schools. Other studies over the past decade have been either student dissertations which have focused on specific minority groups such as religious education for Muslims (Hemming and Saeed, 1995), the needs of Muslim children in Scottish primary schools (Gordon, 1998), or the friendship patterns of Chinese children (Lo, 1993).

3.23 Two further pieces of work address the need to consider racial issues within teaching and learning. The first of these is the Black Mentoring Project (Cavers and Chetwynd, 2000), which details and analyses the process of mentoring as a means of raising the self-esteem of minority ethnic individuals, facilitating the move into lifelong learning and work. The second is a proposed Ph.D. thesis investigating the perceptions of minority ethnic teachers regarding their professionalism, practice and spheres of influence and how these various perceptions impact on the performance of those teachers within a teaching and learning environment (Arshad, 2004/5).

3.24 Whilst a number of studies raise the problem of racial harassment and bullying in schools, we have been unable to identify any Scottish work with multicultural or anti-racist

ethos as its main focus of study. This is despite research by Hampton (1998) regarding the perceptions and experiences of racism by young people in Glasgow. A majority of respondents in this research cited “schools” as a clear site for racist incidents. They also identified central figures of authority, such as teachers and the police as indifferent and disinterested (in matters of race and racism) and indeed, as racist themselves. A further longitudinal study along the theme of Hampton’s work on the experiences of minority and majority young people of racism and discrimination has been started but is not due for completion till 2004 (Howe et al, 2004).

LEARNING AND TEACHING: CURRICULUM

“Issues related to the curriculum and curriculum materials are largely neglected in research focused on the education of minority ethnic groups.” (Powney et al, 1998: 29)

3.25 Powney et al points out two facets to the curriculum: first, the need for the curriculum to be accessible to all pupils, including minority ethnic and bilingual pupils; and second, the role of the curriculum, both explicit and implicit, to be anti-racist and educate for equality. The Powney review states that until 1998 there was no known study related to curriculum or classroom practice in the field of race and education, although reference is made to one comparative study on the sexual health needs of Indian, Pakistani and White secondary school pupils in Glasgow (Mirza, 1997). It has not been possible to identify any new studies in this field in either the compulsory or post-compulsory sector. Information on the involvement of minority ethnic pupils in out of school activities, sports or the arts is also lacking.

LEARNING AND TEACHING: HOME AND SCHOOL

“Despite high parental aspirations among minority ethnic communities and considerable commitment to their children’s education, the research suggests that professionals are unaware of the specific needs and interest of minority ethnic parents in this context and therefore fail to provide relevant information and support.” (Powney et al, 1998: 34)

3.26 As in the area of ethos, recent efforts to foster good relations between home and school in Scotland are well documented (Powney et al, 1998: 31). However, relatively little Scottish research has emerged related to the perspectives of parents from minority ethnic groups on their children’s education. Some examples preceding the Powney review include work by Strathclyde Regional Council Education Department (1996a, 1996b) exploring how one division of that local authority (Lanark division) had sought to improve its minority ethnic parental participation in relation to education issues. This division has since updated its work by examining how minority ethnic parents can work in partnership with the authority careers service to ensure attainment and progression of minority ethnic pupils (Lanarkshire Careers Service, 1998).

3.27 A further piece of work records parental attitudes towards the provision of world religions in the Isle of Lewis (Mackenzie, 1998). Yet another by Arrowsmith and Kearns (1995) investigated how minority ethnic families become involved in their children’s

education. This work concentrates on one primary school, within the central belt of Scotland, with a relatively high percentage of minority ethnic children on its school roll. A more recent piece of work by Hwang (2001) explores in particular the influence of cultural values on the parenting practices of British and Chinese mothers in Scotland. Hwang's work finds that there are cultural differences that influence parenting styles and perhaps more importantly that different cultural groups may define success and attainment in different ways and indeed may differ in the advice they give their children on how to achieve this "success". It is therefore important that educators understand different parental approaches in this area thereby avoiding stereotyping or labelling in relation to parents' motives, behaviours and goals.

3.28 Since the Powney review, one area of home and school has received greater attention. This has been within the area of minority ethnic issues and special educational needs. It is, however, important to highlight that the attention given to race and special educational needs has arisen out of work done by voluntary sector organisations working with minority ethnic communities or from minority ethnic academics who are working in the area of social justice and rights.

3.29 In the area of special educational needs (SEN), various studies have highlighted the marginalisation of minority ethnic parents of children with special educational needs (Curnyn et al, 1991; Kaifi, 1993; Almeida Diniz and Pal, 1994; Commission for Racial Equality, 1996; 1997; Almeida Diniz, 1997; 1999; Almeida Diniz and Chang, forthcoming; Almeida Diniz, Pilgrim and Usmani, 2001; Chang, 2000). All these studies report that minority ethnic families are seriously under-represented in decision-making about their children's education and face institutional racism in accessing information and equitable resources provided by both statutory and voluntary sectors. The Minority Ethnic Learning Difficulty Initiative (MELDI) has systematically produced short papers on issues related to minority ethnic disabled children and their families including a submission to the Scottish Parliament (MELDI, 2000).

3.30 A survey of minority ethnic parental perspectives of their children's experiences of primary education in Scotland (Arshad and Syed, 2001), carried out across Scotland, explores expectations, preferences and barriers to involvement as perceived by minority ethnic parents. To some extent it supports Bakshi (1992) who considers the similarities between minority and majority ethnic parental views. These pieces of work found that the concerns of minority ethnic parents on some issues such as discipline, good examination grades and relevance of school subjects to future careers are relatively similar. However, the work by Arshad and Syed finds that minority ethnic parents are often reluctant to discuss matters related to racism and racial discrimination. This reluctance is due to several reasons; fear that their concerns might be marginalised or dismissed by education staff, fear of negative reaction of education staff towards their children, not wishing to "bother" the school or simply that other home priorities which are urgent overtake school related matters. It should be noted that one key race equality specialist in Glasgow has indicated that in some cases parents are unaware of the good work done by some schools in the city. This statement may be true for other Scottish cities and towns. Most parents interviewed did not think schools were doing enough to promote multiculturalism or respect for diversity and difference.

3.31 A seminal piece of work on refugee children in Scotland (Closs et al, 1999) devotes a substantial chapter to the thoughts of refugee parents about their children's education and the settling down process in a new country. This chapter remains the only one of its kind with a Scottish focus, though there is other more up to date work on refugees and asylum seekers

which has a generic focus (Save the Children/Scottish Refugee Council 2000). The needs, status and rights of asylum seekers and refugees remain an area of confusion among education providers. More work is needed to assist in the development of appropriate provision at compulsory and post-compulsory level. Forthcoming work on the role of family relationships in assisting refugee pupils settle in is currently underway (Ager 2002).

3.32 Work by Jordan et al (1999) focuses in particular on the experiences of Gypsy Traveller parents and pupils of school. The useful work undertaken by various authorities on Gypsy Traveller communities prior to reorganisation, such as the work done by the then Central Regional Council Education Department, has unfortunately never resulted in publications.

LEARNING AND TEACHING: LANGUAGE ISSUES

“ While a large number of different languages are spoken by some pupils in Scotland, there is little research investigating the effects of bilingualism on learning.” (Powney et al, 1998: 35)

3.33 More than sixty languages are currently used in daily life throughout Scotland. In one authority, East Renfrewshire, pupils attending schools in that authority speak more than 52 languages. The City of Edinburgh Council English as an Additional Language service (EAL)² records indicate that only 10 of the authority’s 154 schools (spanning nursery to secondary) do not have bilingual pupils. However, as the Powney review finds, this scale of linguistic diversity has gone largely unrecognised by educational and other service providers as well as by statistical researchers; where it is recognised, it is often seen as a problem.

3.34 The audit carried out by CERES in 1998 examines the dearth of community language provision across Scotland (CERES, 1999). Numerous pieces of work on bilingualism have since been conducted or planned, particularly with an emphasis on raising attainment (Drysdale 1999; Glasgow Education Services, 1999; Irvine and Rice, 2000; Simpson, 2000; Smyth, 2000; Simpson 2001; Sarkar, 2001; EAL Service, 2001; Shorter, ongoing)

3.35 Simpson’s work records the strategies used by some schools, within the City of Edinburgh, to boost attainment of bilingual pupils in their schools. One report examines the partnership between the City’s EAL service and a multi-ethnic secondary school and the other examines how support can be given to bilingual pupils in transition from P7 - S1 to maximise their achievement and attainment potential. Issues related to home-school support are also discussed.

3.36 In her forthcoming doctoral thesis, Sarkar argues for the inclusion of Asian mother tongues in the curriculum and the inclusion of minority language awareness training within teacher education programmes. The subject is also explored by Smyth (2000) who focuses on primary education and calls for an increase in pre-service and in-service teacher education to meet the needs of bilingual pupils. Both these pieces of work from the west of Scotland confirm that there is limited understanding of bilingualism among mainstream teachers.

² This figure is derived from 1999-2000 audit of bilingual learners in Edinburgh schools

3.37 Yet the issue of bilingualism and the importance of maintaining language and culture by minority ethnic parents, pupils and communities can be evidenced in a range of work (Thorpe, 1992; Jiwa, 1993; Chow, 1994; Pal, 1994; Cheung, 1995; Gearns, 1997; Arshad and Syed, 2001). As already referred to in the section on Access in this chapter, Irvine and Rice (2000) report on the provision of English to Speakers of Other Languages with particular reference to adult learners.

3.38 It would appear from the responses received for this audit that the area of learning and teaching in relation to languages and bilingualism has been an area of increasing research and activity. As mentioned earlier, much of this is linked to issues of attainment and achievement; however, these studies also highlight the need for teacher educators to focus more sharply in teacher education on preparing students to work in linguistically diverse circumstances. The need for teacher education training providers to be more aware of multicultural and anti-racist issues has been addressed in previous work by academics like Smyth and Mckee (1996) who examined how multicultural and anti-racist education policies were being implemented in two teacher education institutes in the west of Scotland.

3.39 The problematic issues surrounding black and bilingual minority ethnic children receiving SEN provision did not receive specific attention in the Powney review. The various pieces of work by Almeida Diniz in particular, comment on this ‘invisibility’ of ‘race’, ethnicity and linguistic diversity in Scottish special education research. He concludes that the vast investment of government funding for special education research has failed to address the needs of minority ethnic children, as these studies have remained ‘colour-blind’. One recent study to focus specifically on ‘bilingualism’ and SEN is Deponio et al (2000) on dyslexia. Two main conclusions that can be drawn from all the reported studies concerning minority ethnic children with SEN and their families are that:

- current SEN research in Scotland is ‘colour-blind’, conceptually and methodologically
- there have been no government funded national studies concerning minority ethnic children with SEN
- research is needed about the impact of ‘institutional racism’ on key aspects of SEN policy and practice in relation to the social inclusion of minority ethnic disabled children and their families; identification and assessment, representation, placement, progression and attainment, multi-agency support services and human resource issues

LANGUAGE AND TEACHING: TEACHER EDUCATION AND STAFF DEVELOPMENT

“In relation to the education of minority ethnic groups, both the composition of the teaching force and the way teachers promote multicultural and anti-racist education are vital.” (Powney et al, 1998: 41)

3.40 In their initial programmes, teacher education institutions in Scotland are required to prepare teachers to take into account issues of diversity. The Children (Scotland) Act 1995 imposes a duty on all those who provide services for children “to have regard to children’s religious persuasion, racial origin and cultural and linguistic background.”

3.41 Powney suggests that there remains a need for the following areas to be addressed:

- examining the nature, quality and impact of racial equality components in teacher education courses, pre- and in-service and seeking the views of course providers and students
- provision of support for pupils and students from minority ethnic groups in schools, for students in teacher education institutes, on campus, in placements and on work experience
- identifying obstacles for minority ethnic people entering into and operating within the teaching profession

3.42 Since the Powney review, there has been no study of any of the three areas identified above. Smyth and McKee (1996) examines the Multicultural and Anti-Racist (MCARE) policies of two teacher education institutes, albeit predominantly in terms of the effectiveness of pre-service courses in preparing teachers to teach bilingual pupils. The study finds that despite MCARE policies, qualifying teachers are poorly prepared to teach bilingual pupils. However, since 1997 the University of Paisley and Glasgow Education Department have jointly run staff development modules for minority ethnic staff, addressing the points raised above.

ATTAINMENT

“The Scottish research contribution to the debate on school attainment appears to be at best fairly minimal reflecting individual interest in particular themes rather than being systematic and cumulative developments of a body of research related to the educational attainment of minority ethnic groups.”
(Powney et al, 1998: 45)

3.43 Given the Government’s commitment, both at UK and Scotland level, to raising levels of attainment, it is surprising that there is an almost complete lack of data on achievement levels of minority ethnic young people in Scotland, either at school or further and higher education levels. Small pieces of work are conducted within individual schools, local authorities or post graduate students (Finlay, 1992) but these are not published widely and are hence less well known in the public arena. The last nationally recognised piece of work in this area researched minority ethnic attainment in examinations in English (Sharp and Fitzpatrick, 1991)

3.44 Since then, attainment relating to minority ethnic groups has been studied (Simpson, 2000; 2001), but has once again focussed on a specific group such as bilingual learners or on Gypsy Travellers (Jordan, forthcoming; Padfield and Jordan, 2001). Scotland continues to lack an overall picture of attainment and ethnicity.

ETHNICITY AND EDUCATIONAL EMPLOYMENT

“There is considerable scope for extending monitoring information concerning recruitment and levels of appointment of minority ethnic staff in all sectors of education.” (Powney et al, 1998: 55)

3.45 Redressing the under-representation of minority ethnic staff in all areas and aspects of educational employment is not a new issue. Various pieces of work have attempted to address this in Scotland (Quinn, 1995; Dickson, 1995, Cavers and Chetwynd, 2000).

3.46 However, the most recent major research on ethnicity, pay and employment (Carter, Fenton and Modood, 1999) investigates contracts, progression and pay differences among minority and majority ethnic workers and is based on statistics from the Higher Education Statistics Agency (HESA). Although the research covers mainly England, Scotland is included within the trawl and the report was part funded by the Scottish Higher Education Funding Council (SHEFC).

3.47 The points below summarise Powney’s suggestions for study :

- consideration of the aspirations or targets of educational institutions in the area of recruitment, retention and promotion of staff from minority ethnic groups
- evaluation of the impact of equal opportunities policies on minority ethnic staff recruitment, promotion and retention
- identification of good practice examples in the fields of minority ethnic staff recruitment, promotion and retention

Although these areas may be receiving attention within local authority or educational establishments, we have been unable to identify any further research to address the issues suggested above.

OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH ACTIVITY

3.48 In this section of the report, the research considered above will be considered in relation to their scope, funding and methodology. Gaps in research will also be identified.

Scope

3.49 Most research appears to look at minority ethnic people in general, and although some studies concentrate on specific ethnic groups, there does not appear to be an *overt* overall marked bias in favour of any one ethnic community. The studies that have focused on specific ethnic groups have largely been focused on Chinese or Traveller families, parents, learners and communities. Where research has concentrated on issues like bilingualism and the needs of bilingual learners, the focus has been mainly on those of Indian Sub-Continent origin. Smaller minority communities such as those of African descent or of mixed parentage backgrounds have not appeared to any significant degree in the majority of research studies to date. Of the approximately 100 submissions included here, some of which represent forthcoming research,

the majority could be characterised as small-scale, university-based research or locally driven by service providers' needs and rarely published for wider consumption

Dissemination of research

3.50 Whilst we are confident that we have recorded most of the major research in the area of race and education, we are also aware of the existence of a disparate and diffuse corpus of work much of which was not submitted for inclusion in this audit. A considerable volume of work is being lost to the debate on race and education because basic data such as author or title cannot be traced or because copies of abstracts, summaries or full reports are not available. Furthermore, many reports betray uncertainty as to the target audience, and by extension their purpose and circulation.

Funding

3.51 Most of the work appears to be funded by local authorities or higher education establishments. There are several submissions, which are doctoral theses or masters level student dissertations, which have received university support. Other funders cited include the Carnegie Trust, Scottish Enterprise, Glasgow Development Agency and the National Lotteries Charity Board. The Scottish Executive via the Education Department or the Ethnic Minority Grant Scheme has also funded studies, although these are few.

Perspectives

3.52 The pattern of research is that of 'meeting needs' of minority ethnic communities or learners rather than researching ways in which educational institutions could alter practice to ensure that racial equality is embedded and mainstreamed into the structures and processes of education

3.53 While some studies take an anti-racist approach, this is not always overtly stated. Terms such as 'social inclusion/exclusion', 'equal opportunities' and 'race' are used, but the term 'racism' or 'anti-racism' remains, in the main, elusive. On the whole, many reports do not address issues of racism in any depth and institutional racism, although alluded to, is rarely identified clearly or analysed critically even within studies that focus on racism. This displays confusion, unease with the terminology of anti-racism and is particularly worrying, given the challenge of the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry report to identify and challenge institutional racism. Arshad and Almeida Diniz (1999) have raised these issues.

RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Main Themes	Identified Gaps	Recommendations
<p>Scottish education has largely failed to embed racial equality issues within teaching and learning in any systematic way. While some evidence exists of multicultural education being included within the curriculum, this inclusion has not been systematic across all schools, education authorities or curriculum areas nor has there been clear evidence of anti-racist approaches being developed and promoted.</p> <p>Recent research shows that embedding race equality issues in the field of ethos within and across a range of teaching and learning issues can improve the self-esteem of young minority ethnic people, particularly bilingual pupils.</p>	<p>Little attention has been paid to identifying and publicising the manner in which multicultural and anti-racist education is being mainstreamed into the planning and delivery of the various stages of the Scottish curriculum, including within the teacher education sector.</p> <p>In the important area of school ethos, the virtual invisibility of race and ethnicity as key factors is notable.</p> <p>The potential role of HMI (Education) and Teaching and Learning Scotland in relation to the promotion of racial equality has been largely neglected.</p>	<p>A key research priority is to evaluate the effectiveness of the Scottish Executive, HMI (Education), Teaching and Learning Scotland and education authorities in meeting their duties under Race Relations legislation.</p> <p>Analysis of mechanisms for mainstreaming racial equality issues into funding frameworks affecting Scottish education would also be useful.</p> <p>Identifying and evaluating ‘good practice’ in mainstreaming racial equality perspectives in Scottish education is important – particularly at early years levels.</p>
<p>Low priority has, until recently, been given to the gathering of race/ethnicity data in Scottish education. Monitoring of developments and assessment of change is therefore very difficult.</p>	<p>There is a virtual absence of statistics on the presence, performance, choices, aspirations, experience and outlooks of minority ethnic learners in relation to the various levels and types of educational provision in Scotland.</p>	<p>There is a need for ethnicity to be mainstreamed as a variable within existing databases in order to enable quantitative analysis of issues related to education [NMIS will include ethnicity within the development of its data collection framework in the future].</p> <p>Research to identify effective mechanisms for encouraging service providers to undertake ethnic monitoring would be useful.</p>
<p>Teacher education courses fail to provide training to develop teacher competencies for working within a contemporary multilingual, multi-faith, multicultural, multiracial classroom.</p> <p>Despite recognition of the need to raise the participation of minority ethnic people on teacher education courses, little has been done by teacher education providers to achieve this outcome.</p>	<p>The perspectives and practice of teacher education institutions on mainstreaming race and ethnicity into teaching and learning is unknown</p> <p>The experience of minority ethnic students in teacher education institutions remains unrecorded.</p>	<p>An investigation of the nature and effectiveness of mainstreaming and implementation of equal opportunities (in particular, racial equality) in teacher education institutions - in areas such as teaching and learning, recruitment and selection, access and progression for both staff and students and minority ethnic student experiences - would be useful.</p>

<p>Minority ethnic people experience institutional and structural barriers in accessing their full entitlements to all levels of education services. These barriers include: a largely Eurocentric curriculum, lack of bilingual teachers and staff, lack of access to interpreting services, absence of minority ethnic role models and the apathy of educational establishments in tackling racism and racial discrimination.</p>	<p>The key features of how institutionalised racism operates in educational systems and agencies have not been studied or addressed in practice.</p>	<p>Investigation of the effects of racism, particularly institutional racism, on equal access and fairness at all levels of education for current and future minority ethnic learners is vital.</p> <p>Identification of the benefits of, and constraints on, mainstreaming race and the development of specialist provision would be very useful.</p>
<p>Minority ethnic people are seriously under-represented within the Scottish education workforce at all levels.</p>	<p>There has been no research into the location, level and experience of minority ethnic education personnel.</p> <p>The attitude of minority ethnic people in Scotland to the teaching profession and to teacher education institutions in particular has not been investigated</p>	<p>An evaluation of the impact of equal opportunities policies on the recruitment, retention, promotion and pay rates of minority ethnic staff within Scottish further and higher education would provide valuable information.</p>
<p>Minority ethnic parents appear to be under-represented on decision-making forums, although limited evidence suggests that these parents are keen to participate in these forums.</p> <p>Some minority ethnic parents are particularly vulnerable to exclusion e.g. those whose children have special educational needs, those living in dispersed communities, or those from specific minority communities such as refugees/asylum seekers and Gypsy Travellers.</p>	<p>The level of minority ethnic parental participation in key decision-making and representative organisations and the ethnic breakdown of such participants are not known.</p> <p>The perspectives and practice of decision-making forums regarding minority ethnic participation and representation is also unknown.</p>	<p>The identification of models of parental participation within institutional and community environments would be very useful.</p> <p>Particular reference should be made to minority ethnic parents, including parents of children with special educational needs, refugees/asylum seekers, Gypsy Travellers and those living in dispersed communities/rural areas.</p>
<p>There are concerns about the possible under-use by minority ethnic communities of early years educational provision</p>	<p>Very little is known about how racial equality is being embedded into early years provision.</p> <p>Little is known about the level of access and participation of minority ethnic communities in early years provision at all levels</p>	<p>An examination of race equality issues in early years provision in terms of access and participation, parental involvement, ethos and curriculum, development of explicit anti-racist approaches and the performance of minority ethnic pupils would be an early priority area for action.</p>

<p>Linguistic and cultural diversity has gone largely unrecognised by educational service providers and where these issues have been recognised they are mainly seen as problems.</p> <p>Very little support is provided for the bilingual learner, and little is done to sustain a 'balanced bilingual' position.</p> <p>More recent developments indicate increased recognition of the needs of bilingual learners across sectors; studies on the needs of bilingual learners are being more firmly linked with the national priority themes of attainment, achievement, literacy and numeracy.</p>	<p>There are no Scottish based and cross-cultural studies on the educational and teaching and learning issues raised by linguistic and cultural diversity.</p> <p>Initiatives to provide better services to multilingual children, young people and parents have not been evaluated. The implications for the promotion and maintenance of community language provision of lessons learned in relation to the benefits of Gaelic medium education and achievement and attainment of Gaelic/English bilingual learners have not been explored.</p>	<p>There is a need for research to identify effective teaching and learning strategies for supporting bi/multilingual learners within the Scottish educational context.</p> <p>A study to investigate the benefits arising from Gaelic medium education and to link lessons learned to the development and support of community language provision within mainstream education would inform policy to support bilingual learners in Scotland.</p>
<p>Despite Government commitments to raising levels of attainment, there is still very little known about the attainment levels of minority ethnic young people.</p> <p>Work in this area tends to have been of a small-scale, local nature or has focused on a particular group, such as Gypsy Travellers.</p>	<p>The attainment and achievement levels of minority ethnic learners in formal and informal educational settings are not known. Similarly, little is known about the subject choices of minority ethnic learners in schools, further, higher and community education or their career choices and aspirations.</p> <p>Information on minority ethnic participation in arts/sports/cultural activities in an education setting is lacking.</p>	<p>Nationally funded thematic research on the participation, achievement and attainment of minority ethnic learners in Scotland is required. This should include an analysis of educational subject choices, post-education destinations and career choices of minority ethnic young people and attitudes of minority ethnic young people in relation to educational and employment opportunities.</p> <p>Minority ethnic young people's access to, and participation in, arts/sports/cultural activities in an education setting requires research.</p>
<p>A higher profile has recently been given to the barriers to learning encountered in post-compulsory education, as a result of government priorities on social inclusion and widening access.</p>	<p>There is no information on how race equality issues are being addressed in relation to access to community-based adult education.</p> <p>It is not known how race/ethnicity issues are being mainstreamed into FE/HE widening access initiatives.</p>	<p>An investigation into the mechanisms through which (informal) community education is mainstreaming race equality issues, particularly anti-racist education, through community based adult education, youth work and community work, would be useful.</p>

<p>Educational providers are uncertain as to the entitlement of refugees and asylum seekers to educational and employment opportunities</p>	<p>The educational and employment needs of refugees are unknown.</p>	<p>There is a need to investigate the current capacity and effectiveness of education providers in meeting the needs of refugee pupils, adult learners and parents and to identify best practice in meeting the above.</p>
<p>Research related to Gypsy Travellers in Scotland has been considerably boosted as a result of work from the Scottish Traveller Education Programme (STEP).</p>	<p>Effective home-school strategies for Gypsy Travellers have not been identified.</p> <p>There is a need to examine how educational establishments can best support pupils and families who may face interrupted learning.</p>	<p>A study which examines how service providers can best meet the needs of Gypsy Traveller pupils and families and support interrupted learning would be useful. This could include an examination of school ethos and effective home-school strategies as well as the funding implications of supporting learning by distance learning, hand-held records, individualised curriculum delivery and special examination arrangements.</p>

REFERENCES

- Ager, W (2002) *Refugee parents and children: the role of family relationships in the settling in process*. M.Ed. Dissertation, Faculty of Education, University of Edinburgh
- Ainsworth, S and Johnson, A (1990) *Examination of the recruitment of minority ethnic students to Jordanhill College*. Department of Psychology, Jordanhill College of Education, Jordanhill
- Almeida Diniz, F and Pal, D (1994) *Special education and Black/minority ethnic pupils in Scotland*, Moray House Institute of Education, Edinburgh
- Almeida Diniz, F (1997) 'Working with Families in a Multi-ethnic European Context: Implications for Services' In B. Carpenter (ed) *Families in Context*, pp107-120, London: David Fulton
- Almeida Diniz, F (1999) 'Educational Experiences and Good Practice in the Education of Minority Ethnic Children in Scotland', In Northern Ireland Council for Ethnic Minorities (eds) *Education for All. Conference Report*, Belfast: NICEM
- Almeida Diniz, F (forthcoming) *A Struggle to be Heard: the marginalisation of black and minority ethnic families of disabled children*, University of Edinburgh
- Almeida Diniz, F and Pilgrim, S and Usmani, K (forthcoming) 'Social Inclusion of black and minority ethnic children with special educational needs in Scotland' In *Multicultural Teaching*
- Almeida Diniz, F and Chang, C.P. (forthcoming) *Supporting Chinese families of children with special educational needs in Scotland*, University of Edinburgh
- Arrowsmith, J and Gearn, J (1995) *Family involvement in primary school education Focus 3: Families in an Identified Area with Significant Numbers of Minority Ethnic Groups*, Edinburgh: Moray House Institute of Education
- Arshad, R (2004/5) *The Power to Influence: the perceptions of minority ethnic teachers in Scotland on their professionalism, practice and spheres of influence*. Proposed doctoral thesis. Centre for Education for Racial Equality in Scotland (CERES) and Faculty of Education, University of Edinburgh
- Arshad, R, Closs, A and Stead, J (1999) *Doing Our Best: Scottish School Education, Refugee Pupils and Parents: A Strategy for Social Inclusion*, CERES, University of Edinburgh
- Arshad, R and Pattie, I (1994) *Meeting the needs of pre-five black/minority ethnic children in Central Region*, CERES, Moray House Institute of Education, Edinburgh
- Arshad, R and Almeida Diniz, F (1999) *Race Equality in Scottish Education*. In T.G.J.K. Bryce and W.M. Humes (eds) *Scottish Education*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press
- Arshad, R and Syed, R (2001) *Black/minority ethnic parental perspectives of their children's experiences of education in Scotland*, CERES, University of Edinburgh

- Bakshi, N (1992) *'A personal perspective'*. In *Conference Report: The 5-14 programme and the elimination of racial discrimination in Scottish schools*, CERES, Moray House Institute of Education, Edinburgh
- Bamford, C (1990) *Barriers to adult learning for minority ethnic communities*, Scottish Institute of Adult and Continuing Education (SIACE), University of Dundee
- Bell, A (1990) *Aspects of Racism in Scotland*, Moray House Institute of Education, Edinburgh
- Bell, A and Elkind, L (1997) *Equal opportunities in professional education and training: provision made in higher education Scotland in the fields of teaching, social work and community education*, Department of Professional Development and Community Education, Moray House Institute of Education, Edinburgh
- Borthwick, C (1999) *Racism in Edinburgh and Lothians Secondary Schools*, Edinburgh: Edinburgh and Lothians Racial Equality Council
- Brown, A (1994) *Equality Issues in Scotland: A Research Review*, Manchester: Equal Opportunities Commission
- Cameron, E (1995) *Educational needs analysis of the black and ethnic communities in the North of Scotland*, Aberdeen: North of Scotland Learning Support Network for Minority Ethnic Communities
- Carroll, L and Jordan, E (1995) *Secondary Age Showground Pupils: Attendance and drop-out rates at four Glasgow School*, Scottish Traveller Education Programme (STEP), Department of Professional Development & Community Education, Moray House Institute of Education, Edinburgh
- Carter, J, Fenton, S and Modood, T (1999) *Ethnicity and Employment in Higher Education*, London: Policy Studies Institute
- Cavers, D and Chetwynd, R (2000) *Black Mentoring Project*, Edinburgh Telford College, Edinburgh
- Centre for Education for Racial Equality in Scotland (1999) *Survey of Community Language Provision in Scottish Local Authorities: Bilingualism, Community Languages and Scottish Education*, CERES, University of Edinburgh
- Chang, C.P. (2000) *Policy and Practice in Supporting Chinese Families of Children with Special Educational Needs*. M.Ed Dissertation, University of Edinburgh
- Cheung, A S Y (1995) *The attitudes of ethnic Chinese children towards the Chinese language in Central Scotland*. B.Ed Dissertation, University of Stirling
- Chow, M P S (1994) *Cultural maintenance: a study of a group of Chinese in Central Region*. B.Ed Project. Department of Education, University of Stirling

Clayton, P M (1995) *Ethnic minorities and access to adult education*, Department of Adult and Continuing Education, University of Glasgow.

Clayton, P M et al (2001) *Development of European concepts concerning recognition of prior qualifications and competencies in the vocational training of immigrant women*, Department of Adult and Continuing Education, University of Glasgow.

Closs, A, Stead, J and Arshad, R (1999) *The School Experience of Refugee Children in Scotland*, Department of Equity Studies and Special Education, University of Edinburgh.

Closs, A, Stead, J and Arshad, R (2000) *School experiences of refugee children in Scottish schools*, (<http://www.scre.ac.uk/spotlight/spotlight74.html>).

Commission for Racial Equality (1996) *Special Educational Need Assessment in Strathclyde Region*, London: CRE

Commission for Racial Equality (1997) *Special Educational Need Assessment in Strathclyde Region: A Year On*, London: CRE

Curnyn, J, Wallace, I., Kistan, S. and Maclaren, M (1991) 'Special Educational Need and Ethnic Minority Pupils' In *Professional Development Initiatives 1989-1990*, Edinburgh: Scottish Education Department

Deponio, P, Landon, J, Mullin, K. and Reid, G (2000) 'An audit of the processes involved in identifying and assessing bilingual learners suspected of being dyslexic: a Scottish study' In *Dyslexia: International Journal of Research and Practice*

Dickson, A (1995) *Positive action in community education: strategy for employing black and ethnic minorities*, East Dunbartonshire: Community Education Service

Dodd, D, Kilgallon, L and Joyce, T (2000a) *Action/Research Report on activities carried out from May to September 2000: Report A: A survey of young Gypsy Travellers' experiences of social exclusion*, Edinburgh: Community Education Department, City of Edinburgh Council

Dodd, D, Kilgallon, L and Joyce, T (2000b) *Action/Research Report on activities carried out from May to September 2000: Report B: A study of some voluntary and statutory provision for youth literacy in Edinburgh*, Edinburgh: Community Education Department, City of Edinburgh Council

Dodd, D, Kilgallon, L and Joyce, T (2000c) *Action/Research Report on activities carried out from May to September 2000: Report C: An account by the Youth Worker of youth activities carried out during the pilot project, including literacy provision using ICT. A summary of in-depth interviews of young Gypsy Travellers' views and experiences of discrimination*, Edinburgh: Community Education Department, City of Edinburgh Council

Drysdale, I (1999) *Bilingual Pupils in Glasgow Schools: Are the schools providing the best possible educational opportunities for their success?* MEd Dissertation, Faculty of Education, University of Strathclyde

EAL Service (2001) *Summary Report of several projects on raising attainment of bilingual pupils in secondary schools*, Edinburgh: EAL Service, City of Edinburgh Council

EIS (1999) *Anti-Racism and Education: Breaking Down the Barriers*, Edinburgh: Educational Institute of Scotland

Evans, F, Jordan, E and Danaher P (1999) *Scottish Show Travellers: views on school education*, STEP, University of Edinburgh.

Evans, F (1999) *Show/Fairground Families' Views on Education*, BEd Dissertation, Community Education, University of Edinburgh.

Finlay, A C (1992) *Factors influencing the retention and progression of immigrant Asian women in adult and continuing education*. MEd Dissertation, Institute of Educational Studies, University of Glasgow

Gearns, J (1997) *Language usage in minority ethnic families*, Moray House Institute of Education, Edinburgh

Glasgow Education Services (1999) *Language support for bilingual pupils*, Glasgow: Education Services, Glasgow City Council

Gordon, S. (1998) *Meeting the religious, personal and social needs of Muslim children in Scottish primary schools*, Aberdeen Campus, Northern College

Hamilton, J Donald, P and Gosling S (1995) *No problem here* (http://www.scre.ac.uk/spotlight/spotlight_54.html), Stirling: Central Regional Council/University of Stirling

Hampton, K (1998) *Youth and Racism*, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

Hampton, K, Troup, G and Walsh, D (1997) *Increasing access to higher education in Glasgow for ethnic minority students. Report 2: The Empirical Findings*, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

Hawkes, N (1994) *Race and education in Scotland*, In *European Journal of Intercultural Studies* 5, 2: 47-58

Hemming, H and Saeed, A (1995) *Religious Education for Muslims: Opinions from second generation Pakistani Muslims in Scotland*, Applied Social Studies Department, University of Paisley

Hendry, L (2000) *An investigation into the educational provision for Traveller children*. BEd Dissertation, University of Aberdeen

- Howe, C, O'Connor, R and Warden, D (2004) *A longitudinal investigation of the experiences and expectations of racism and discrimination in young people of majority and minority cultures*, Glasgow: Glasgow Anti-Racist Alliance
- Hussain, T and Pimm, N I (1994) *Black and ethnic minority needs audit project - Kilmarnock and Loudoun area*, Ayr: Community Education, Ayr Division, Strathclyde Regional Council
- Hwang, H S (2001) *The Influence of Cultural Values on British and Chinese Mothers' Beliefs of Children's Education*. MSc Dissertation, University of Edinburgh
- Irvine, C and Rice, C (2000) *The Glasgow ESOL Survey 2000 Report*, Glasgow: Scottish Enterprise
- Jiwa, S (1993) *Mother tongue learning: a study of the learning needs of the Pakistani, Indian and Bangladeshi communities in Edinburgh*, Centre for Continuing Education, University of Edinburgh
- Johnston, B (1999) *Racism in schools*, Glasgow Caledonian University
- Jordan, E Moura, A, Pinto, G and Botke, J (1998) *DISCO-ED. Discontinuity in Learning for Interrupted Learners*, STEP, University of Edinburgh
- Jordan, E (2001) *Provision for Travellers: a review of Traveller Education Services*, STEP, University of Edinburgh
- Jordan, E (forthcoming) *Attainment of Travellers in Scottish schools*, STEP, University of Edinburgh
- Jordan, E (1993) *Review of provision for Traveller education*, STEP, University of Edinburgh
- Jordan, E (1997) *Review of policy and practice in Traveller education services*, STEP, University of Edinburgh
- Jordan, E, Lloyd, G, Norris, C and Stead, J (1999) *Travellers at school: The experiences of parents, pupils and teachers*, STEP, University of Edinburgh
- Jordan, E (1998) *Travellers in Scottish Schools*, STEP, University of Edinburgh
- Jordan, E and Padfield, P (forthcoming) *Attendance Patterns of Travellers in local authority education provision*, STEP, University of Edinburgh
- Kaifi, R (1993) *Special Educational Needs of Asian Pupils* MA Dissertation, Department of Psychology, University of Dundee
- Kennedy, C (1996) *Schooling and ethnic background*. MEd Dissertation, Glasgow: University of Glasgow/Glasgow City Council.
- Kiddle, C and Jordan E (1999) *Scottish Show Travellers: an oral history approach*, STEP, University of Edinburgh

- Lanarkshire Careers Service (1998) *Parents in Partnership*, Lanark: Lanarkshire Division, Strathclyde Regional Council
- Lloyd, M, Morran, R and Bancroft, A (1996) *Right to Roam*, Edinburgh: Save the Children
- Lo, Elton K C (1993) *Friendship and education: a study of some Chinese children in Central Region* BEd Dissertation, Department of Education, University of Stirling
- Mackenzie, J. (1998) *Parental attitudes towards the provision of other world religions in the Isle of Lewis*, Northern College, Aberdeen Campus
- Macpherson, Sir W (1999) *The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Report*, London: HMSO
- McKinney, R (2001) *Learning and Education Issues in the Scottish Gypsy Traveller Community*, Edinburgh: Scottish Travellers Consortium
- Milburn, T and Yusuf, T (2001) *Community and youth groups - current provision for black and minority ethnic young people*, Centre for Youthwork Studies, University of Strathclyde
- Mirza, A (1997) *Sex education: a comparative study of the perceptions, attitudes and sexual health needs of Pakistani, Indian and white secondary school children*, Department of Public Health, University of Glasgow
- Murray, J and Closs, A (2000) *An Ethos of Achievement*, Faculty of Education, University of Edinburgh
- Padfield, P and Jordan, E (2001) *Interrupted Learning: laptops and their communicative possibilities*, STEP, University of Edinburgh
- Pal, D (1994) *Research and development in community languages*, Stirling: Central Regional Council Education Services
- Paterson, L (2000a) Catholic education and Scottish democracy, In *Journal of Education and Christian Belief* 4, pp 37-49
- Paterson, L (2000b) *Salvation through education? The changing social status of Scottish Catholics*. In T.M. Devine (ed), *Scotland's Shame? Bigotry, Sectarianism and Catholicism in Modern Scotland*, Edinburgh: Mainstream
- Paterson, L (2000c) *The social class of Catholics in Scotland*. In *Statistics in Society. Journal of the Royal Statistical Society (Series A)* 163: pp 363-379
- Peters, M (2000) *Barriers to Learning*, Glasgow College of Building and Printing
- Powney, J McPake, J, Hall, S and Lyall, L (1998) *Education of minority ethnic groups in Scotland - A review of research*, Edinburgh: Scottish Council for Research in Education, University of Edinburgh
- Quinn, E (1995) *Professional Updating for minority ethnic groups: course report and evaluation*, Continuing Education Centre, University of Strathclyde

Sarkar, R (2001) *Teaching of Asian Mother Tongues in Scottish Schools. An analysis of their roles in cognitive, social and personal development*. PhD Thesis, Faculty of Education, University of Glasgow

Save the Children / Scottish Refugee Council (2000) *I didn't come here for fun*, Edinburgh: Save the Children/ Scottish Refugee Council

Sharp, S and FitzPatrick, J (1991) *Attainment of ESL candidates in SCE examinations*, Edinburgh: Scottish Office Education Department

Shorter, H (2002) *Home Language Literacy and Attainment*, University of Edinburgh

Simpson, E (2000) *Raising the attainment of bilingual students in secondary schools*, Edinburgh: EAL Service, City of Edinburgh Council

Simpson, E (2001) *Raising attainment through support for transition at P7-S1*, Edinburgh: EAL Service, City of Edinburgh Council

Smyth, G (2000) *'I Feel This Challenge But I Don't Have The Background': Mainstream teachers teaching bilingual pupils*, Faculty of Education, University of Strathclyde

Smyth, G and McKee, T (1996) *MCARE policies in two teacher education institutes*, Faculty of Education, University of Strathclyde

Strathclyde Education Department (1996) *Hamilton parental participation project*, Lanark: Lanark Division, Strathclyde Regional Council

Stronach, I (1995) *Action research against racism in a mainly white area*, University of Stirling

Thorpe, F (1992) *Providing English language support for speakers of other languages*, Stevenson College, Edinburgh

Walsh, D, Hampton, K and Bain, J (1995) *Increasing access to higher education in Glasgow for ethnic minority students. Report 1: A Review of Literature and Statistics*, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

Weir, J (1992) *Black and ethnic minority people and access to vocational training*, Glasgow: Scottish Enterprise

Weir, J and Matheson, P (1988) *Language Matters? Teaching English as a Second Language and other Community Languages to Adults Provision in Scotland: An Initial Survey*. National Association for Teaching English and other Community Languages to Adults (NATECLA), Scottish Branch

CHAPTER FOUR RACE AND SOCIAL CARE

INTRODUCTION

4.1 Alongside the Race Relations Act 1976 and the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, several pieces of legislation are relevant to the provision of social care services to minority ethnic communities in Scotland. The NHS and Community Care Act 1990 fundamentally altered the provision of health and welfare services. The Government White Paper, *Caring for People: Community Care in the Next Decade and Beyond* (1989) which preceded it, outlined the aim of the Government for community care to promote choice and independence and

“enable people to live in their own homes or in a homely setting in the community, wherever possible and to promote independence and choice.”
(Department of Health, 1989:4)

4.2 With particular reference to minority ethnic people, *Caring for People* acknowledged that they might have particular needs, problems and concepts of community care, and recognised the need for them to be involved in the planning process. The need for full consultation with minority ethnic communities and assessment of their needs has been more recently emphasised (Department of Health Social Services Inspectorate, 1998).

4.3 Three other pieces of legislation are relevant. A new recognition of the role played by informal carers led to the passing of The Carers Recognition and Services Act 1995. This requires local authorities to undertake an independent assessment of the needs of carers. Representing a significant consolidation and revision of Scottish children’s legislation, the Children (Scotland) Act 1995 largely replaces the Social Work (Scotland) Act 1968 for children. It brings in new requirements to provide services for ‘children in need’ and specific provision for children with disabilities. Significantly, it also introduces new duties “to have regard to children’s religious persuasion, racial origin, and cultural and linguistic backgrounds.” The Regulation of Care (Scotland) Act 2001 aims to improve the standards of care through the setting up of two new bodies to regulate and inspect service providers and the workforce. Services will be inspected against a set of National Care Standards, which will be published in November 2001. The care standards group has accepted the need for the provision of equitable and inclusive services and as a result the legislation will, over a period of time, influence the quality and provision of services.

4.4 In this chapter, we consider research that considers the experiences of a diverse group of minority ethnic groups, including refugees, asylum-seekers, and Gypsy Travellers, in relation to social care services. A wide range of social care services are considered including those provided by local authority services, in particular Social Work Departments, and voluntary sector organisations. These services are intended to serve the needs of a wide range of people, including young children, older people, disabled people and carers. Mental health services are discussed in the Chapter on Race and Health while services for those escaping from domestic violence are discussed in the Chapter on Race and Access to Justice.

4.5 We begin by examining statistical sources, which are relevant to the use of minority ethnic people's use of social care services. We then consider those studies that examine the experiences of diverse groups of minority ethnic people in relation to social care. Next, we consider research that examines access to local authority services, particularly studies that are concerned with the policy and practice of social work departments. We then consider issues related to the services provided by the voluntary sector, including the black voluntary sector. Issues of multiple discrimination and the benefits of mainstreaming and multi-agency working will then be considered. Finally, an overview of the research, identifying the scope, perspectives employed and funding of the studies is provided. Key themes, identified gaps and recommendations are also summarised.

STATISTICAL SOURCES

4.6 Statistical data relevant to the study of social care among minority ethnic people include that which is related to their age and household structure, their ability to access services and their use of services.

Age structure, household structure and relevance of services

4.7 The younger age structure (56% of minority ethnic people were aged under 35 compared to 36.5% of the white population) and the larger proportion of children in these communities (38% of children were aged 15 or less, compared to 22% of the white population) (Scottish Office, 1991) suggests that the provision of culturally sensitive social care services for young people is particularly relevant. However, it is worth noting that there are differences in the ethnic minority households, with Indian and Pakistani households being more likely to have children than Chinese households.

4.8 The household structure of minority ethnic families is clearly of relevance to the planning and implementation of community care policies. This gives us some indication of the nature and level of informal care which is likely to be available to those in need of support, and who are 'in the community'. The average household size of ethnic minority households is larger, since they are more likely to be multi-generational households containing individuals from all three age bands (0-15, 16-54 and 55+) (9 %) than white households (1%). A smaller proportion of households are pensioner only households (1% and 24%) (Scottish Office, 1991). Again, there is some diversity between the three main groups, with Chinese households being more likely to be smaller, due to the lesser likelihood of having children, and a slightly greater number of non-pensioner single households (Bailey et al, 1997). This suggests that older people from these communities are less likely to live on their own, and are more likely to be able to draw from informal support from other people in the same household. However, although the presence of multi-generational households may ensure some support for the older people, this has to be seen in the context of the care that has to be provided to dependent children in the same households.

Extent of poverty and need for social care services

4.9 The chapter on Race and Poverty highlights the scarcity of Scottish-based statistical data on minority ethnic groups and poverty; the data available tends to be of variable quality and inconsistent in its coverage of minority ethnic groups and regions within Scotland (Brown, 2000). However, indicators of poverty and deprivation among some minority ethnic communities include statistical evidence of higher unemployment rates (highest among Pakistanis and lowest among Chinese), low pay (Scottish Office, 1991) and the high proportion of Below Tolerable Standard housing occupied by minority ethnic people (Littlewood and Kearns, 1998). These data suggest a limited ability to draw on the private sector where informal care from family members is either not available or insufficient.

Employment patterns, language resources and access to services

4.10 While these are more fully discussed in the chapter on Employment and Enterprise, here it is worth noting the high rates of self-employment and the restriction of employment to certain sectors, which often entail long and unsociable working hours (Scottish Office, 1991). Such patterns also have obvious implications for the ease with which social care services can be accessed.

4.11 The 1991 Scottish Office Survey also uncovered variations in the languages which were fluently spoken and read between ethnic groups, men and women, and younger and older people, in particular fluency, and ability to read in English. Although the languages that were best spoken and read by each minority ethnic group were not reported, these findings suggest that the means through which information about the nature and extent of available services is communicated to minority ethnic groups have to be carefully considered.

Spatial distribution of population and design of services

4.12 Analysis of the Census data reveals that the minority ethnic population is predominantly urban. However, both the Chinese and Pakistani communities are dispersed across Scotland, with the Chinese being present in every single local authority area in Scotland (Bailey et al, 1994, 1995). These findings have obvious implications for the design and delivery of social care services in rural areas.

Availability of ethnically disaggregated data for social care provision

4.13 The publication, *Equality in Scotland: Guide to Data Sources* (Scottish Executive, 2000a) indicates that data on ethnicity is not routinely collected in a number of surveys which are relevant to social care provision. This includes the Residential Care Home survey, the Home Care survey, Day services for adults survey and the Survey of Children's Residential Homes (Scottish Executive, 2000). As a result, we do not have information on the numbers of minority ethnic adults who receive residential care, benefit from home care or use day services. Information on the number of children who are in residential care homes is also not available although the number of minority ethnic children who are 'looked after' is recorded.

Availability of ethnically disaggregated data for incidence of disability

4.14 The same publication cited above indicates that the numbers of people who are registered blind or partially blind, is not ethnically disaggregated. It omits to mention the extent to which data on other forms of sensory or other impairments and disabilities is ethnically disaggregated.

EXPERIENCES OF PARTICULAR GROUPS IN RELATION TO SOCIAL CARE SERVICES

4.15 In this section, we consider those studies that have examined the experiences of selected groups of minority ethnic people: older people, carers, young people, community-based groups, religious groups, refugees and asylum-seekers, and Gypsy Travellers.

Studies of older people

4.16 Older people, considered in five studies have been the subject of considerable research attention (Bhatnagar, 1994; Bowes and Dar, 1997, 2000a; Bowes and MacDonald, 2000; Chakrabarti and Cadman, 1997; Patel, 1999). Bowes and Dar's 1997 study considers Pakistani elders' access to welfare services while their (2000a) study explores the home support needs and services available to a more diverse group of South Asian elders. Bhatnagar's study investigates the information and advice needs of older people from Indian, Pakistani, Bangladeshi and Mauritian communities at MILAN, a welfare project for older people. Perspectives on long term care are by black and ethnic minority elders based on a series of seminars organised in Edinburgh, Leeds and London, are examined by Patel within the context provided by other research studies (1999). While considerable attention has been paid to the needs of older people from the Asian communities, less is known about those from other communities, resulting in an uneven coverage of older people in minority ethnic communities.

4.17 Among the main themes which have emerged are:

- high levels of unmet and hidden need
- low levels of knowledge of existing services
- other difficulties in accessing services, such as difficulties in communication and ineffective referral systems
- low use of home support services
- the lack of culturally sensitive services

In their comparative study, Bowes and MacDonald (2000) found a lower level of knowledge and use of domiciliary services among their minority ethnic respondents than a white sample. This concurred with the findings of another comparative study (McFarland et al, 1994), which contrasted a more diverse group of minority ethnic people against a control group. Only one

study found that minority ethnic elders generally had a positive view of social work, which was related to the efforts that the department had made in terms of reaching out to the communities (Chakrabarti and Cadman, 1997).

4.18 Many of the above studies define older people as those above 50, recognising that the onset of age-related illnesses among people in these communities occurs earlier due to ill health and poor social and economic conditions. Several studies point out that the extent of unmet need which has already been noted in relation to a wide range of social care services is likely to increase as the population of minority ethnic people ages, unless measures are taken to address this. Related to this, the needs and experiences of minority ethnic older people in residential care as a specific focus of research interest appears to have been largely overlooked, although the problems encountered by those who use such services have been observed (Anderson and Brownlie, 1997; Netto, 1996).

Studies on dementia among older people

4.19 Three studies (Anderson and Brownlie, 1997; Scott, 1998; Patel et al, 1998) focus on a particular group of elders, those with dementia, whose needs appear to have been largely neglected in service planning and delivery. Patel's study investigates the provision of dementia care for minority ethnic elders in three European countries (Denmark, France and the UK) and includes material collected in Scotland. Scott's study is part of a European Initiative stimulated by the Scientific Institute of the German Medical Association (Wissenschaftliches Institut der Arzte Deutschlands).

4.20 Drawing from a variety of sources, all three studies incorporate case study approaches to reveal how the lack of culturally sensitive services exacerbates the confusion and anxiety experienced by dementia sufferers. Some of the case studies include people from minority ethnic communities who rarely figure in research: a Jamaican man in Anderson and Brownlie's study and three members of the Polish community in Scott's study. Scott's (1998) study concurs with Anderson and Brownlie's (1997) study in pointing out that there is little knowledge of the incidence of dementia among minority ethnic elders and a 'pressing need' for investigation. There is little evidence of transcultural assessments being used, making diagnosis of dementia difficult.

Studies of carers of disabled people and older people

4.21 Two studies have emerged which consider the perspective of carers of disabled children and older people, respectively (Craze and Razaq, 1995; Netto, 1996). The first focuses on the needs of mainly Punjabi-speaking Pakistani carers while the second includes Indians, Pakistanis and Chinese, and a small number of Afro-Caribbean and Bangladeshi carers. Yet another study considers the services available to Chinese carers of children with special needs along with these children (Neoh, 2000). Other studies consider the needs of carers of older people along with older people (Anderson and Brownlie, 1997; Chakrabarti and Cadman, 1997).

4.22 The emergent themes from these studies relate to:

- carers' lack of information on the nature and extent of the disability
- the failure of statutory organisations to publicise their services to minority ethnic carers
- limitations in the availability of informal care and inability of statutory services to meet the needs of the family
- the reliance of such families on the support available to them from black-led voluntary sector organisations
- the need for partnership and joint-working
- the need for consultation with users and carers

Netto (1996) argues that while minority ethnic carers have much in common with white carers, they are confronted with particular difficulties. These relate to the lack of services which are specifically targeted to their needs, as well as the needs of the person they are caring for. Contrary to the widespread belief of the existence of a supportive extended family, the study found that many carers had limited support from others.

4.23 Within a broader context, in which it is recognised that appropriate respite services for all carers are inadequate, the absence of such services for minority ethnic carers is a particular concern. A study of 45 carers in the Edinburgh and Lothian region was not able to identify a single carer who had used respite services. Further, a large proportion of these carers had not even heard of such services (Netto, 1998).

Studies of children and young people

4.24 Given the younger age structure of the minority ethnic population as evidenced by statistical data, it is surprising that scant attention has been paid to the needs of children, and young people. Singh and Patel (1998)'s study was based on a postal survey of social work departments and voluntary organisations across Scotland. The authors found a small number of black children who were being 'looked after' or 'accommodated' away from their own home and expressed concerns about how issues of heritage and racism were attended to, while they were away from their families. Given the separation of these children from their community, Singh and Patel question whether and by what means needs arising from racial origin, religious persuasion and linguistic and cultural background are assessed and met. No specific research on child abuse and subsequent outcomes, and the outcomes of children who appear before a children's hearing have been identified.

4.25 Racism as experienced by young people, is the subject of Hampton's (1998a) Glasgow-based study of 83 young people, from Asian, Chinese and African-Caribbean backgrounds, aged between 12 and 20. Experiences of racism were varied with name-calling perceived to be the most common and regular form of racism, which was exacerbated by the fact that this was not taken seriously by those in authority. The majority of participants were dissatisfied with their exclusion from the planning and implementation of mainstream youth activities, which they perceived to be related to their ethnicity, age and gender. The need for direct and meaningful involvement in the design, implementation and monitoring of anti-racist

activities was also strongly felt. A qualitative analysis of adoption for children from ethnic minorities in Lothian has also been carried out (Murray, J, 1997).

Studies of and by community-based groups

4.26 Wardhaugh (1991) examines the processes involved in the formation of two Asian women's self-help groups, as well the issues addressed by these groups, including welfare benefits, housing, racial harassment and domestic violence. A few studies have been undertaken by community-based groups (Murray, 1991; Wardhaugh, 1991; Aberdeen Women's Centre, 1995; Lee et al, 1996; Black Community Development Project (BCDP), 1998). The needs of black and minority ethnic women in the Grampian region are examined by the Aberdeen Women's Centre (1995). A study on global awareness raising in black and minority ethnic communities has also been undertaken (Khan, 1999).

4.27 The studies of both Lee et al and BCDP were based on extensive surveys of black people living in the areas in which the groups were based (in the Westerhailes and Pilton areas of Edinburgh, respectively), with Lee et al covering about 90% of the local population. Both studies found that racism and discrimination resulted in poor housing conditions, high levels of unemployment, low benefit take-up, high levels of racial harassment, and a lack of representation in community-based structures. Widespread poverty and isolation leading to health problems were also highlighted.

Studies of faith communities

4.28 The relationship between services to children and religion was the subject of a study undertaken by Children in Scotland (Millen, 2000). Including all faith communities, a particular issue was the extent to which minority religious beliefs were acknowledged and met within mainstream services; many service providers felt that although minorities had an 'entitlement' to experiencing their faith and culture through education, many did not have this opportunity. The services that were the subject of the study were those which provided adoption and fostering, education and non-statutory social support (e.g. services to young people who were affected by HIV/AIDS). Among the key themes emerging from the study are:

- the changing nature of faith communities within a rapidly changing society
- whether it is possible to offer a 'secular service based on religious ethos', which is related to fundamental values of civility, respect, love and acceptance

4.29 Two studies have been identified on the specific needs of particular religious groups, Muslim women (Glasgow University/Muslim Network, 1995) and the Jewish community (Samuel and Pearson, 1999). The former observed that a high percentage of women felt discriminated against because of their religion and that there was a high demand for Muslim women specific services in the areas of social work, leisure and health. The latter emphasises the importance of planning housing, care and support services which take into account the cultural and religious needs of an ageing community, who were increasingly living apart from their family.

Studies of specific ethnic groups

4.30 A small number of studies considering the circumstances of particular ethnic groups living in Scotland have been identified. These include studies of the Chinese (Bailey et al, 1994), Pakistanis (Bailey et al, 1995) and African-Caribbean communities (Hampton, 1998b). Additionally, two conference reports compile information on the African experience of living in Scotland (University of Aberdeen, 1997; African Women's Group, 1998). Collectively, these studies reveal the particularity and diversity of the circumstances of each of Scotland's minority ethnic groups. However, common experiences, such as racial discrimination and harassment, and the lack of culturally sensitive services, are also revealed.

Experiences of Gypsy Travellers

4.31 The report of the ninth Advisory Committee on Scotland's Travelling People (Scottish Executive, 2000b) sets out a number of recommendations, including the development of an information base through seasonal counts of Gypsy Travellers undertaken by local authorities and administered by the Scottish Executive. Since then, research commissioned by the Central Research Unit and undertaken by Lomax et al (2000) has revealed considerable variation in the views of Travellers on a range of subjects. However, two key issues that emerged from the study were:

- a reduction in and changing pattern of travelling
- discrimination as a daily experience in the life of Travellers

4.32 Housing was seen as but one of many of options for accommodation, which was sometimes used temporarily for a number of reasons. The other main themes arising from the study were:

- the need for appropriate site location, design and rules
- access to and use of public services, in particular, accommodation, advice and information
- the need for culturally appropriate service delivery

Experiences of refugees

4.33 A number of studies have been conducted on refugees in Scotland: in Lothian (Walsh et al, 1994), Strathclyde (McFarland and Walsh, 1995) and Glasgow (McFarland, 1994), with the last focusing on Bosnian refugees. The experience of asylum seekers in detention in Scotland has also been considered (McFarland and Walsh, 1997), as have the restrictive policies related to refugees in a wider context (Kaye, 1995). Kelly (2000) reviews the history of migration and asylum, contrasting the current restrictionism of immigration policies in the UK with the long tradition of free emigration of Scots to other parts of the world. She argues that 'robust infrastructures of challenge' are required within Scotland to tackle all forms of racism against minorities, including refugees. Macaskill and Petrie's (2000) study is one of the few studies that consider the views of children who are refugees or asylum seekers in

Scotland. The study describes the sense of loss of children who have been forced to move from their country of origin and the difficulties they face in a new, often hostile, environment where they are racially abused and unsupported by appropriate services.

4.34 Two related conference reports were also submitted in response to this audit (Scottish Refugee Council, 1996; 1997). The Scottish Refugee Council is currently liaising with the Geography Department of the University of Dundee in relation to a proposed doctoral thesis tentatively titled 'Asylum Seekers and Refugees in the UK'.

4.35 Among the main themes which have arisen are:

- the particularity of the circumstances of refugees which is different from those of other minority ethnic communities, arising from the nature of their forced exile from their country of origin
- the difficulties associated with the uncertainties of the asylum-seeking process
- the importance of warm, secure accommodation
- the difficulties faced by refugees in securing employment, commensurate with their qualifications and experience

Recent reports that the voucher system amplifies vulnerability to scapegoating and racial harassment point to the need for further enquiry. Clearly, it is important that further research into the situation of asylum seekers, many of whom have been traumatised, is promoted.

ACCESS AND USE OF LOCAL AUTHORITY SERVICES

4.36 Seven studies undertaken by local authorities were identified; four encompass a local authority area (Chalmers, 1991; Glasgow City Council, 1993; McKechnie, 1997; Aberdeen City Council Ethnic Minorities Forum, 1999) while three focus on areas within a local authority (McFarland et al, 1994; Tayside Regional Council, 1995, 1996). East Renfrewshire Council has also conducted research leading to unpublished internal reports on Asian men and women, and Asian youth living within the local authority area (The Refahey Care Council (1999a and b).

4.37 These studies are demonstrative of local authorities' efforts to obtain information on the needs and perspectives of minority ethnic communities in relation to a broad range of services. Precise demographic data and population profiling including size, gender, age and language needs was seen by at least one local authority to be essential for the effective provision of services. Although the reported levels of satisfaction of minority ethnic people in relation to local authority services varied, some themes emerging from the studies included:

- concerns about racism and racial harassment
- unhappiness about the lack of effective action taken by local authorities and the police in response to racial harassment

- a low level of awareness of the range of local authority services
- a willingness to use services which take into account particular needs

Many of the above studies identified ways forward as a means of addressing the concerns raised, such as the setting up of new projects or posts.

Policy and practice of Social Work Departments

4.38 Several studies examine the policy and practice of social work departments (Cadman and Chakrabarti, 1991; Chakrabarti, 1991; McFarland et al, 1994; McCluskey, 1991; Singh and Patel, 1998; Bowes and Dar, 2000a). The focus of many studies which have examined the relationship between social work provision and minority ethnic people appears to have been directed mainly towards demonstrating the lower levels of knowledge and use of services among particular groups of minority ethnic people. McFarland et al (1994) comment that among their Asian and Chinese participants, the “*extent* of people’s lack of knowledge”(author’s emphasis) of social work services was surprising.

Social workers’ perceptions of the adequacy of social work provision

4.39 Considering social workers’ perceptions of minority ethnic people’s needs and uptake of services in relation to a wide range of client groups, McCluskey (1991) found that while there were individual variations, the majority perceived social work services as inappropriate and inadequate for ethnic minorities. Nine years later, in a study which covered Glasgow and Edinburgh, Bowes and Dar (2000a) found that, although a commitment to addressing the needs of minority ethnic groups was indicated in community care plans, deficiencies in service provision continued to be widely acknowledged among service providers.

Need for anti-racist approaches and equal opportunities policies

4.40 While Chakrabarti (1991) argues for the importance of incorporating anti-racist approaches in social work practice, Singh and Patel’s study (1998) highlights the lack of clear policies within most agencies and a failure to understand anti-racist practice, in relation to the focus of their study, black children. The importance of well-developed equal opportunity policies is borne out in Cadman and Chakrabarti’s (1991) comparative study of practice in two Scottish local authorities. One authority had a well-developed equal opportunities policy and the other a less well-developed policy: the latter demonstrated less knowledge, concern or interest in issues facing black people.

The importance of culturally sensitive needs assessment and systems of referral

4.41 While many studies have reported a large extent of hidden and unmet need (Netto, 1996; Anderson and Brownlie 1997; Scott, 1998; Bowes and Dar, 2000a), the key areas of needs assessment and systems of referral for minority ethnic people appear to have received little attention. In particular, further research is required to consider the extent to which the criteria for needs assessment might discriminate against minority ethnic communities to ensure that equity is achieved at this vital stage.

Need to consider the design of culturally sensitive services

4.42 The need for 'ethnically' or 'culturally sensitive' or 'appropriate' services is frequently cited in the above studies, for example, through the employment of bilingual workers and interpreters, or the provision of food which takes into account religious requirements, such as halal food for Muslim users. However, relatively less attention has been paid to how the design of existing services might be modified to take into account the particular needs of minority ethnic communities. Chakrabarti and Cadman (1997) point out that traditional models of day care may not be appropriate for elders who receive support at home, and suggests that services which encourage other members of the family to attend may be more appropriate. Similarly, Netto (1998) suggests that domiciliary sitter services, which offer carers respite, may be more appropriate than residential respite care.

Education and training of social work staff

4.43 While employment and training issues are more fully considered in the Chapter on Employment and Enterprise, here it is worth considering those studies which have been identified in relation to training for social work (Arshad and Bell, 1996; Singh, 1999; Robinson and West, 1999). Motivated by growing concern about the under-representation of black and minority ethnic entrants into social care and social work in Scotland, Singh (1999)'s study sought to obtain information about current practice, provision and initiatives, from Consortia Area Group/fora and individual institutions delivering Diploma in Social Work programmes. The study concludes that equal opportunities issues appear to be taken seriously by those involved in social work education and training, and evidence of good practice does exist. However, policies and practices which relate to the attraction, recruitment, training, support and assessment of black social work students are of 'a piecemeal fashion, fragmented in approach and uncoordinated in strategy' (Singh, 1999: 20).

4.44 An evaluation of a mentoring project for black students on the Diploma in Social Work course (Robinson and West 1999: 26) found '*some reluctance to recognise the inherent racism in Scottish society among practice teachers, tutors and students*'. Hence the need for support from a black perspective, which might be provided by a mentor. The study also identified the need for more attention to be paid to the curriculum, the role of the student on the course and on placement, and the organisational culture of placement agencies.

4.45 Cadman and Chakrabarti (1991) identified a number of training needs for social work staff (primarily white). Importantly, they argue that in order for change to occur, middle managers need to be targeted, as despite being well-placed to bring about changes in policy and practice quickly, they were unable to provide the degree of expertise and support needed. Arshad and Bell (1996) provide a number of useful recommendations for developing, providing and monitoring the impact of race equality training at all organisational levels, which are of wider relevance beyond social work departments.

Employment of social work staff from minority ethnic communities

4.46 The proportion of social work staff in Scotland of minority ethnic origin is currently unknown. However, Singh and Patel (1998) found that among those working in child-care, the majority were either in lower grades or employed part-time or on a sessional basis, and suggest that it is likely that this pattern is broadly reflected throughout the profession.

4.47 The role of black workers and their caseload are questions that are also raised by Cadman & Chakrabarti (1991) who point out that it is important not to marginalise the black worker by only allocating clients from black communities. Other studies (Bhatnagar, 1994; Anderson and Brownlie, 1997) have noted the value of recruiting workers from minority ethnic communities. However, little attention has been paid to examining the role that they will play and the means by which they can be supported in this role.

ACCESS AND USE OF VOLUNTARY SECTOR PROVISION

4.48 Voluntary organisations provide a wide range of services related to housing, education, health, employment and access to justice. However, in this section we focus on those studies that examine the role of the voluntary sector in relation to social care and welfare provision (Bhatnagar 1994; Netto 1996; Chakrabarti and Cadman, 1997; Raza, 1998; Singh and Patel 1998; Black and Ethnic Minority Infrastructure in Scotland (BEMIS), 2000; Neoh, 2000). Many of these studies have highlighted the importance of the voluntary sector in countering the discrimination that minority ethnic communities face and in providing services which would normally be within the provenance of mainstream providers.

4.49 Not surprisingly, the lack of accessibility and appropriateness of mainstream statutory sector provision to minority ethnic people and the gaps in existing provision is a common theme. In the face of limited contact with relevant statutory organisations, minority ethnic people are dependent on the support available from voluntary sector organisations, particularly those that specifically cater to their needs. For instance, Singh and Patel (1998)'s study notes that the voluntary sector is the main provider of community based non-statutory services to children from black and minority ethnic communities. This is echoed by Patel (1999) who observes that the provision of care for black and minority ethnic elders continues to reside largely in the voluntary sector.

4.50 A study conducted for the Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations investigated race equality in the Scottish voluntary sector. This concluded that although the principle of equal opportunities was widely understood (68% of the 120 organisations sampled), there was little reason to be optimistic about the implementation of such policies to benefit minority ethnic communities (McIntosh, 1996). However, the ability of mainstream voluntary agencies to effectively support users from minority ethnic communities has also been noted (Anderson and Brownlie, 1997). Two studies trace the development of such agencies in their attempts to make contact with ethnic minority communities and to meet their needs (Murray, 1991; Kohli and Craise, 1998). This audit has also identified a small number of national voluntary organisations with responsibility for social care issues who have either commissioned or conducted research on minority ethnic communities. This includes Age Concern Scotland, Barnardos, Children in Scotland and Family Mediation Scotland, and at least one local voluntary organisation, VOCAL (Voice of Carers Across Lothian).

4.51 One of these studies, Pankaj's (2001) study, examines cultural attitudes, norms and practices associated with marriage, separation and divorce in minority ethnic families in order to examine the accessibility and appropriateness of services provided by Family Mediation Scotland (FMS). The study found that while family mediation services were not in conflict with any of the cultural or religious norms of the communities concerned, there was a clear need for the service to be more flexible and adaptable to their particular needs. Significantly,

the study recommended that the FMS statement of intent should include support for partners who ‘may be considering separation’ instead of limiting its services only to ‘separating and divorced’ parents, thus pointing to the need for the design of the service to be reconsidered.

The Black Voluntary Sector

4.52 The particular strengths of the black voluntary sector as identified in several research studies already cited in this chapter include:

- its ability to provide accessible services to minority ethnic people who are aware of their existence and location
- the multi-ethnic composition of its staff, including bilingual workers, of particular importance for those who are unable to communicate in English
- knowledge and understanding of the cultural background of their clients among staff
- its willingness to provide opportunities for social interaction which lessen isolation among members of minority ethnic communities

4.53 However, a study produced by BEMIS (2000) highlights the inability of the sector to develop without adequate funding and the absence of a political voice, which is heard by the Scottish Parliament and local authorities. Significantly, it questions whether the presence of black-led voluntary organisations is the result of positive choices or the result of the failure of public bodies to provide appropriate services. The report suggests that the barriers faced by minority ethnic people in trying to access services are replicated in the barriers that minority ethnic voluntary organisations face in accessing relevant information, funding and services to support them. The limitations of black voluntary organisations are also highlighted by Patel (1999) who found that they tend to be ‘inadequately supported, maintained or expanded’.

4.54 A study commissioned by the National Lotteries Charities Board (NLCB) notes that a number of minority ethnic organisations are unaware of where they might obtain information on funding or available support for accessing funding (Patel and Singh, forthcoming). A forthcoming review of funding for the black voluntary sector commissioned by the Central Research Unit concludes that there is a need for a funding strategy that involves all funding bodies (Reid-Howie Associates, 2001). The nature of volunteering in minority ethnic communities is also the subject of a study by Hopkins and Lynn (2000). However, little attention has been paid to considering other aspects for supporting the infrastructure of black- and minority ethnic-led voluntary organisations, which would increase their political involvement.

MULTIPLE DISCRIMINATION

4.55 The interaction of discrimination on the basis of ‘race’ and age is considered in those studies that considered the position of older people in minority ethnic communities. Anderson and Brownlie highlight the generally disadvantaged position of black elders due to lack of recognition and accommodation of their particular needs in service delivery, and suggest that

those suffering dementia face yet another form of discrimination in the lack of appropriate services. Additionally, Scott (1998) highlights the need for a clear policy for dementia sufferers who may have differing forms of disability, pointing out that care should be sustained within a familiar environment.

4.56 A significant gap in research is the lack of attention paid to minority ethnic people who are disabled. A recently conducted study on children with disabilities in Scotland which was funded by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation confirms that little is known of the views of children with disabilities from minority ethnic communities (Stalker, 2000). Significantly, the studies cited in this chapter on the subject of disability are community-based (Craise and Razaq, 1995; Mahmood and Shariff, 2000; Neoh, 2000). They sought to evidence the particular problems faced by the parents of children with disabilities, who did not have equal access to the forms of support available to those in the majority population. Mahmood and Shariff's study of deaf people (2000) was the only identified study whose main focus was the experiences of disabled people.

4.57 Similarly, we have not been able to identify any specific studies that examine discrimination on the basis of gender and sexual orientation. However, it is likely that many of the findings which affect women's access and use of health services and which are considered in the chapter on Race and Health are also relevant here.

MAINSTREAMING AND MULTI-AGENCY WORKING

4.58 Chakrabarti and Cadman (1997) have raised the question of whether the provision of separate services for minority ethnic communities is the best solution. They note that there are issues as to whether such services can accommodate diverse interests, whether the costs outweigh the benefits and whether it is suitable in areas where minority ethnic communities are already responsive. Interestingly, Patel and Singh (forthcoming) found that a number of black-led agencies which catered for minority ethnic people were keen for the services to become mainstreamed and did not wish to remain separate. Pankaj (2001) also suggested that as long as services were culturally sensitive, minority ethnic people would be willing to use them and would not necessarily prefer separate provision.

4.59 The need for more effective partnership arrangements between black-led voluntary organisations and social work departments has also been highlighted (McCluskey, 1991; Bhatnagar, 1994; Brownlie and Anderson, 1997; Neoh, 2000). Bowes and Dar's study on Pakistani elders (1997) noted that the system of referrals between the community group and the Social Work Department did not work effectively. Related to this, Bhatnagar's (1994) study which was based at Milan, a community-based project for older people, suggested that a major piece of work needed to be undertaken with mainstream agencies to raise their awareness of the existence of the service and to enable them to work collaboratively. Anderson and Brownlie's study on dementia suggested a need for collaborative work between dementia projects and minority ethnic community projects in order to draw on the strengths of both. Bowes and Dar's study (2000a) also highlight the need for stronger links between different service providers, in particular, housing, health and social work.

OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH

4.60 In this section, we will summarise the research cited above in relation to the main themes that have been covered, their scope, funding, and the methodology.

Scope

4.61 With the exception of the 1991 Census and the 1991 Scottish Office Survey which covered the 4 Scottish cities, and one study which undertook a postal survey of all local authorities (Singh and Patel, 1998), all the other studies are either regional or local studies. Most of these studies were carried out either in Edinburgh or Glasgow, with a few including the Lothian and Strathclyde regions, respectively; many were motivated by the desire to call attention to existing gaps in service provision and to develop services.

4.62 Where a particular ethnic group has been the subject of research interest, the groups identified have been Pakistani or more broadly defined as South Asian. As a consequence, although a number of studies have been identified on older people, relatively less is known about the needs of those of older people of Chinese origin, and much less about those from African-Caribbean and other communities. Further, the services which have been the focus of research attention have been restricted to home support services.

Funding

4.63 The studies cited in this chapter have been funded through a variety of means. Various local authorities have been responsible for commissioning several studies. The Central Research Unit (CRU) of the Scottish Executive has commissioned at least four studies (Bowes & Dar 2000a, Bowes and MacDonald, 2000; Reid-Howie Associates, 2001; Pankaj 2001). A number of research projects have been funded by voluntary organisations, in some cases, with the support of charitable trusts, and in others, through providing staff time and administrative support (Bhatnagar, 1994; Craise and Razaq, 1995; Scott, 1998; Singh and Patel, 1998; Neoh, 2000).

4.64 Research has also been funded either entirely by universities and colleges (McFarland et al, 1994; Robinson and West, 1999) or through joint funding arrangements. For example the Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit and VOCAL funded Netto's (1996) study. The NLCB has also funded one study (Patel and Singh, forthcoming).

Methodology

4.65 The studies undertaken in this chapter are largely qualitative studies, with a few providing limited quantitative data. The majority of studies identified have been small-scale studies. A few studies have taken a comparative approach (Cadman and Chakrabarti, 1991; Hampton, 1998; Bowes and MacDonald, 2000). One of the main methods employed has been individual interviews and focus group discussions in a variety of settings. In the former, semi-structured questionnaires have been used, while in the latter, topic guides have facilitated the discussions. Interviews and focus group discussions have been mainly carried out through

bilingual field workers and researchers, although at least one study has also employed trained interpreters (Netto, 1996). The studies on dementia have drawn material from a variety of sources, including the case study approach. Three studies used postal questionnaires (Cadman & Chakrabarti 1991, Arshad & Bell 1996, Singh & Patel 1998). Two studies have reflected on the nature of the research process and its implications (Bowes, 1996; Bowes and Dar, 2000b).

4.66 Most of these studies can be described as action-oriented, characterised by a concern for articulating the views of users or potential users of services, institutional functioning and the monitoring of policy implementation. Inclusion of the perspectives of users (potential and actual) are seen as key to this process, particularly since many of these studies are motivated by the desire to call attention to the lack of accessibility and appropriateness of current services, and to highlight gaps in provision.

RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Main Themes	Identified Gaps	Recommendations
<p>Research attention has focused on the experiences of diverse minority ethnic groups. The specificity of their circumstances emerges as a central theme, and with it, the need for responsive social care services.</p> <p>Studies conducted by some local authorities reveal concerns about racism and racial harassment, low levels of awareness of existing services but a willingness to use culturally sensitive services. Other studies show social work provision for minority ethnic people to be inaccessible and inappropriate.</p>	<p>There is a lack of systematic evaluation of the extent to which social work departments implement their statutory responsibilities towards a diverse multi-ethnic population.</p> <p>Statistical data on minority ethnic people's use of home support and residential services is not available.</p> <p>The extent to which social work department staff are ethnically representative of the population is also not known.</p>	<p>A national audit of social work department policy and practice with regard to race equality would provide greater insight and aid the future planning of services. This should include scrutiny of equal opportunities policy and practice, information and publicity about service availability, ethnic monitoring of services, employment practice and training of staff.</p>
<p>Research has tended to concentrate on knowledge and use of existing social care services.</p> <p>Although community care guidelines highlight the importance of consulting with minority ethnic people in planning appropriate services, the effectiveness of these consultative mechanisms has not been evaluated.</p>	<p>Little consideration has been given as to how the design of existing services can be enhanced.</p> <p>The extent to which needs assessment criteria are valid and reliable for all sections of the population does not appear to have been systematically evaluated.</p>	<p>The effectiveness of consultation mechanisms designed to involved minority ethnic people in service planning should be evaluated.</p> <p>A study into the design of culturally sensitive services could inform the development of more appropriate service provision.</p> <p>The reliability and validity of needs assessment criteria for minority ethnic people should be the subject of scrutiny.</p>
<p>Studies on minority ethnic elders have revealed high levels of unmet and hidden need, low levels of knowledge and use of services, difficulties in communication, ineffective referral systems, and the lack of culturally sensitive services.</p> <p>These studies have tended to largely focus on South Asian people and on their use of home support and day services.</p>	<p>Research undertaken involving older people tends to have been uneven in coverage in terms of ethnicity. In particular, little is known about Chinese elders and those of African descent.</p> <p>Scant attention has also been paid to the circumstances of older people in residential care.</p>	<p>Studies of older people from Chinese and African-Caribbean communities would add to our knowledge of the diversity of experiences of minority ethnic older people. These could include those living on their own; those living with members of their family and those using residential care services.</p>
<p>There is a small but growing body of research on the role played by black-led voluntary organisations that cater mainly to the needs of</p>	<p>Little attention has been paid to supporting other aspects of the development of these organisations, including</p>	<p>A study into the management development needs of black- and minority ethnic-led voluntary organisations would support the</p>

<p>minority ethnic people. These studies have tended to concentrate on funding issues.</p>	<p>management development needs, and means of increasing their political involvement.</p>	<p>vital role played by these organisations.</p>
<p>Limited research on disability has been funded by community-based organisations and has focused on the perspectives of carers. These studies highlight limitations in informal care, considerable hidden and unmet need, and a lack of appropriate services for minority ethnic disabled people.</p>	<p>Little is known about the experiences of disabled people from minority ethnic communities.</p> <p>The extent to which sensory and other forms of impairment and disability are ethnically monitored is currently not known.</p>	<p>A review of research, policy and practice in Scotland on the experiences of disabled people from minority ethnic communities is a priority. This should include a review of social work department practice as well as that of national voluntary organisations led by disabled people or those working with disabled people.</p>
<p>The proportion of children in the minority ethnic population is higher than in the general population. The Children (Scotland) Act 1995 places new duties upon children's service providers.</p>	<p>Little is known about the needs and experiences of minority ethnic children in relation to a broad range of social care services.</p>	<p>A review of the accessibility and appropriateness of a range of services for minority ethnic children, including pre-school provision, children in care, fostering and adoption and provision for young people is a priority.</p>

REFERENCES

- Aberdeen City Forum (1999) *Ethnic Minorities Forum: note of meeting of the ethnic minorities forum held in the Town House, Aberdeen*
- Aberdeen Women's Centre (1995) *A Step forward: black and ethnic minorities women's needs in Grampian Aberdeen*: Aberdeen Women's Centre
- African Women's Group (1998) *The African Women: Her visibility and her invisibility in Scotland*. Conference report, Aberdeen: African Women's Group
- Anderson, I. and Brownlie, J. (1996) 'A neglected problem: minority ethnic elders with dementia' in A M Bowes and D F Sim (eds.) *Perspectives on Welfare* Aldershot: Ashgate
- Arshad, R. & Bell, A. (1996) *Evaluation of Racial Equality/Anti-racist training conducted in Lothian Region Social Work Department*. Edinburgh: Moray House Institute of Education
- Bailey, N, Bowes, A M and Sim, D F (1994) 'The Chinese Community in Scotland' *Scottish Geographical Magazine* Vol 110, No 2 pp 66-75
- Bailey, N, Bowes, A M and Sim, D F (1995) 'Pakistanis in Scotland: census data and research issues' *Scottish Geographical Magazine* Vol 111, No 1 pp 36-45
- Bailey, N. Bowes, A. M and Sim, D. (1997) 'The demography of minority ethnic groups in Scotland' A. M Bowes and D F Sim (eds.) *Perspectives on Welfare* Aldershot: Ashgate:
- Bhatnagar, A. (1994) *Report on Information and advice needs of older people from Indian, Pakistani, Bangladeshi, and Mauritian communities*. Edinburgh: MILAN Senior Welfare Council
- Black and Ethnic Minority Infrastructure in Scotland, (2000) *Listening to the Voice: feasibility report*. Edinburgh: BEMIS
- Black Community Development Project (1998) *Second needs survey report*. Edinburgh: BCDP
- Bowes, A M (1996) 'Evaluating an empowering research strategy: reflections on action-research with South Asian women' *Sociological Research Online*<[mhttp://www.socresonline/1/1/1.html](http://www.socresonline/1/1/1.html)> 1,1.
- Bowes, A M and Dar, N (1997) 'The social work service and elderly Pakistani people' in A M Bowes and D F Sim (eds.) *Perspectives on Welfare* Aldershot: Ashgate
- Bowes, A M and Dar, N. (2000a) *Family Support and Community Care: A study of South Asian Older People*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive
- Bowes, A M and Dar, N (2000b) 'Researching social care for minority ethnic older people: Implications of some Scottish research' *British Journal of Social Work* Vol. 30 No 3: pp 305-321

- Bowes, A M and McDonald, C. (2000) *Support for Majority and minority ethnic groups at home – Older peoples' perspectives* (Social Work Research Findings Number 36) Scottish Executive: Edinburgh
- Brown, U. (2000). *Race, ethnicity and poverty*, Briefing Sheet 12, The Scottish Poverty Information Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University
- Cadman, M and Chakrabarti, C (1991) Social Work in a Multiracial society: A survey of practice in two Scottish local authorities in (unknown) *One Small Step Towards Racial Justice*, unknown: Central Council for Education and Training in Social Work
- Chakrabarti, M (1991) 'Anti-racist perspectives in social work' In A M Bowes and D F Sim (eds) *Demands and constraints: Ethnic Minorities and Social Services in Scotland*, Edinburgh: Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations
- Chakrabarti, M and Cadman. M. (1997) 'Minority ethnic elders in Scotland: facing the challenge' In A. M Bowes and D Sim (eds.) *Perspectives on Welfare* Aldershot: Ashgate
- Chalmers A (1991) *Race Equality in Fife*. Fife: Fife Regional Council
- Craise, L and Razaq, A (1995) *Survey of Carers' Needs*. Glasgow: Barnardos
- Department of Health (1989) *Caring for People: Community Care in the Next Decade and Beyond*. London: HMSO
- Department of Health Social Services Inspectorate (1998) *They look after their own, don't they? Inspection of Community Care Services for Black and Ethnic Minority Older People*. London: Department of Health
- Glasgow City Council (1993) *Ethnic Minority Residents' View of Council Services*. Glasgow: Glasgow City Council
- Glasgow University Centre for the Study of Child and Society and the Muslim Network (1995) *The needs of Muslim women*. Glasgow: The Muslim Network
- Hampton, K. (1998a) *Youth and Racism: Perceptions and Experiences of Young People in Glasgow*. Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University
- Hampton, K (1998b) *The needs of African-Caribbean Communities in Scotland*, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit Research Paper No. 10, Series 2. Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University
- Hopkins, V and Lynn (2000) *Active community initiative: volunteering in an urban area with a focus on ethnic minority communities* Dundee: Dundee International Women's Centre
- Kaye, R. (1995) *British Refugee and Asylum Policy: the politics of Paper No. 5, Series 2 restrictionism* Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

Kelly, E (2000) 'Asylum seekers in Scotland: Challenging racism at the heart of government' *Scottish Affairs* 33

Khan, A W (1999) *Global awareness raising through our black and local minority ethnic communities* Edinburgh: Edinburgh and Lothian Racial Equality Council

Kohli, K and Craise, L (1998) *The Apna Journey*. Glasgow: Barnardos

Lee, C, Nasra N and Egan A (1996), *Whose Community? The needs of Black and Minority Ethnic People in Wester Hailes* Edinburgh: Wester Hailes Anti-Racism Project

Littlewood, A and Kearns, A (1998) *Below Tolerable Standard Housing and Ethnicity in Glasgow* A Scottish Homes Working Paper. Edinburgh: Scottish Homes

Lomax, D, Lancaster, S and Gray, P (2000) *Moving On: A Survey of Travellers' Views* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Macaskill, S. and Petrie, M. (2000) *I didn't come here for fun—listening to the views of Children and young people who are refugees or Asylum-seekers in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Save the Children

Mahmood, S and Shariff, I (2000) *Promoting social inclusion for deaf people from a minority ethnic background* Glasgow: Deaf Connections and Greater Glasgow Primary Care NHS Trust

McCluskey, J. (1991) 'Ethnic minorities and the social work service in Glasgow'. In A M Bowes and D F Sim (eds) *Demands and constraints: Ethnic Minorities and Social Services in Scotland*, Edinburgh: Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations

McFarland, E. (1994) *Bosnian refugees in Glasgow* Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit Research Paper Number 1, Series 2, McFarland, E. (1994) *Bosnian refugees in Glasgow* Research Paper Number 1, Series 2, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

McFarland, E. Dalton, M. and Walsh, D. (1994) *Personal welfare services and ethnic minorities* Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

McFarland E and Walsh, D (1995) *Refugees in Strathclyde* Research Paper: Number 6, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

McFarland E and Walsh, D (1997) *Scotland's Forgotten Prisoners: Asylum seekers in Detention* Report Commissioned by Scottish Refugee Council. Research Paper 9 Series 2, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

McIntosh G (1996) *Beyond a Paper exercise – Black and minority ethnic communities and the Scottish Voluntary Sector*. Edinburgh: Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations

- McKechnie J (1997) *Developing race equality in West Dunbartonshire* West Dunbartonshire: West Dunbartonshire Council
- Millen, D. (2000). *The relationship between religion and services to children in Scotland* Edinburgh: Children in Scotland
- Murray, C. (1991). 'Ethnic minorities and community work: the experience of Crossroads Youth and Community Association' In A M Bowes and D F Sim (eds) *Demands and constraints: Ethnic Minorities and Social Services in Scotland*, Edinburgh: Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations
- Murray, J (1997). *Black or white? A qualitative analysis of adoption for children from ethnic minorities in Lothian* MA Social Policy, Department of Social Policy, University of Edinburgh
- Neoh, D. (2000) *Chinese children with special needs in Glasgow*. Glasgow: National Children's Home Sanjai Project
- Netto, G (1996) *No one asked me before* Edinburgh: Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit/Voice of Carers Across Lothian
- Netto, G (1998). 'I forget myself: the case for the provision of culturally sensitive respite services for minority ethnic carers of older people' *Journal of Public Health Medicine* Vol 20/2: 221-226)
- Pankaj, V (2001) *Family mediations services for minority ethnic families in Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive Central Research Unit
- Patel, N (1999) 'Black and Minority Ethnic Elderly: Perspectives on Long-Term Care' In Sutherland, S (ed.) *With Respect to Old Age: Long Term Care - Rights and Responsibilities: A Report by the Royal Commission on Long Term Care Volume 1*. London: The Stationery Office
- Patel, N, Mirza, N Lindblad, P Amstrup, K and Samaoli, O (1998) *Dementia in Minority Ethnic Older People: Managing Care in the UK, Denmark and France*, Lyme Regis: Russell House Publishing Limited
- Patel, V K P and Singh, S. (forthcoming) *Funding for a Change*. Edinburgh: National Lotteries Charities Board
- Raza, H. (1998) *Evaluating the cost-effectiveness of a welfare organisation*. Dissertation presented for honours degree in Commerce. University of Edinburgh
- Reid-Howie Associates (2001) *Funding the black voluntary sector*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive
- Robinson, C. and West, J. (1999) *Black perspectives on Direct practice in social work training* Glasgow Caledonian University

- Samuel, E and Pearson, C (1999) *The Jewish Community of Greater Glasgow: Population and Residential Patterns*. The University of Edinburgh
- Scott, H. (1998) *From the shadows into the spotlight: addressing dementia in minority ethnic groups in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Age Concern/Workers Forum for Minority Ethnic Older People:
- Scottish Executive, (2000a) *Equality in Scotland: Guide to Data Sources*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive
- Scottish Executive (2000b) *Advisory Committee on Scotland's Travelling People: Ninth Term Report 1998-99*. Edinburgh: The Scottish Executive
- Scottish Office, (1991) *Ethnic Minorities in Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Office
- Scottish Refugee Council (1996) *Safe Haven: Myth or Reality?* Refugee Conference report, Aberdeen: Scottish Refugee Council
- Scottish Refugee Council (1997) *Protection or Rejection Refugee's experience in Canada and Scotland: a report on the public meeting on the plight of refugees and asylum seekers in City Chambers, Parliament Square on 26th October 1997*, Edinburgh: Scottish Refugee Council
- Singh, S (1999) *Educating Sita: black and minority ethnic entrants into social work training in Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Anti-Racist Federation in Community Development and Social Work
- Singh, S and Patel, V K P (1998) *Regarding Scotland's Black Children* Scottish Black Workers Forum: Glasgow
- Stalker, K (2000) *Supporting disabled children and their families: A review of policy and research* Joseph Rowntree Foundation: York
- Tayside Regional Council (1995) *Hilltown Ethnic Minorities Needs Assessment* Hilltown, Dundee: Tayside Regional Council
- Tayside Regional Council (1996) *Hilltown Ethnic Minorities Needs Assessment Open Day* Hilltown, Dundee: Tayside Regional Council
- The Refahey Care Council (1999a) *Forward to Action for Ethnic Minority Communities in East Renfrewshire*, East Renfrewshire Council
- The Refahey Care Council (1999b) *Action for Ethnic Minority Youths in East Renfrewshire*, East Renfrewshire Council
- University of Aberdeen (1997) *Strangers and Citizens: the African Experience in Scotland, Conference report*, University of Aberdeen
- Walsh, D McFarland E and Hampton, K (1994) *Refugees in Lothian: the experiences and aspirations of refugees and asylum seekers in Lothian* Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University
- Wardhaugh, J (1991) 'Asian women campaigning for self-help' In A M Bowes and D F Sim (eds) *Demands and Constraints: Ethnic Minorities and Social Services in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations

CHAPTER FIVE RACE AND HEALTH

INTRODUCTION

5.1 The need to tackle inequalities in health, including those experienced by minority ethnic people is the subject of *Our Healthier Nation* (Secretary of State, 1998). In Scotland, the White Paper *Towards a Healthier Scotland* (Scottish Executive, 1999) also acknowledges that inequalities in health are linked to poverty, poor housing, education, access to the labour market and other socio-economic factors. These documents and the *Inequalities in Health* report (Acheson, 1998) provide a new framework to consider health-related issues within a broad programme of social inclusion. The recent Health Plan *Our National Health: a plan for action, a plan for change*, commits the Executive to requiring NHS Boards:

“to ensure that NHS staff are professionally and culturally equipped to meet the distinctive needs of people and family groups from ethnic minority communities.” (Scottish Executive, 2001: 53)

5.2 Further, it is anticipated that under the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, the functions of all public authorities, including health authorities, will be required not to discriminate, directly or indirectly, on racial grounds. This makes the consideration of research related to the health of minority ethnic groups, which have experienced substantial disadvantage and discrimination, particularly timely.

5.3 Important health variations between certain ethnic minority groups and the majority population have been revealed in an extensive national survey. Pakistanis and Bangladeshis reported a 50 percent greater risk of fair or poor health and Caribbeans a 30 percent greater risk. The differences between Indians and African Asians, Chinese and whites were not statistically significant (Nazroo, 1997). Morbidity data from the same survey, related to physical problems such as heart disease, hypertension, diabetes and respiratory disease, also revealed important ethnic variations. It is likely that a number of factors may contribute towards such variations. They might be an artefact resulting from the way in which data was collected, they may be the result of cultural or genetic differences between ethnic groups, or directly related to migration, racial harassment and discrimination, or socio-economic effects. There is evidence to strongly support the hypothesis that the relatively deprived socio-economic position of some ethnic minority groups, as revealed by a standard of living index, contributes to their poorer health (Nazroo, 1997, Davey Smith et al, 2000).

5.4 This chapter considers Scottish-based research on health status and health behaviour and access to health services among minority ethnic groups. It is important to highlight that the ethnic classifications that are used are those which have been employed in the studies concerned. There is considerable variation in the classifications and equivalence across studies should not be assumed.

5.5 The structure of this chapter is as follows. We begin by examining statistical sources available in this area. We then consider research on health status and behaviour. A body of work related to access and experiences of health services is then considered. This is followed by a consideration of research relating to the policy and practice of health agencies. We then consider the complementary roles of research on health status and access to health services.

Finally, an overview of the scope of the studies, perspectives employed and the funding of studies is provided. A summary of main themes, identified gaps and recommendations for future work is also included.

STATISTICAL SOURCES

5.7 Data related to the use of health service provision by minority ethnic people, including registration with a doctor, visits to the doctor, dentist, casualty or outpatient department and use of ante-natal and post-natal care are available from the 1991 Scottish Office Survey. Language difficulties are evident in visits to the doctor and the outpatient or casualty departments. Generally, women experience more problems than men and as an ethnic group, the Chinese experience particular difficulties in this area. Other differences which emerge between minority ethnic and white respondents are the lower use of the dentist compared to white householders but among those who had given birth to a baby in Britain, slightly higher use of ante-natal care and post-natal care.

5.8 Other statistical data which is ethnically disaggregated includes information collected from the Scottish Health Survey (Scottish Executive, 2000). The 1998 survey was designed to provide a nationally representative sample of the Scottish population aged between 2 and 74 living in private households and administered to more than 9,000 adults and nearly 3,900 children. Among the aims of the survey were to estimate the prevalence of particular health conditions and risk factors, to document the pattern of health-related behaviours and to monitor progress towards the Scottish health and dietary targets. Topics included general health, eating habits, physical activity, smoking, drinking, accidents, cardiovascular disease and respiratory symptoms, as well as height and weight measurement.

5.9 Other data which would be relevant but which is currently not ethnically disaggregated includes monitoring and morbidity data, the Registrar-General's death and birth certification, and the Scottish Crime Survey. Useful information from the last includes data collected on the patterns of risk and the impact on the victim of crimes of violence, housebreaking and motor vehicle crime, as well as patterns of drug use. It is encouraging that the next sweep of the Scottish Crime Survey will include a boosted sample of minority ethnic respondents.

5.10 A guide to data sources published by the Scottish Executive notes that the registration of blind persons and partially sighted persons, is not ethnically monitored (Scottish Executive, 2000). However, the document omits mention of the extent to which data on other forms of impairment or disability is ethnically disaggregated. Reports on the incidence of accidents within the home, the workplace and on the roads also do not collect information on ethnicity (Munday and Oswald (2000).

5.11 Establishing ethnic monitoring in morbidity and mortality data, and in the use of primary and secondary care services will undoubtedly facilitate research in a number of areas (Ineson and Bhopal, 2000), including ethnic variations in health status and the use of health services. Williams (pc) points out that inclusion of ethnicity and religion as variables are not only required in health-related surveys such as the Scottish Health Survey and the Registrar-General's death and birth certification, but also in other social surveys to allow analysis of inequalities in health to be explored.

HEALTH STATUS, KNOWLEDGE AND BEHAVIOUR

5.12 In this section, we will consider Scottish research that has been undertaken on health status, knowledge and behaviour, by ethnic group.

South Asian studies

5.13 Several comparative studies have been undertaken in this area, examining the extent of health disadvantage in this population in comparison to the general population. A particular interest in this area is the higher incidence of coronary heart disease (CHD). Related to this, are studies which have examined health-related behaviour such as food choice, patterns of hospitality and other related behaviour, where some comparisons have been made against another migrant group, the Italian population, which are known to have a low incidence of CHD. A third strand of enquiry has been the examination of generational continuities and changes in physical and mental health, and health-related behaviour.

Health disadvantage, length of residence and coronary heart disease

5.14 Three comparative reports have been published on a South Asian, predominantly Punjabi, population aged 30 to 40 years compared with the general population in Glasgow. The sampling method employed was designed to include Punjabis living in and outside areas of high concentration (Ecob and Williams, 1991), and consisted of equal numbers of Muslims and non-Muslims. The studies revealed that:

- South Asian men had a number of health advantages, including less long-standing diseases than the general population
- South Asian women were disadvantaged in a number of respects, reporting more chronic conditions than Glaswegian women in general
- the gender difference in the South Asian population is greater than in the majority population, particularly in regard to symptoms and chronic conditions
- patterns of health among South Asians aged 30 to 40 were consistent with patterns of hospital admission and mortality (Williams et al, 1993)
- those who had long been resident in Glasgow fared significantly worse than those who had newly arrived, and these results are unlikely to be explained by positive selection of recent immigrants (Williams, 1993d)
- the socio-economic circumstances of South Asians were worse than the general population
- perceived social support was less among South Asian women than the general population
- the only established non-biochemical risk factor related to CHD to which South Asians had less exposure than the general population was smoking

- dietary choices of the South Asian population played a contributory role but did not fully account for the higher rate of CHD
- the higher incidence of CHD in South Asian people, particularly in South Asian women, was likely to result from a complex interaction of risk factors including insulin resistance, stress and socio-economic circumstances (Williams et al, 1994).

Health-related behaviour

5.15 Several studies on health-related behaviour are related to the higher rates of CHD among South Asian people, including dietary intake and patterns of hospitality. One project has compared dietary changes in South Asian women against that of another group of migrants, Italian women, as well as the general population (Bush et al, 1995a and b; Bush et al 1996a and b; Bush et al, 1998; Williams et al, 1996 and 1998a).

5.16 A sample of South Asian women (63 born abroad, 56 in Britain) and Italian women (39 abroad, 51 in Britain), aged between 20-40, in the West of Scotland, were interviewed, physical measures taken and a 7-day weighed diary of food intake was recorded. Analysis of the results revealed:

- differences in diet, exercise, and fat deposition between South Asians, Italians and controls which were consistent with differences in rates of CHD (Williams et al 1996)
- significant differences in the attitudes of migrant South Asian and Italian women towards body size, with greater approximation among Italian women towards the attitudes of the majority population
- the views of British-born South Asian women lie somewhere in between the views of those of South Asian migrants, and the Italian and control groups (Bush at al 1996a)

5.17 Explorations of the existence of obligatory patterns of food intake and their reflection in patterns of hospitality have revealed that 'traditional family hospitality meals' play a more important part in the life of migrant South Asians and Italians than in the general population. British-born South Asians are more likely to maintain this than British-born Italians (Bush et al, 1995a and b, 1996a and b, 1998; Williams et al, 1996). Bush et al (1998) suggest that in an environment where energy-dense foods are readily available, this pattern of hospitality may result in high energy intake and increased coronary risk.

5.18 Anderson and Lean (1995) note that the traditional diet of South Asian people is generally considered healthy in cardio-protective terms, and cite dietary studies in Scotland which have indicated that South Asians' lack of retention of these eating patterns may be related to CHD. In contrast, they observe that South Asian women were undergoing a dietary change, which was in line with current advice on health. However, another study which examined dietary patterns in relation to CHD noted that South Asians were increasingly consuming high fat western foods, and although aware of the dangers to health, were reluctant to change their behaviour (Sheikh and Jiwa, 1993, cited in Munday and Oswald, 1999)

5.19 Bradby's doctoral thesis examines cultural strategies among women of South Asian origin in Glasgow with reference to health (Bradby, 1996). Young Punjabi women's use of the resources available to them to think about food and health, and the factors which influence them in making food choices are considered (Bradby, 1997). Translation issues have also been reviewed in the context of this project (Bradby, forthcoming).

Generational continuity and change

5.20 Several studies that have examined generational continuity and change in British Asian health status and health behaviour have been motivated by an interest in whether or not health disadvantage has been transmitted. Comparing the South Asian and Italian populations, Williams et al (1996) found that:

- British-born South Asians approximated the general population more closely than South Asian migrants in dietary choices, exercise and waist measure
- the South Asian population was also found to be more 'encapsulated' than the Italians in linguistic and marriage patterns and consequently more isolated from health messages.

5.21 Williams and Shams (1998) examined a wide variety of health measures and health behaviour in a sample of 334 British Asians and 490 non-Asians, all aged 14-15, and a sample of 173 British Asians aged 30-40, and 344 general population, aged 35. They found that overall, young British Asians, the majority of whom were British born, appear to have favourable health behaviour. In this group:

- differences in height are much smaller than differences among the 30-40 years old, the majority of whom were migrants, suggesting the benefits of improved nutrition and reduced coronary and diabetic risk (Shams and Williams, 1997).
- female health disadvantage is less marked than in migrants aged 30-40 (Williams and Shams, 1998)
- levels of psychological distress are lower than in the older Asian migrants (Shams and Williams, 1995)

5.22 A follow-on study of the young Asian and non-Asian people who participated in the studies just cited above when they were aged 18-19 revealed that among the Asian young people:

- levels of depression and anxiety continued to be a little higher among both Asian men and women than among the non-Asian sample (Bradby and Williams, 1998)
- abstinence from sexual behaviour before marriage among young Asian women was high and among young Asian men was moderate
- condom use among young Asian men was lower than among non-Asian young men, pointing to a failure of existing sexual health education and health services to reach them (Bradby and Williams, 1999).

Related to the last finding, a comparative study of the perceptions, attitudes and sexual health needs of Pakistani, Indian and White secondary school students has found sexual education to be insensitive to the needs of all three groups of children in Glasgow (Mirza, 1997).

5.23 Generational continuities and changes have also been examined in relationship to standard of living and social class. Williams et al (1998b) have shown that in the 1970s a class gradient in mortality was not demonstrated among South Asians. British Asians in categories from social class III non-manual downwards still have a standard of living below that of the general population, but those (particularly Sikhs and Hindus) who are owners of small businesses now have a standard of living which is equivalent to that of the general population. Evidence suggests that a standard of living gradient is being restored after a redistribution of class chances among the South Asian population in Glasgow, which had been disrupted by migration, and a corresponding health gradient is developing.

Health-related knowledge and health education needs

5.24 Kay et al's (1990) study on dental-related knowledge, beliefs and behaviours which was conducted on Asian respondents in Glasgow found low levels of knowledge about dental health and high levels of sugar intake in diet, but a high motivation towards dental hygiene. Health education has been suggested as a priority in this area.

5.25 Umeed (2000)'s study on the health needs, knowledge and self reported health status of South Asian men in Glasgow found low levels of knowledge on specific health issues such as testicular cancer, and low levels of recreational physical activity. Work-related difficulties were seen as a major contributory factor to experiences of stress. A study on the health and health education needs of young Pakistani women (Rehman, 1996) and a health survey of Asian workers in Indian restaurants in Glasgow has also been conducted (1996).

Other minority ethnic groups

5.26 A substantial body of research on the Irish population has been undertaken. This was primarily concerned with examining excess rates of mortality and morbidity, and in developing theoretical models to explain and predict Irish health in Britain (Williams, 1992a, 1993a and b, 1994a, and b, 1997; Williams and Ecob, 1999). West of Scotland has been the focus of many of these studies due to its long record of health disadvantage, pattern of heavy Irish settlement and the existence of early mortality records (Williams, 1994a, 1994b; Abbotts et al, 1997, 1998, 1999a and b). Research has found differences in mortality (Abbotts et al 1999a, 1999b) and in morbidity (Abbotts et al, 1997) between those of Irish descent and others, which are related to socio-economic factors. However, no significant differences in health behaviour (except in older smokers) or in illness behaviour between Catholics and non-Catholics have been observed (Abbotts et al, 1999b).

5.27 The health status of Chinese, African-Caribbean and other communities appears to have been largely overlooked as a focus of research interest. This is in line with research undertaken within a wider context which has found that evidence on some ethnic groups - for example, Chinese people - is extremely limited (Davey Smith et al 2000). Only one study has focused on research related to African and African-Caribbean people; this was a study which

examined the awareness and knowledge of sickle cell disease and thalassaemia among this community and 170 midwives employed in the Queen Margaret Hospital (Obike, 1998).

5.28 However, a recent review of the literature considers the needs of most of the black and minority ethnic groups in the Lothian region, including Gypsies, Travellers and refugees, with particular reference to the health inequalities framework (Munday and Oswald, 2000). Three key contexts of social circumstances - housing, poverty and transport - are considered, followed by an examination of research related to accidents, alcohol, drug use, food and health, mental health, oral health, physical activity, sexual health, smoking and violence. The review draws largely on English-based research and supplements this with Scottish-based research, including reports from various public agencies. Key findings and recommendations for each area of the inequalities framework are provided.

5.29 Stead (1996) also provides a profile of minority ethnic populations in Scotland and examines UK wide literature on these populations. Intended to assist the Health Education Board for Scotland (HEBS) in planning a programme of promotion for minority ethnic people in Scotland, the focus of this work is on research conducted in Scotland, and major UK-wide surveys and data, although some local studies conducted outside of Scotland are also included. The review gathers information from the 1991 Census, the 1991 Scottish Office Survey, mortality data, morbidity data, health behaviour and 'lifestyle', as well as studies on service use and access.

Impact of religion and religious discrimination on health and health related behaviour

5.30 Very little work has been undertaken in this area. The only studies which have been identified have considered the role of religion and religious discrimination in health and health-related behaviour in those of Irish descent (Mullen, 1992, 1994, Mullen et al, 1996; Williams, 1993c). Analysis of dietary data has also revealed differences among those born of Catholic parents or reporting current Catholic affiliation, which are less consistent with local health promotion initiatives than the general population. These have been associated with social class, and mediated by educational disadvantage (Mullen et al, 2000). The inclusion of questions in the 2001 Census which elicit information on religious background at birth and current religious affiliation is likely to stimulate further research in this area.

Concentration of research activity on certain illnesses

5.31 Bhopal (1997) has pointed out that most research into ethnicity and health has tended to focus on the diseases that are more common in the minority ethnic groups than in the white population. This distracts attention from other illnesses such as cancer and respiratory disease which are very common, but less so than in the general population. This is certainly evident in the Scottish-based research that has emerged in this audit. Extensive research has been carried out related to the higher rates of CHD in the South Asian population in Glasgow.

5.32 However, in relation to cancer, identified as the main cause of death in Scotland in 1996 and as being responsible for almost one third of deaths (Scottish Office, 1998), only one study evaluating the needs and support available to Asian women in Scotland has been identified. No studies on cerebrovascular disease, the third largest killer, have been identified.

Ongoing and future research

5.33 The objectives of ongoing and future research of the MRC Social and Public Health Sciences Unit are:

- to investigate variations in health advantage or disadvantage between the Irish, Caribbeans and South Asians over the life course, or between the migrant and British-born generations
- to establish any relationships between health advantage/disadvantage and changes in socio-economic careers
- to establish relationships between health advantage/disadvantage and the changing cultural responses within each minority (e.g. gender roles, or health behaviour) or its relation with the ethnic majority (patterns of hostility or discrimination)

This will include an analysis of the social context of greater health risk among Catholics or people of Irish descent in Glasgow, and the influence of work and family expectations on the relatively abstinent health behaviour of young Asians.

5.34 Other ongoing research includes an investigation of the cross-cultural validity of methods of measurement of alcohol and tobacco consumption, which is currently being undertaken by the Public Health Sciences Department of Community Health in the University of Edinburgh (Bhopal et al, forthcoming). The same department is also proposing an examination of ethnic variations in cardiovascular disease, which will be a UK wide study, including Scotland. Other studies currently being undertaken in the same department include a doctoral thesis on the challenge of cross-cultural comparability in survey research using the Rose Angina questionnaire and a Masters thesis that reviews blood pressure and hypertension.

5.35 A number of initiatives are currently either ongoing or being proposed. A study commissioned by Ash Scotland which investigates black and ethnic minority views on smoking is due to be completed this year (Hampton, forthcoming). A national project on diet that is related to inequalities in health is also being proposed by the Scottish Community Diet Project.

ACCESS TO AND USE OF HEALTH SERVICES

5.36 In this section, we consider a body of work that has examined the extent to which health services are accessed and used by minority ethnic groups in Scotland. We will first consider those studies concerned with minority ethnic people's general experience of health services followed by research on other specific health services. We will then turn to an area that has attracted much research interest: the identification of mental health needs and the extent to which existing services meet those needs.

General Issues relating to Access to and Use of Health Services

5.37 Women's use, and lack of use, of a wide range of health services has attracted much research attention. Several of these studies focus on the experiences of South Asian women

(Bowes and Domokos, 1992, 1993, 1995a, 1996a; Bhatnagar and Ineson, 1994; Minhas, 1999). Bowes and Domokos (1995a) observed five key issues in their health, based on the views of the participants: breast screening and cervical cytology, women's psychological well-being, choice in childbirth, language and communication, and racism. They found that women were interested in health and keen for support in health improvement, and argue that their inability to obtain their full health care entitlement was more closely related to features of the health care system, including racism, than to 'Asian culture' (Bowes and Domokos, 1993). The authors highlight the fundamental issue of challenging stereotyping and discrimination within health service delivery.

5.38 Milne et al's study (1998) was the only one to examine the health needs of women of African origin, while the focus of Avan's (1995) and Patel's (1996) studies was the health needs of black and minority ethnic women. These studies reveal that gender role obligations affected women's use of health services in a variety of ways as they negotiate their personal health care needs with their obligations and demands as mothers and women (Paul, 1997). Many women had young children and had sole responsibility for them as husbands worked long hours, were employed, and mothers often felt isolated and depressed (Bhatnagar and Ineson, 1994).

5.39 Two studies have emerged on the health needs of the Chinese population (Se-Chan, 1998, cited in Munday and Oswald, 2000; Xiao-hui Liao and McIlwaine, 1995). Xiao-hui Liao and McIlwaine undertook a cross-sectional survey of 493 people of Chinese origin, aged between 12-85, who lived in Glasgow. Although 50 percent reported long term illness, the most frequently mentioned being arthritis, hypertension, hay fever, diabetes and skin disease, GP visits were lower than for the control white population. Many preferred a mix of traditional and western medicine. A report on Chinese health seminars has also been produced (Chinese Health Force, 1998).

5.40 A series of studies on disparate groups have been identified. In a rare study of the Arab Community, involving 115 families, a Glasgow-based study (Zainal et al, 2001) found a great need for interpreting and advocacy services to enable members of the community to access health services. Other difficulties which they faced included the lack of single sex wards, inappropriate catering to meet religious requirements, the lack of female doctors and knowledge of how to access emergency services. The disadvantages faced by Scottish Travellers in accessing health services are vividly described in Lloyd & Moran's (1999) study. This includes their inability to register with a health service, the low use of health visitors, the possibility of eviction or removal while pregnant, and low rates of immunisation. Gardee et al (unknown) focus on the perceptions of Asian carers of people with learning difficulties, revealing the lack of support available to them from mainstream voluntary or statutory organisations.

5.41 The work of Minhas (1999), Patel (1996) and Shariff (2000) reflects the experience of workers and users of particular black-led voluntary organisations and has been motivated by the need to draw attention to gaps in existing statutory service provision. Similarly motivated, Bhatnagar and Ineson's (1994) study is the result of a collaborative effort between NKS and Lothian Health Promotion Department. The main themes arising from these reports are:

- limited use of the range of existing services due to lack of knowledge, information and support

- difficulties in communication and the need for interpreters, advocacy workers or bilingual staff
- a lack of sensitivity on the part of health professionals to cultural and religious practices
- practical difficulties in accessing services such as transport and child-care responsibilities
- experience of direct and indirect racism

5.42 Communication with health professionals was seen as a key issue (Bowes and Domokos, 1996; Hampton, 2000a). Researchers highlighted users' difficulty in accessing and using interpreting services, the reliance of health professionals on family members for help with interpreting, their lack of understanding of cultural issues and lifestyles (Bhatnagar and Ineson, 1994; Minhas, 1999; Xiao-hui Liao and McIlwaine, 1995, Pang, 2000; Zainal et al, 2001), and the negative attitudes on the part of health professionals (Kohli and Reid, 1994). A study of Deaf Asian people found difficulties in communication which arose from the inability of front-line staff and GPs to communicate with deaf people and the lack of efforts to recruit or hire British Sign Language (BSL) interpreters (Mahmood and Shariff, 2000). Although (BSL) was the main form of communication for most of the people in this study and most had little or no understanding of Urdu and Punjabi, the reverse was the case for their parents/carers. As a result, this study identified a need for the employment of bilingual BSL interpreters in the health services.

5.43 Language was certainly a factor restricting the access and use of health services for many. However, Bowes and Domokos (1995b, 1996c, 1997) point out that the preoccupation with language problems as the main barrier to communication masks other significant barriers such as the effect of power differentials, and the additional factors of racialisation and racism. They argue that it is important to disentangle the effects of racism from other effects, such as gender, class or the power of professionalism. However, racism - structural and inter-personal - is seen as 'the one clearly distinctive aspect of the relationship between South Asian women and health services' (Bowes and Domokos, 1996a).

ACCESS TO AND USE OF SPECIFIC SERVICES

5.44 Several studies evaluated the role of particular services or projects. These included GPs (Gilmore et al, unknown); GPs and health visitors (Bowes and Domokos, 1995b, 1997a, 1998a); an Asian and Chinese Women's Health Project which aimed to provide information about cancer-screening and non-insulin dependent diabetes (Hampton, 1995, 1997); an arthritis project (Munro, 1996, 1999); cancer support (Cancerlink, 1999); cervical cytology (Paul, 1997); family planning services for women from the Asian (Baraitser; 1999) and Chinese communities (Cosgrove et al, 1999), maternity services (Bowes and Domokos, 1997b, c, 1998b; Pershad and Tyrrell, 1995), podiatry services (Ahmed et al, 1995), respite services for carers of older people (Netto, 1997); screening services for sickle cell disorder and thalassaemia (Obike, 1998); a 'Sunday' clinic (MacIntosh, 1998) and well woman services (Kohli and Reid, 1995).

5.45 In a rare comparative study, Bowes and Domokos (1998b) considered Pakistani and white women's experiences of breast-feeding in hospital and at home. While women were generally heavily reliant on support from health professionals, they found that white middle class women were most likely to be successful at breast-feeding. This was related to their greater knowledge and ability to access information related to breast-feeding, and their assertiveness in seeking help from health professionals. Those who belonged to socially excluded groups – Pakistani women and white women in lower socio-economic groups – faced restrictions in their possibilities of getting support, in the form of stereotypical views of their wants, needs and experiences.

5.46 Sadly, many of the above studies indicate the greater difficulties of accessing specialist services in relation to specific health conditions, attributed to lack of knowledge of existing services, screening procedures and inability to communicate effectively with general practitioners. In this context, it is worth noting that based on an analysis of data from the Fourth Policy Studies Institute Survey, Nazroo (1997) suggests that the referral rate from primary to secondary care for ethnic minority patients might be lower. Interestingly, many of the above studies relate to issues which might be considered embarrassing or taboo, such as breast and cervical cancer, cervical cytology, drug-use, family planning and sexual health.

5.47 A recurrent theme in many studies is the need for effective transmission of health messages through culturally sensitive means. For example, by providing forums for open discussion in safe and familiar settings, conducting workshops, employing bilingual workers, disseminating translated material, conducting outreach work and liaising with minority ethnic agencies (Bhatnagar and Ineson, 1994; Patel, 1996; Hampton, 2000a). These studies reveal gaps in information received, the form in which it is received, and the need to communicate through a variety of means. This involves taking into account the target group's preferences for the gender and age of health workers. The preference for same sex provision is perhaps obvious in gender specific services such as maternity services. Additionally, Khan and Ditton's two-part (1998a and b) study on attitudes and behaviour in relation to drug use, and related patterns of service use and provision, highlights the need for drug workers who are young enough to be trusted by young people and old enough to inspire confidence in the parents.

5.48 Encouragingly, some studies give examples of good practice in relation to specific client groups and particular health needs. These include the use of trained bilingual workers, opening hours which take into account employment patterns and venues which accommodate the preferences of their users (Ahmed et al, 1995; Hampton, 1995, 1997; MacIntosh, 1998; Munro, 1996, 1999). Both Hampton's and Munro's studies incorporated a longitudinal dimension and were able to document increases in knowledge and understanding of particular illnesses and positive changes in lifestyle, which were consistent with health advice. The role played by health visitors was also seen to be an enabling, inclusionary force which facilitated access to and use of health services (Bowes and Domokos, 1998a).

Mental health needs and services

5.49 The mental health needs of minority ethnic people and the evaluation of services to meet these needs have been the focus of many studies (Causeway Mental Health Project/Renfrewshire Association for Mental Health, unknown; King and Riggs, 1991; Srivastava and Bowes, 1996; Tyrrell, 1998; Austin and Munro, 1997; Fatunmbi and Lee,

1999; Kaifi et al,1995; Lai, unknown; Shariff, 2000; Hampton, 2000b). These are primarily local studies concerned with raising awareness of needs in relation to existing services within a particular health board or local authority area. For instance, Lai's primary concern is the ability of the voluntary sector in Aberdeen to deliver services to minority ethnic people. Ager (1999, cited in Munday and Oswald, 2000) found severe mental health problems among refugees in Edinburgh, the majority of whom viewed social contact rather than clinical intervention as the primary route to well-being.

5.50 Donaghy's doctoral thesis found high levels of depression among second generation South Asian women were related to severe life events combined with lack of social support (1997). Crucially, Donaghy found that the absence of confiding relationships considerably increased the risk of depression. Milne et al (1998) reported discrimination based on racism as a factor in the aetiology of distress in women of African origin, and describe the particular problems which resulted from being members of a small minority. Fatunmbi and Lee's work, the only study whose sole focus was the experiences of black and minority ethnic men, highlighted the limitations in the support available to them.

5.51 Common themes particular to the field of mental health include:

- the importance of valuing people's own understanding of mental illness and well-being
- the need to respect religious or cultural beliefs regarding the prevention or treatment of mental illness
- the role of social support in preventing psychological distress
- the inability of general practitioners to identify need, their lack of awareness of existing services and their consequent inability to make appropriate referrals to specialist services at the early stages of mental illness
- the different pathways by which minority ethnic people enter mental health services, a common pattern being entry at crisis point
- the low uptake of mainstream preventative and community-based services such as counselling and befriending

5.52 Three studies contrasted the effectiveness of various clinical instruments in identifying mental illness among minority ethnic people (Srivastava and Bowes, 1996; Williams and Hunt, 1997; Williams et al, 1997). Williams and Hunt (1997) found that British Asian women Muslims (mainly Punjabis) and limited English speakers tend to experience a different and more extended range of stressful situations, leading to higher levels of psychological distress and a distinctive manner of expressing it. Their quantitative study which compared the Asian population to the general population suggests that certain clinical measures may have underestimated distress in some Asian groups. This was echoed by Srivastava and Bowes' study on elderly South Asians which found a selected psychometric scale, the Hospital Anxiety and Depression Scale, to be 'grossly ineffective' in assessing and understanding the mental health problems of the participants of their study.

5.53 Two studies examined the use of specific community-based mental health services among minority ethnic people (Hampton, 2000b and Netto et al, 2001). Hampton's study was

an evaluation of complementary therapies (CT) provided by Saheliya, an Edinburgh-based mental health project for black and minority ethnic women. Netto et al's study which included data collected from Edinburgh and Glasgow, as well as London, Leeds and Bristol, sought to identify the counselling needs of Asian people who were suffering from depression, stress or anxiety. Both studies found that the service was extremely useful to those who had used them. Those who had experienced counselling, typically at crisis points, appreciated the confidential and non-judgemental nature of the service, which enabled them to talk freely to a trained professional.

MULTIPLE DISCRIMINATION

5.54 The dimension of multiple discrimination, which was most evident in the studies, related to access to health services was that arising from the interaction of racial and sex discrimination. The 1991 Scottish Office Survey revealed that 28% of ethnic minority females who had visited the doctor had difficulties in communicating in English, compared to 8% of ethnic minority males, suggesting that access to good quality primary care services may be more difficult for them. Following from this, their chances of being referred to appropriate specialist services may also be more difficult. To take one example, in contrast to the evidence of the 1991 Scottish Office Survey, at least two studies have found that very few women attended ante-natal classes, as they were unaware of these (Bhatnagar & Ineson, 1994; Pershad and Tyrrell, 1995). However, at least two studies have found that women did not present themselves as passive victims of a discriminatory or racist society. Instead they undertook a number of strategies to prevent a deterioration of their own psychological health (Milne, et al, 1998), and were active participants in the negotiation of health care (Bowes and Domokos, 1995b). Related to multiple discrimination arising from ethnicity and disability, the Department of Nursing at the University of Edinburgh is planning to undertake an evaluation of the use of school health services by children with learning disabilities from ethnic minority communities. This is a project initiated by the Royal Hospital for Sick Children in Edinburgh.

POLICY AND PRACTICE OF HEALTH AGENCIES

5.55 The extensive body of research on access to health services from the perspective of users and potential users does not appear to have been matched by research which examines the policy and practice of health agencies. At the level of Scottish Health Boards and NHS Trusts, little research has been undertaken on employment practices, the proportion of minority ethnic staff who are employed, the grades at which they are employed and their distribution across Scotland. The known exception is an exploratory audit undertaken by the Greater Glasgow Primary Care NHS Trust to determine staff knowledge and perception of the needs of black and minority ethnic users (Obike et al, 1999). A study on refugee doctors in Scotland revealed the 100% unemployment of such doctors, related to their difficulties of obtaining registration from the General Medical Council (Reiss, 1994). The root of the problem was identified as the absence of a refugee policy in any of the relevant medical institutions, which took into account the particular circumstances of refugees in their recruitment practices.

5.56 Glasgow Healthy City Partnership (2001) has recently undertaken an audit of existing health-related services, initiatives and agencies within Glasgow in relation to specifically

targeted services or support provided to black and ethnic minority communities. Although the audit found a wide range of activity across health settings aimed at addressing the health needs of black and minority ethnic communities, it also uncovered 'systematic deficiencies' in the overall response. Responses tended to mainly take the form of discrete projects and service responses were fragmented. Mainstreaming the health needs of black and minority ethnic communities within a systematic, integrated approach was acknowledged to be the major challenge.

5.57 Research efforts in other areas have been hindered by the lack of ethnic monitoring of community-based primary care services and admissions data. The use of vital support services, such as interpreting services, has also not been monitored. However, at least one health agency has conducted a review of ethnic minority catering provision (Blackwood, 1998). Papers on religious beliefs and cultural practices (Gardee and Hussain) and the health needs of minority ethnic groups in Greater Glasgow (Greater Glasgow Health Board, 1997) have also been produced.

5.58 An audit of race equality action in Scottish Health Boards and NHS Trusts, commissioned by the Scottish Executive, is currently being undertaken, and will be very useful in providing added direction for improving the quality of health services for all (Gardee et al, forthcoming). The Scottish Consumer Council (ongoing) is also carrying out an investigation into access to primary care services in Glasgow, which is expected to be completed this year. Research on transcultural psychiatric care (Gardee et al, forthcoming) and an evaluation of a programme of holistic massage therapy (Gardee et al, forthcoming) which will be undertaken by the Greater Glasgow Primary Care NHS Trust is also planned. The same trust will also be developing a diversity framework for the National Health Service in Scotland.

COMPLEMENTARY ROLES OF RESEARCH ON HEALTH STATUS AND ACCESS TO HEALTH SERVICES

5.59 Access to, and ease of use of health services has been identified as an important potential source of inequality in the health experience of different ethnic groups in Britain, which may influence both the quality of care and the outcomes of that care (Nazroo, 1997). Accordingly, inequalities in access to, and use of health services may play a contributory role to inequalities in health status. Ineson and Bhopal (2000:18) point out that 'the complementary roles of national-level research, qualitative community-based studies and possible local NHS-based research need to be explored'. Elaborating on this theme, this audit has revealed that, as has been observed in a broader context (Bhopal, 1997), there is a gap between the findings of research related to variations in patterns of disease and possible contributory factors, and research which examines the effectiveness of interventional strategies. For instance, the high rates of CHD in the South Asian population in Glasgow are well-evidenced, and research has suggested the role of dietary choices and patterns of hospitality in contributing to these rates. However, we have not been able to identify any research that evaluates the effectiveness of health educational strategies in this respect. Neither has there been any research which examines the treatment which has been given to minority ethnic people suffering from CHD (see Bhopal, 1998 for examples of racial inequalities in treating heart disease which have emerged in the United States).

OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH

5.60 The overview of research is considered under main themes, gaps, perspectives, scope and funding of the research.

Main Perspectives/Approaches

5.61 The research on health status includes several epidemiological studies on the South Asian and Irish population, which are both descriptive and analytical. They are descriptive in that they provide data on how disease, disability and death are distributed between and within populations, and analytical in attempting to account for the causes of the disease and their distribution (see Davey Smith et al 2000). These studies are mainly quantitative studies, some of which have involved analysis of large data sets. Much theoretical work has also been directed towards conceptualising models which explain the health of minority ethnic groups in Britain and which make health predictions.

5.62 These have been complemented by a number of quantitative and qualitative studies, which have examined the influence of religious affiliation and cultural strategies on health behaviour. In contrast, the studies undertaken in relation to access to services are almost invariably small-scale qualitative studies which are oriented towards addressing gaps in existing provision within a particular local authority or health board area. One paper explores the potential for an empowering research strategy to raise the muted voices of Pakistani women, with particular reference to experiences of maternity care (Bowes and Domokos, 1996b).

Funding of research

5.63 The MRC Social and Public Health Sciences Unit (formerly the MRC Medical Sociology Unit) has had a core-funded programme of research on ethnicity, religion and health since 1988, which has been supplemented by grants for specific projects. Other sources of funding for research in this area are varied, including the Chief Scientist Office, the Joseph Rowntree Foundation, the Greater Glasgow Health Board, the Lothian Health Promotion Board, the National Lotteries Charities Project and various voluntary organisations.

RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Main Themes	Identified Gaps	Recommendations
<p>The health status of certain minority ethnic groups has been the subject of enquiry. Studies of the South Asian population have compared the extent of health disadvantage in this population against the general population, in relation to the higher incidence of coronary heart disease (CHD).</p> <p>There is also a substantial body of research on the Irish population, which has examined excess rates of mortality and morbidity.</p> <p>Links between inequalities in health status and socio-economic status have been established.</p>	<p>The absence of ethnic monitoring of mortality and morbidity data, death certification or incidence of accidents or crime means that little is known about the health status of minority ethnic groups, particularly that of Chinese, African-Caribbean and other communities.</p> <p>The absence of ethnic monitoring in other social surveys also inhibits the extent to which inequalities in health can be explored.</p> <p>Apart from the South Asian population, the health status of other minority ethnic groups, Gypsy Travellers and refugees/asylum seekers appear to have been largely overlooked.</p>	<p>A priority area is research to support the development of ethnic monitoring systems including the type of information to be collected, the means of collecting such information and the analysis and interpretation of data.</p> <p>Given the lack of information about the health status of minority ethnic groups and absence of health statistics on these groups, it would be useful to explore to what extent English-based research on the health status of minority ethnic groups could be generalised to the Scottish context. This could inform the planning of future, more focused Scottish-based research related to ethnic health inequalities.</p>
<p>A recurrent theme in several studies is the importance of effectively transmitting a wide range of health promotion messages to the minority ethnic population.</p>	<p>Little attention has been paid to evaluating the effectiveness of health promotion strategies delivered by mainstream statutory organisations to minority ethnic groups.</p>	<p>An evaluative study of health promotion strategies for minority ethnic communities, perhaps initially in areas identified as key strategic health priorities, is required. This should include an exploration of the merits of a targeted approach.</p>
<p>Research into ethnicity and health has tended to focus on the diseases that are more common in minority ethnic groups than in the white population.</p> <p>Extensive research has been carried out in relation to the higher rates of CHD in the South Asian population in Glasgow.</p>	<p>Research attention has been diverted from major illnesses such as cancer and cerebrovascular disease, which are also common in minority ethnic groups.</p>	<p>The inclusion of minority ethnic groups in research into the diseases identified as key strategic health priorities would complement existing research which has focused on diseases that are more common amongst minority ethnic groups.</p>
<p>There has been research into the influence of religion and religious discrimination on health and health-related behaviour in relation to the differences between those born of Catholic parents or currently of Catholic affiliation and the general population.</p>	<p>The extent to which the influence of religion and religious discrimination affects the health of those of Muslim, Hindu, Sikh or other non-Christian faiths has not been considered.</p>	<p>Qualitative research on the influence of religion and religious discrimination on health-related behaviour and experiences would be useful.</p>

<p>A substantial body of work documents inequalities in access to and use of health services. Among the main themes are concerns about accessibility, quality and outcome of services.</p> <p>The quality of communication between users of the health service and health professionals has emerged as a key issue.</p> <p>The influence of racism on access to and use of health services has also been considered.</p>	<p>There is a lack of ethnically disaggregated data on access to and use of community-based primary care services, admissions and the use of vital support services such as interpreting services.</p> <p>Few evaluative studies on the equal opportunities policies and practice of Health Boards and NHS Trusts appear to have been undertaken.</p>	<p>There is a clear priority for health agencies to evaluate the extent to which their services are equally accessible and appropriate to all minority ethnic communities.</p> <p>An examination of the availability of, access to and take up of race equality training by health professionals is required.</p> <p>The need for, and availability of, interpreters and advocates for health service users should be explored.</p>
<p>Several studies have considered access to mental health services, suggesting that mental health issues among minority ethnic groups are of particular concern.</p> <p>High levels of psychosomatic symptoms and self-assessed distress have been found among South Asian women, Muslims and refugees.</p> <p>The effectiveness of various clinical instruments in identifying mental illness among minority ethnic people has been found to be severely limited.</p>	<p>Very little research seems to have been undertaken to evaluate the appropriateness and effectiveness of statutory mental health services for minority ethnic communities.</p>	<p>The effectiveness of statutory mental health services for minority ethnic communities has emerged as a priority area for research.</p> <p>This research could usefully investigate the means by which statutory mental health services are accessed and the appropriateness and effectiveness of mental health intervention strategies. This would be a valuable complement to the many evaluative studies of the mental health services provided by the voluntary sector.</p>

REFERENCES

- Abbotts J, Williams R, Ford G, Hunt K and West P (1997) 'Morbidity and Irish Catholic descent in Britain: an ethnic and religious minority 150 years on' *Soc. Sci. Med.* Vol. 45 No.1: pp 3-14.
- Abbotts J, Williams R and Davey Smith G (1998). 'Mortality in men of Irish heritage in West Scotland' *Public Health* Vol. 112: pp 229-232
- Abbotts J, Williams R and Davey-Smith G (1999a) 'Association of medical, physiological and socio-economic factors with elevated mortality in men of Irish Catholic heritage in West Scotland' *Journal of Public Health Medicine* Vol. 21 No. 1: pp 46-54.
- Abbotts J, Williams R, Ford G, Hunt K and West P (1999b). Morbidity and Irish Catholic descent in Britain: relating health disadvantage to behaviour. *Ethnicity and Health* Vol. 4 No. 4: pp 221-230.
- Acheson, D (1998) *Independent Inquiry into Inequalities in Health Report* London: HMSO
- Ager, A (1999) *A study of socially isolated refugees in Edinburgh*. Unpublished paper.
- Ahmed, M, Morrison, S and Gardee R (1996) *Podiatry (Chiropody) Report: a snapshot of attitudes, perception and knowledge of podiatry services by the ethnic minority Asian 'elderly' clients attending some day centres* Glasgow: Greater Glasgow Community and Mental Health Services NHS Trust
- Anderson A and Lean MEJ (1995) 'Healthy changes? Observations on a decade of dietary change in a sample of Glaswegian South Asian migrant women' *J. Human Nutrition and Dietetics* Vol. 8: 129-136.
- Austin E and Munro A (1997) *Older Peoples Needs Assessment of Multicultural issues in the Community Mental Health Nursing Service* Edinburgh: Royal Edinburgh Hospital
- Avan, G (1995) *Perceived health needs of black and ethnic minority women: an exploratory study* Glasgow: Glasgow Healthy City Partnership
- Baraitser, P (1999) 'Family planning and sexual health: understanding the needs of South Asian women in Glasgow' *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* Vol 25 No 1: pp 133-149
- Bhatnagar, A and Ineson, A (1994) *Health and health care: the needs of women of Bangladeshi and Pakistani origin in Edinburgh* Edinburgh: Nari Kallyan Shangho and Lothian Health Promotion Department
- Bhopal, R. (1997) 'Is research into ethnicity and health racist, unsound or important science?' *British Medical Journal* Vol 314 pp 1751-1756
- Bhopal, R. (1998) 'Spectre of racism in health and health care: lessons from history and the United States.' *British Medical Journal* Vol. 316 pp. 1970-1973

Bhopal, R, Hunt, S, Amos A, Wiebe, S and Vettini, A (forthcoming) *Cross-cultural validity of methods of measurement of alcohol and tobacco consumption*. Public Health Sciences Department of Community Health, University of Edinburgh

Blackwood, J. (1998) *A review of ethnic minority catering provision*. Glasgow: Greater Glasgow Community and Mental Health Services

Bowes A M and Domokos T M (1992) *Asian women and health in Glasgow*; Final report to Health Services Committee, Scottish Home and Health Department.

Bowes A M and Domokos T M (1993) 'South Asian women and health services: a study in Glasgow' *New Community* Vol. 19 No 4: pp 611-626

Bowes A M and Domokos T M (1995a) 'Key issues in South Asian Women's Health: a study in Glasgow' *Social Sciences in Health* Vol.1 No 3: pp 145-157

Bowes A M and Domokos T M (1995b) 'South Asian Women and their GPs: some issues of communication' *Social Sciences in Health* Vol 1 No 1: 22-33

Bowes A M and Domokos T M (1996a) 'Race, Gender and Culture in South Asian Women's Health: a study in Glasgow' in L McKie (ed) *Researching Women's Health: Methods and Process*. Salisbury: Mark Allen

Bowes A M and Domokos T M (1996b) 'Pakistani women and maternity care: raising muted voices' *Sociology of Health and Illness* Vol. 18, No 1: pp 45-65

Bowes A M and Domokos T M (1996c) *Issues of communication between general practitioners health visitors and women of Pakistani heritage* Department of Applied Social Science, University of Stirling

Bowes A M and Domokos T M (1997a) 'Pakistani women, general practitioners and health visitors: communication and service access' in Bowes, A M and Sim D F (eds) *Perspectives on Welfare* Aldershot: Ashgate

Bowes A M and Domokos T M (1997b) *Phase 2 of work on women of Pakistani heritage and their experience and use of health services (maternity services, breast feeding and health visiting)* Final Report to Health Services Research Committee, Chief Scientist's Office Edinburgh: Scottish Office

Bowes A M and Domokos T M (1997c) "'I wasn't rocking any boats' Pakistani women, white women and their experiences of maternity care' *Maternity Action* 78: pp 6-7

Bowes A M and Domokos T M (1998a) 'Health visitors' work in a Multi-Ethnic Society: A Qualitative Study of Social Exclusion' *Journal of Social Policy* 27, No 4: pp 489-506

Bowes A M and Domokos T M (1998b) 'Negotiating breast-feeding: Pakistani women, White women and their Experiences in Hospital and at Home' *Sociological Research Online* Vol. 3, No. 3 < <http://www.aoxewaonline.org.uk/socresonline/3/3/5.html>>

Bradby H (1996) Cultural strategies of young women of South Asian origin in Glasgow, with special reference to health. PhD thesis, University of Glasgow.

Bradby, H (forthcoming). 'Communication, interpretation and translation', in Dyson S and Culley L (eds), *Sociology, ethnicity and nursing* Basingstoke, Macmillan.

Bradby H (1997) 'Health, eating and heart attacks: Glaswegian Punjabi women's thinking about everyday food' in Caplan P (ed.), *Food, Health and Identity*, London: Routledge.

Bradby H and Williams R (1998) *Health and health behaviour among Glasgow 18-20 year olds of South Asian and non-Asian background: a follow-up* Glasgow: MRC Medical Sociology Unit, Working Paper no. 59.

Bradby, H. and Williams R (1999) 'Behaviour and expectations in relation to sexual intercourse among 18-20 year old Asians and non-Asians' *Sexually Transmitted Infections* 75: 162-167.

Bush H, Williams R, Lean M, Anderson A and Bradby H (1995a). 'Obesity as a risk factor for coronary heart disease in Glaswegian South Asian women' in Feichtinger, E and Kohler, BM (eds.) *Current Research into Eating Practices: Contributions to Social Science*. AGEV Publication Series, Vol. 10. Supplementum to Ernährungs-Umschau.

Bush HM, Anderson AS, Williams RGA, Lean MEJ and Bradby H (1995b) 'Dietary change in South Asian and Italian women in the West of Scotland' Glasgow: MRC Medical Sociology Unit, Working Paper no.54.

Bush H, Williams R, Anderson A, Lean M and Bradby H (1996a). 'Symbolic meals of Asian and Italian women in Glasgow' *Scandinavian Journal of Nutrition* (Proceedings of First European Workshop on Human Migration and Nutrition) Vol. 40: pp. S91-2.

Bush H, Williams R, Bradby H, Lean M, Anderson A and Han T (1996b) 'Weight consciousness and body image among South Asian, Italian and general population women in Britain' *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health* Vol. 50: pp. 600.

Bush H, Williams R, Bradby H, Anderson A and Lean M (1998). 'Family hospitality and ethnic tradition among South Asian, Italian and general population women in the West of Scotland' *Sociology of Health & Illness* 20(3): pp 351-380.

Cancerlink (1999) *Cancer Support and the needs of Asian women in Scotland* Edinburgh: Cancerlink

Causeway Mental Health Project and Renfrewshire Association for Mental Health (unknown) *Changing minds...ascertaining the mental health needs of black and minority ethnic people* Glasgow: Causeway Mental Health Project/Renfrewshire Association for Mental Health

Chinese Health Force (1998) *Report on the Glasgow Chinese Health Seminars* Glasgow: Chinese Health Force

Cosgrove, K, Hui , Y, Hampton, K and Laughlin S (1999) *Assessing the Sexual Health and Family Planning Needs of Chinese Women in Glasgow* Glasgow: Greater Glasgow Health Board/Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit

Davey Smith G, Chaturvedi N, Harding S, Nazroo J and Williams R (2000). 'Ethnic inequalities in health: a review of UK epidemiological evidence.' *Critical Public Health* Vol. 10 No. 4: pp 377-408.

Donaghy, E (1997) 'Understanding depression in young South Asian women in Scotland' in Bowes, A M and Sim, D F (eds) *Perspectives on Welfare* Aldershot: Ashgate

Ecob R and Williams R (1991) Sampling Asian minorities to assess health and welfare. *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health* 45: pp 93-101

Fatunmbi, A and Lee, C (1999) *Silence of the Lads* Edinburgh: EAMH/Men in Mind

Gardee, R (forthcoming) *Working towards culturally competent services: improving the health of minority ethnic groups and the wider community in Scotland: Guidance for Health Boards and NHS Trusts* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Gardee, R, and Hussain, A (unknown) understanding, adopting and implementing diverse religious beliefs and cultural practices in the provision of health care. Glasgow: Gartnavel Royal Hospital/University of Glasgow

Gardee, R, Kaifi, R Razak, A and Mirza, A, Makherjee, M. Kohli, K and Craise, L (unknown) *A report on ethnic carers' perception of needs for learning disabilities in Glasgow* Glasgow: Community and mental health services NHS Trust, Greater Glasgow Health Board/Community Relations Council/Barnados

Gilmore, A, Davidson, F and Kidd, V (unknown) *A collaborative action research: an exploratory study on ethnic minority perceptions on the services provided in an inner city GP practice* Glasgow: Greater Glasgow NHS trust

Glasgow Health City Partnership (2001) *Healthy cities for all? An audit of health-related services for black and minority ethnic communities in Glasgow.* Glasgow: Glasgow Healthy City Partnership

Greater Glasgow Health Board (1997) *The health needs of minority ethnic groups* Glasgow: Greater Glasgow Health Board

Hampton, K (1995) *Fook Hong/Sehat, Asian and Chinese Women's Project, Interim Evaluation Report* Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

Hampton, K (1997) *Fook Hong/Sehat, Asian and Chinese Women's Project, SEMRU Research Paper No 7 Series 2* Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

Hampton, K. (2000a) 'Communicating health messages to marginalised communities - a culture sensitive approach' *International Journal of Health Promotion and Education*. Vol. 38 No. 2 pp 40-46

Hampton, K (2000b) *Saheliya Complementary Therapies Evaluation* Edinburgh: Saheliya

Hampton, K (forthcoming) *Black and ethnic minority views on smoking* Edinburgh: Ash Scotland

Kaifi, R, Bhatti, I, Gardee, R and Hampton, K (1995) *Black and ethnic communities: the service providers' perception of mental health services in Glasgow*. Glasgow: Community and Mental Health Services NHS Trust/Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit/Glasgow District Council

Ineson, A and Bhopal, R (2000) 'Meeting the needs of minority ethnic groups in Lothian' in *Public Health 2000* Edinburgh: Lothian Health

Kay E J, Shaikh I, Bhopal R S (1990) 'Health knowledge, beliefs, attitudes and behaviour of the Asian community in Glasgow' *Health Bulletin* Vol. 48 No. 2: pp73-79

Khan, F, Ditton, J, Hammersley, R, Phillips S and Short, E (1998a) *Ethnic Minority Drug Use in Glasgow Part One: Comparative attitudes and behaviour of young white and Asian males* Glasgow: Glasgow Drugs Prevention Team

Khan, F and Ditton, J, (1998b) *Ethnic Minority Drug Use in Glasgow Part Two: Special Problems Experienced and Possible Gaps in Service Provision* Glasgow: Glasgow Drugs Prevention Team

King, S and Rigg, S (1991) *Investigative Report on the Mental Health Needs of Black Women* Edinburgh: Craigentenny Health Project

Kohli H and Reid M (1994) 'What well woman services do 'Asian' woman need?' Department of Public Health, University of Glasgow

Lai, C (1999) *Reaching out to black ethnic minorities: a voluntary sector perspective on mental health*. MSc dissertation, Robert Gordon University, Aberdeen

Lai, C (unknown) 'Reaching out to black ethnic minorities: a voluntary sector perspective on mental health' *Practice* Vol 12: No. 1 pp 7- 26

Lloyd, M and Morran R (1999) *Travellers and health* Edinburgh: Save the Children Fund

MacIntosh, S (1998) *Evaluation of the Sunday Clinic: A Pilot Project* Glasgow: Chinese Health Force

Mahmood, S and Shariff, I (2000) *Promoting social inclusion for deaf people from a minority ethnic background* Glasgow: Deaf Connections and Greater Glasgow Primary Care NHS Trust

Milne, R, Wyke, S and Donaghy, E (1998) *Health Services for Women of African Origin in Scotland* Department of General Practice, University of Edinburgh

Minhas, N (1999) *Assessing the Gap: the problems faced by South Asian women in accessing health services in Edinburgh* Edinburgh: Nari Kallyan Shangho

Mirza, A (1997) *Sex education: a comparative study of the perceptions, attitudes and sexual health needs of Pakistani, Indian and White secondary school children in Edinburgh*. Masters in Public Health. Department of Public Health, University of Glasgow

Mullen K (1992) 'A question of balance: health behaviour and work context among male Glaswegians' *Sociology of Health and Illness* Vol. 14: pp. 73-39.

Mullen K (1994) Control and responsibility: moral and religious issues in lay health accounts. *Sociological Review* Vol. 43 No. 3: pp 414-437.

Mullen K, Williams R and Hunt K (1996) 'Irish descent, religion and alcohol and tobacco use' *Addiction* Vol. 91 No. 2: pp 243-254

Mullen K, Williams R and Hunt K (2000). Irish descent, religion and food consumption in the west of Scotland. *Appetite* Vol. 34: pp. 47-54.

Munday S and Oswald C (2000) *Black and Minority Health Inequalities Framework Document* Edinburgh: Lothian Health Department

Munro, A (1996) *Needs Assessment of Multi-cultural issues affecting older people with arthritis* Edinburgh: Pilmeny Development Project/Arthritis Care and Milan (Senior Welfare Council)

Munro, A (1999) *Minority Ethnic Arthritis Project Evaluation/Update Report*. Edinburgh: Pilmeny Development Project/Arthritis Care and Milan (Senior Welfare Council)

Nazroo, J. (1997) 'Health and Health Services' in Modood, T Berthoud, R, Lakey J Nazroo, J, Smith, P, Virdee, S and Beishon, S (eds) *Ethnic minorities in Britain* London: Policy Studies Institute

Netto, G (1998). 'I forget myself: the case for the provision of culturally sensitive respite services for minority ethnic carers of older people' *Journal of Public Health Medicine* Vol 20/2: 221-226)

Netto, G, Gaag, S, Thanki, M, Bondi, L and Munro, M (2001) *A suitable space: Improving counselling services for Asian people*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Obike, P (1998) *The awareness of sickle cell disorder and thalassaemia among the community and frontline healthcare professionals in Glasgow* Masters' thesis, Department of Medical Genetics, Glasgow: Yorkhill Hospitals

Patel, A (1996) *Black women in Edinburgh: An investigation into their needs and experiences as users of health services* Edinburgh: Shakti Women's Aid

- Pang, M (2000) *Communication barriers? An explorative study of two groups in the Chinese community in Aberdeen* BSc Health Sciences, Department of Public Health, University of Aberdeen
- Paul S (1997) 'South Asian women's access to cervical cytology' in Bowes, A M and Sim D F (eds) *Perspectives on Welfare* Aldershot: Ashgate
- Pershad, P and Tyrrell (1995) *Access to antenatal and postnatal services for Asian women living in East Pollokshields*, Glasgow: Save the Children
- Rehman, U (1996) *Health and health education needs of young Pakistani women* Glasgow: Glasgow Healthy City Partnership
- Reiss, G. (1994) *Refugee doctors in Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Refugee Council.
- Scottish Consumer Council (forthcoming) *Access to Primary Care Services*. Glasgow: Scottish Consumer Council
- Scottish Executive (1999) *Towards a Healthier Scotland* Edinburgh: Stationary Office
- Scottish Executive (2000) *Equality in Scotland: Guide to Data Sources* Edinburgh: Central Statistics Unit, Scottish Executive
- Scottish Executive (2001) *Our National Health: a plan for action, a plan for change* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive
- Scottish Office (1991) *Ethnic Minorities in Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Office
- Scottish Office (1998) *Working together for a healthier Scotland: a consultation document* Edinburgh: the Stationary Office
- Se Chan C ML (1998) *A survey of health behaviour, health problems and the health needs among the Chinese in Edinburgh*, Queen Margaret College
- Secretary of State (1998a) *Our Healthier Nation* London: HMSO
- Shams M and Williams R (1995) 'Differences in perceived parental care and protection and related psychological distress between British Asian and non-Asian adolescents' *Journal of Adolescence* Vol.18: 329-348.
- Shams M and Williams R (1997) 'Generational changes in height and body mass differences between British Asians and the general population in Glasgow' *Journal of Biosocial Science* Vol. 29: pp. 101-109.
- Shariff, I. (2000) *Black and minority ethnic health needs assessment* Glasgow: Maryhill Community Health Project

Sheikh A and Jiwa, S (1993) *Heart disease and the Asian Community in Lothian* Edinburgh: Lothian Health Education Department/Roundabout Centre

Shrestha, S (1996) *A health survey of Asian workers in Indian restaurants in Glasgow* Master of Public Health, Department of Public Health, University of Glasgow.

Srivastava, A and Bowes A M (1996) *Mental health among elderly South Asians: a review in the light of mental health services in Scotland* Department of Applied Social Science, University of Stirling.

Stead, M (1996) *The health of minority ethnic populations in Scotland: A literature review for the Health Education Board for Scotland* Glasgow: Centre for Social Marketing, University of Strathclyde

Tyrrell, H (1998) *Needs, services and priorities for Mental Health in Pollockshields* Glasgow: a local perspective. Glasgow: Glasgow Association for Mental Health and Save the Children

Umeed, I (2000) *Health Needs, Knowledge: a self-reported health status of South Asian men in Glasgow* Glasgow: I Umeed

Williams R (1992a) 'The health of the Irish in Britain' in Ahmad ,W (ed) *The politics of race and research* Bradford: Race Relations Unit, University of Bradford

Williams R (1993a) 'Can data on Scottish Catholics tell us about descendants of the Irish in Scotland? A research note' *New Community* Vol. 19 No. 2: pp 296-309

Williams R (1993b) 'The health costs of Britain's industrialisation: a perspective from the Celtic periphery' in Platt S, Thomas A, Scott S, and Williams G (eds.) *Locating health: sociological and historical explorations*. Aldershot: Avebury.

Williams R (1993c) 'Religion and illness' In Radley A, (ed.) *Worlds of illness*. London: Routledge.

Williams R (1993d) Health and length of residence among South Asians in Glasgow: a study controlling for age. *Journal of Public Health Medicine* 15: No. 1 pp 52-60.

Williams R (1994a) Britain's regional mortality: a legacy from disaster in the Celtic periphery? *Soc Sci Med* Vol. 39 No. 2: pp 189-199.

Williams R (1994b) Medical, economic and population factors in areas of high mortality in Britain: the case of Glasgow. *Sociology of Health & Illness* Vol.16 No. 2: pp 143-181

Williams R (1997) 'The health legacy of the emigration: the Irish in Britain and elsewhere, 1845-1995' *Irish Journal of Sociology* 6: pp 56-78.

Williams R and Hunt K (1997) 'Psychological distress among British South Asians: the contribution of stressful situations and subcultural differences in the West of Scotland Twenty-07 Study' *Psychological Med.* Vol. 27 : pp 1173-1181.

Williams R and Shams M (1998) 'Generational continuity and change in British Asian health and health behaviour' *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health* Vol. 52: pp 558-563.

Williams R and Ecob R (1999). 'Regional mortality and the Irish in Britain.' *Sociology of Health and Illness* Vol. 21 No.3: pp 344-367

Williams R, Bhopal R and Hunt K (1993) 'Health of a Punjabi ethnic minority in Glasgow: a comparison with the general population' *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health* Vol. 47: pp 96-102.

Williams R, Bhopal R and Hunt K (1994) 'Coronary risk in a British Punjabi population: comparative profile of non-biochemical risk factors' *International Journal of Epidemiology* Vol. 23: pp 28-37.

Williams R, Bush H, Anderson A, Lean M and Bradby H (1996). *Dietary change in South Asian and Italian women in the West of Scotland* Final report to the ESRC Glasgow: MRC Medical Sociology Unit.

Williams R, Eley S, Hunt K and Bhatt S (1997) 'Has psychological distress among British Asians been underestimated? A comparison of three measures in the West of Scotland population' *Ethnicity and Health* Vol. 2 No. 1/2: pp 21-29.

Williams R, Bush H, Lean M, Anderson A and Bradby H (1998a) 'Food choice and culture in a cosmopolitan city: South Asians, Italians and other Glaswegians' in Murcott A (ed.), *The nation's diet: the social science of food choice* London: Addison Wesley Longman

Williams R, Wright W and Hunt K (1998b) 'Social class and health: the puzzling counter-example of British South Asians' *Social Science and Medicine* 47 No. 9: pp 1277-1288.

Xiao-hui Liao, McIlwaine G (1995) 'The health status and health needs of Chinese population in Glasgow' *Scottish Medical Journal* 40: pp 077-080

Zainal, K, Sharif I, Gardee R and Mohammed, F. (2000) *Health needs of the Arab Community: an exploratory review* Glasgow: Greater Glasgow Primary Care NHS Trust

CHAPTER SIX RACE AND ACCESS TO JUSTICE

INTRODUCTION

6.1 Several recent developments coincide to make a consideration of research related to race and access to justice timely. In respect of criminal justice, a review of the Action Plan for Scotland has just been published and updated (Scottish Executive, 2001). The Action Plan was produced in response to the recommendations of Sir William Macpherson's report, which followed the inquiry into the murder of Stephen Lawrence (Scottish Executive, 1999). The Action Plan for Scotland was inevitably addressed towards the police service, which was the subject of most of the recommendations, although the wider relevance of institutional racism was acknowledged. The Commission for Racial Equality has also produced a response to the Action Plan for Scotland (2001). The Crown Office has reported on the handling of the family of Surjit Singh Chhokar. Further, the recent report by Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary for Scotland on police and race relations, *Without Prejudice?* (HMIC, 2001), has also identified several areas of weaknesses and provides recommendations and suggestions for further action.

6.2 In respect of civil justice, the introduction of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 will also strengthen the existing Act by extending its scope and placing a new positive, enforceable duty on all public authorities. All public authorities will be required not to discriminate, directly or indirectly, on racial grounds in respect of all their functions.

6.3 This chapter is concerned with research related to minority ethnic people's contact with the justice system generally, and specifically with the criminal justice system as victims of crime or as the accused, and with the civil justice system, either as pursuers or defendants general. One of the main areas which has received research attention has been the phenomenon of racial harassment, which was made a statutory crime and a racially aggravated offence by reason of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998. There is also a growing body of research related to minority ethnic people's attitudes towards the police and the policy and practice of the police. Studies on multiple victimisation and discrimination will also be considered.

6.4 We begin by considering the availability of official data related to both criminal and civil justice. Then, we consider research related to the extent and experience of racial harassment and responses to the phenomenon. The next section considers minority ethnic people's other contact with the criminal justice system, including their experience as victims of crime, their attitudes to the police, the policy and practice of the police and their experience as agents of the criminal justice system. Following that we consider minority ethnic people's experiences within the civil justice system, including their experience of court proceedings. This will be followed by a consideration of studies on multiple victimisation and discrimination. Finally, an overview of the research conducted in this area will be provided.

STATISTICAL SOURCES

6.5 There is no known published data providing statistically reliable information on ethnic minorities and the civil justice system apart from the data provided by the Commission for Racial Equality (CRE). The CRE published statistics relating to complaints of racial

discrimination which it received or which were reported to it by Race Equality Councils. In 1999-2000, it received 89 complaints of which 32 related to employment (CRE, 2000).

6.6 The Protection from Harassment Act 1997 enables the issuance of non-harassment orders (section 8). However, there are no published data identifying issuance by reason of racial harassment. Similarly, no records have been published regarding Anti-social Behaviour Orders under the Crime & Disorder Act 1998, which were granted by reason of racial harassment. Both orders constitute civil remedies for categories of racist behaviour but, where a breach occurs, may give rise to criminal offences.

6.7 Incitement to racial hatred is a statutory criminal offence by reason of the Public Order Act 1986. While the Criminal Justice (Scotland) Act 1987 enables the relevant minister to require annual returns to be submitted on race and crime, such returns have not included this offence and records are not published.

6.8 The lack of racially disaggregated information at various stages of the Scottish criminal justice system has been highlighted by Burman et al (1998). This renders invisible the different patterns of contact which people from ethnic minority backgrounds may have with the decision-making processes of its agents at different points of the system. Hence, in contrast to the situation in England and Wales, there are currently no figures that provide a detailed breakdown of numbers, offences and disposals. Neither are other stages of the system (for example, police stops and arrests, bail and remand decisions, community orders and rates of acquittal) monitored by ethnicity (Burman et al). The Scottish Executive Justice Department Court Proceedings Database which contains details of all persons proceeded against in Scottish courts, and the Scottish Executive Justice Department Homicide Database which records the details of all homicides recorded in Scotland (Scottish Executive, 2000) do not record information on ethnicity. It is thus not presently possible to identify whether minority ethnic people are over-represented in Scottish courts. However, information on ethnicity is available in the Scottish Prison Service Scottish Prisoner Records which detail all prisoner warrants and movements in Scotland and includes information on sentence length, main crime and other prison-related information (Scottish Executive, 2000).

6.9 Records held by the police of persons with whom they come into contact with as victims, witnesses or offenders, also do not contain information on ethnicity, other than in complaints against the police or racist incidents (HMIC, 2001). The existence of data maintained by the police on racial incidents and by Scottish Race Equality Councils are potentially valuable for future research, although the reliability of the latter may vary while there is likely to be significant under-recording of the former.

EXTENT AND NATURE OF RACIAL HARASSMENT

6.10 Racial harassment has implications for both the civil and criminal justice systems. In respect of the former, for example in employment, racial harassment may lead to litigation against the perpetrators or their employers and in housing, to litigation against agents for damages or reparation, and against the landlord for breach of contract. While such civil actions are important, research related to these actions is limited. Greater significance is likely to be attached to racial harassment, which constitutes a criminal offence; thus, the following focuses on the criminal justice perspective.

6.11 The CRE recently recorded the occurrence of 527 racist incidents in Scotland (CRE, 2000). It found steady increases in the reporting rates of incidents reported to local race equality councils in Scotland (CRE, 1997). The same study points out that the most recent figure for racially reported crimes in Scotland is 6.4% of the total number of such incidents reported to police in the UK. However, the population of minority ethnic people in Scotland is only 2.1% of that of the UK as a whole. This suggests that either the level of reporting is higher or the incidence of racial harassment is significantly higher.

6.12 Support for the latter possibility is found in the documentation of racial harassment in several pieces of Scottish-based research (MacEwen et al, 1994; Lee et al, 1996; Black Community Development Project, 1998; Hampton, 1998, 1999). Hampton's (1999) study found that although the majority of respondents believed that racial abuse occurred mostly as isolated incidents, the remainder reported that it either occurred frequently or daily in the area in which they lived. Other common acts of harassment involved damage to property and physical abuse, findings that are replicated in the other studies cited above. Several studies considered in the chapter on Race and Housing revealed that safety from racial harassment was a key factor in determining people's choice of housing. The analysis of the Fourth Policy Studies Institute Survey revealed that black and minority ethnic people living in low density residential areas or in non-inner city areas may be at greater risk than those living in high density areas (Virdee, 1997). This has particular implications for the small, dispersed minority ethnic population living in rural areas.

6.13 A UK-wide study, funded by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation, on the experience of racist victimisation, which included Glasgow, found that the acts of harassment which people reported were limited to physical attacks; generally people only reported such harassment when it had become intolerable (Chahal and Julienne, 1999). It also found that the consequences of harassment went beyond the actual events and affected not only close family relations, but also the interactions of the family with the wider community. Studies conducted in England and Wales have found that a high proportion of those who experience racial harassment are subject to repeat victimisation (Sampson and Phillips, 1992; Virdee, 1997).

6.14 Further insight into the nature of such experiences, and where they are likely to occur is likely to be obtained from a study recently commissioned by the Central Research Unit (CRU) into the experiences of victims of racist crimes in Scotland (Clark and Moody, forthcoming). Information about the profile of perpetrators of racial harassment as well as possible explanations to account for this, continues to be lacking.

Responses to Racial Harassment

6.15 A recurrent theme of studies on racist victimisation is the lack of support available to deal effectively with racial incidents, in spite of the statutory responsibilities of local authorities in this area. The response of public authorities to racial harassment in Scotland has been the focus of some research attention. Bowes et al (1990) revealed the very low priority that was accorded by housing authorities in responding to incidents of racial harassment by council tenants. Seven years later, a survey of housing authorities in Scotland found that fewer than half of the 32 new unitary authorities in Scotland monitored racial attacks and harassment on or within the vicinity of local authority housing. Eighteen local authorities did not have a

policy for such attacks and lacked any formal structures to monitor racial incidents (MacEwen and Third, 1997).

6.16 A UK wide study on action being taken to tackle racial harassment, which included data collected in Scotland (Lemos, 2000), added support to the findings of the studies cited above: it found that action against perpetrators was rare, support for victims limited, and largely provided by community-based organisations. Many agencies felt that despite the publicity surrounding the murder of Stephen Lawrence, under-reporting was still a problem.

6.17 The recent thematic inspection of the police found that it was currently not possible to obtain a credible picture of race crime, and suggested that ineffective recording practices may be a factor (HMIC, 2001). Further, little is known about the extent to which Procurators Fiscal decide to proceed with prosecution of cases involving a racial motivation, once such incidents have been reported to them either by the police or non-police reporting agencies. Netto and MacEwen (1998a) point out that monitoring the prosecution of such cases is feasible and desirable from two perspectives. Firstly, it would highlight any difficulties that were experienced in the prosecution of offences. Secondly, it would demonstrate to the broader community that the Procurator Fiscal Service took its duty seriously and made a serious attempt to prosecute offences and improve the service provided to the public, particularly its minority ethnic population. Records of satisfactory resolution as acknowledged by the victim, without need for prosecution, would also be useful.

6.18 Netto and MacEwen (1998a) examined the roles and responsibilities of key agents in the criminal justice system, local authority departments and voluntary organisations. The report makes several recommendations towards co-ordinated action within each sector and across the three sectors in tackling racial harassment, which are elaborated on in a code of best practice (Netto and MacEwen, 1998b). A related publication (Netto, 2000) considers the strengths of black voluntary organisations in recording racial incidents and supporting victims of such harassment. It also points to strategies for enabling black voluntary organisations to become more actively involved within a co-ordinated, multi-agency approach to tackling racial harassment.

6.19 Examining the adequacy of legal measures to combat racial harassment in Scotland, MacEwen (2000) has found that the failure to identify the relevance of any 'racial' element in crime as a requirement, prior to the Crime and Disorder Act 1998, has led to its marginalisation in prosecution. MacEwen observes that the experience of prosecution and sentencing for racially motivated crimes is reflective of a particular dynamic in which the dominant social norms negotiate recognition of subdominant values. Combating racism, the evidence suggests, is dependent on a re-evaluation of cultural values by the power elites - including those determining policy and its application in the criminal justice system. This will not be achieved without more effective dialogue with minority ethnic groups (MacEwen, 2000). Forthcoming research by Clark and Moody will include an evaluation of the use of the new offences of racial harassment and racially aggravated conduct introduced by sections 33 and 96 of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998.

6.20 Kelly (2000) has, on examining the murder cases relating to the deaths of Noor Mohammed (1925), Hector Smith (1975), Axmed Abuukar Sheekh (1989), Shamsudden Mahmood (1994) and Imran Khan (1998) concluded that the racist element of these crimes was generally overlooked or played down, and that there was a significant change in attitude

of the High Court between 1975 and 1989. She argues that while police statistics indicate advances in understanding the impact of racism on minority ethnic communities, the murder trials that have taken place after 1975 indicate 'a hardening of attitude towards denial of racist context.'

MINORITY ETHNIC PEOPLE'S CONTACT WITH THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM

6.21 In this section, we examine minority ethnic people's contact with the criminal justice system, including their experiences as victims of crime, their attitudes to the police, the policy and practice of the police in relation to minority ethnic people and minority ethnic people as agents of the criminal justice system.

Victimisation studies and minority ethnic people

6.22 There is limited research on minority ethnic people's experience of crime in Scotland although nationally, the British Crime Survey (BCS) has found a statistically higher risk of victimisation among this population than the general population. It also revealed that the former scored higher than the latter on all BCS measures of fear of crime (Home Office, 1998).

6.23 The 2000 Scottish Crime Survey (SCS) is the latest in a series of surveys of public experiences and perceptions of crime that have been carried out in Scotland, and is the first to include an ethnic minority "booster" sample in addition to the main sample. The ethnic minority booster sample was drawn by searching for appropriate looking names in the electoral register. Given the limited information available on Scotland's ethnic minority population (dating from the 1991 Census), the electoral register was the only viable sampling frame. The method used to select addresses meant that only those persons with surnames evidently or potentially of Muslim, Hindu or Chinese origin were selected. While this method provided a sampling frame for Scotland's largest ethnic minority groups, it automatically excluded individuals sharing surnames with the rest of the population and who would describe themselves as belonging to an ethnic minority group. A total of 380 interviews with ethnic minority adults were achieved through the booster sampling process outlined above. A further 44 interviews with ethnic minority respondents picked up through the main sample were then transferred into the booster sample to give a total booster sample size of 424. Analysis of this survey is awaited; it will include an analysis of minority ethnic people's experiences of racist crime (Clark and Moody, forthcoming).

6.24 The 1991 Scottish Office Survey revealed that ethnic minority households were more likely to be victims of motor vehicle crime than white households, and that Pakistani households were especially likely to be victims of vehicle crime. Verbal abuse in the workplace (apart from colleagues) was also more likely to be experienced by Pakistani and Chinese males, and Chinese females; the particular vulnerability of Chinese females relative to females from other minority ethnic groups might be related to their higher rates of employment.

6.25 MacLeod et al (1996) has found that although crime was often not seen to be racially motivated among minority ethnic victims, 'race' was perceived in some way to explain the crime. Interestingly, the psychological consequences of crime were reported to be more severe

among those who saw the crime as racially motivated compared to those who did not believe the crime to be thus motivated.

Minority ethnic people's attitudes to the police

6.26 In Scotland, conflicting results relating to minority ethnic people's attitudes towards the police have emerged. In a comparative study based on a survey of 555 white respondents and 627 Indian, Pakistani and Chinese respondents in what was then Strathclyde Region, Ditton et al (1999) found no major differences between white respondents and members of minority ethnic groups, although white respondents were generally more concerned by crime, more victimised by it and more critical of police than minority ethnic respondents.

6.27 In contrast, an earlier study on the experience of victims of crime in Dundee, Edinburgh and Glasgow based on interviews with 255 victims of crime revealed higher rates of dissatisfaction with action taken by the police and less favourable attitudes towards the police than the general population (MacLeod et al 1996). The small sample size of ethnic minority people (35) means that these results have to be viewed with some caution but this is an area in which further research, using both quantitative and qualitative methodology would be useful. Research by Clark and Moody (forthcoming) will provide some additional information on attitudes to the police.

Policy and practice of the police

6.28 The thematic inspection of police race relations in Scotland which was recently carried out by HM Inspectorate of Constabulary for Scotland (HMIC, 2001) revealed several areas in which policy and practice can be improved. It found that although many police forces had developed race relation policies, policy-practice gaps were evident, with some forces having formulated an effective policy and others demonstrating effective practices. Some of the main themes to emerge in the report were:

- the sensitivity of stop and search powers of the police to minority ethnic people
- the importance of community consultation at different levels
- the need for continued partnership working, particularly in relation to racial incidents
- the need for well-defined systems for recording racial incidents and the importance of communicating these systems to staff
- the need for more effective implementation of legislation enacted by Parliament to tackle racist crime (HMIC, 2001)

6.29 CRU has recently commissioned a study on the stop and search powers of the police in Scotland (Reid-Howie Associates, forthcoming). However, there are broader issues that are of concern, of which the most pressing is the extent to which the Scottish police forces inspire trust among minority ethnic people.

Minority ethnic people as agents of the criminal justice system

6.30 Research on the experience of minority ethnic people as agents of the criminal justice system, such as the police and solicitors, is even more limited. CRU has recently commissioned a pilot study on the experiences of black and minority ethnic police officers in Scotland (Onifade, forthcoming). This study and the larger exercise which is planned, is welcomed, given the dearth of information on selection, recruitment and employment-related issues of minority ethnic people within the police forces. A wider study, which includes information collected from Scotland on ethnic minorities in the police service, examines the barriers to recruitment in the police force and the retention of people. Presenting profiles of the numbers at each rank from ethnic minority communities, it identifies signs of progress in recruitment but calls for more attention to be paid to the retention of individuals (unknown, 1996)

MINORITY ETHNIC PEOPLE'S CONTACT WITH THE CIVIL JUSTICE SYSTEM

6.31 Research into the experience of minority ethnic people in the civil justice system in Scotland is likely to involve one of two issues. The first is their experience of the system as pursuers or defendants in general and the second their experience of using the system in order to seek the specific remedies available for racial discrimination under the Race Relations Act 1976, as amended. In respect of the general experience of minority ethnic people of the civil justice system in Scotland, there appears to be little relevant research undertaken in the Scottish context, whether by reference to legal representation, employment tribunals, the Sheriff Court, the involvement of Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs) such as Trade Unions and Race Equality Councils, or even employment in the legal profession. Some relevant generic studies have taken place which cover not only Scotland but also the rest of the UK. For example, the enforcement of the Race Relations Act 1976 in Employment has been examined (see McCrudden et al, 1991) There have also been studies on the enforcement system (see, for example, MacEwen, 1997). Similarly, the report submitted once every two years to the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination and the observations of NGOs to the Committee, as well as the Committee's reports, themselves, provide a view on the workings of the civil justice system in the UK. However, there is seldom convincing coverage of the Scottish perspective.

6.32 As victims of racial discrimination, minority ethnic people's experience of the civil justice system is likely to concern one or more of the following:

- the support provided by the CRE of complainants in Scotland and the number of successful investigations conducted by the CRE under the Race Relations Act 1976
- an evaluation of the process for seeking remedies, including issues relating to proof
- access to translating and interpreting services, Legal Aid (where applicable in non-employment cases) and other support provision
- an evaluation of the process and findings in Tribunals and Sheriff Courts and
- the employment of ethnic minorities in the civil justice system.

6.33 There appears to be very little analysis of the above issues, although Ross (2000) has examined difficulties of proof relating to discrimination cases in Scotland. The CRE has a duty

to review the Race Relations Act 1976 periodically and their Third Review was published in April 1998 (CRE, 1998). Other reviews and assessments have been conducted. These include a review of the enforcement of the UK anti-discrimination legislation following consultation in 1999, by the Centre for Public Law with the Judge Institute of Management Studies (1999).

6.34 Minority ethnic people's use of services provided by solicitors, particularly in relation to housing, employment and immigration has been the subject of a Glasgow-based study (Ross, 1993). This study highlighted the importance of culturally sensitive policy and practice in relation to legal provision and the important role played by community-based organisations. Common barriers were language differences, ignorance of information rights and means of redress. Importantly, there was also a perception among minority ethnic people that solicitors did not have the necessary expertise in relation to immigration or discrimination, or understanding of cultural differences.

6.35 The Immigration and Asylum Act 1999 introduced a new regime relating to asylum seekers and impacted on their experience and expectations of the civil justice system. The recent racial harassment of asylum seekers in Sighthill in Glasgow illustrates the social difficulties experienced and the need for the law to protect civil interests. The role of the National Asylum Support Service and its contacts with local authorities and housing providers with a view to dispersing refugees in Scotland has a number of ramifications. Research on how the interests of asylum seekers are best protected is undeveloped. Similarly, the role of the CRE and Race Equality Councils in promoting the social, economic, cultural, linguistic, civil and political needs of minority ethnic groups requires further investigation. Careful consideration also needs to be given to how best the general and specific civil duties under the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 can be upheld within the existing civil justice structure.

Minority ethnic people's experience of court practice

6.36 An important aspect of minority ethnic people's experience of court practice either as accused persons or witnesses is the extent to which they are able to understand the charges and the proceedings. A study on foreign language interpreters in the Scottish criminal courts (MVA, 1996) commissioned by CRU, revealed several issues of concern. Covering seven local authority interpreting services across Scotland, the study revealed a wide disparity in the competence of interpreters. Most had no formal training in interpreting skills, and 29% had received no induction or briefing prior to their first court assignment. Among the latter, many felt that they had made mistakes that might not have occurred if they had been trained. Conversely, court officials had not received any training in how to work effectively with interpreters. More generally, Ferry et al (2000) and Kelly (1999, 2000) highlight the importance of raising standards in interpreting. Kelly outlines some basic principles in relation to legal interpreting, examines matters of procedure, and draws some lessons from the Lockerbie Trial (Kelly, 2000).

6.37 A feasibility study on legal representation among those who have been criminally accused provided a 'snap-short' picture of the extent to which criminally accused persons appear non-represented in the Glasgow Sheriff and District Courts (Burman et al, 1998). One of the key findings of this study was that although non-representation was common in the

District Courts, proportionately more ethnic minority ethnic people were likely to appear without legal representation.

MULTIPLE VICTIMISATION AND DISCRIMINATION

6.38 Studies on multiple victimisation, arising from factors such as gender, age and disability, in addition to ethnicity, are rare. An Edinburgh-based survey on women's safety (City of Edinburgh Council, 1997) which included a small number of women who described themselves as non-white, suggested that these women may feel less safe than white women in similar circumstances, especially after dark. Among those who had experienced one or more forms of crime, only a few women had contacted external agencies for help. The personal safety of black and ethnic minority women in Edinburgh has also been the subject of a student dissertation (McEvelly, 1998).

6.39 The National Strategy to Address Domestic Abuse in Scotland (2000) recognises that there are specific issues faced by women and children from black and minority ethnic groups who experience domestic abuse, and requires that these issues be addressed in the development of services. The Strategy's definition of domestic abuse refers to abuse from family members as well as partners and ex-partners, in the context of black and minority ethnic communities.

6.40 However, few studies have examined the experiences and support available to women from a minority ethnic background who face domestic violence, despite this being a major focus of research activity in the majority population (Brown, Breitenbach and Myers 1994, Myers and Brown, 1997) and the subject of the high profile Zero Tolerance Campaign. Early studies (Harvie, 1990; 1991) have revealed the limited support that was available to such women and their low awareness of their rights.

6.41 Strathclyde Regional Council as it then was more recently carried out a local study to examine the experiences of black and minority ethnic women who face domestic violence (McCrae and Brown, 1995). This revealed the particularity of the situation faced by women from minority ethnic communities and their problems in seeking adequate and appropriate support. Significantly, the report highlighted that the violence which these women faced within their homes was not necessarily restricted to that inflicted by men but included acts of violence from other members of the family. The report also highlighted women's limited ability to participate in consultation exercises by service managers which were mainly conducted with 'community leaders' who were predominantly men. Although some of the statutory and voluntary organisations that participated in the study had ethnic monitoring systems, incidents of domestic violence were not ethnically monitored. Hence, it was difficult to estimate the scale and nature of the problem.

6.42 Existing responses to domestic violence in minority ethnic communities by statutory and voluntary organisations appear not to have been systematically evaluated. There is increasing recognition of the needs of children who are confronted with violence within their homes either directly or indirectly, along with the needs of their mothers. Shakti Women's Aid in Edinburgh is in the process of identifying funding for a national project on the needs of women and children who are faced with domestic violence in black and minority ethnic communities.

OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH

6.43 In this section of the report, the research considered above will be considered in relation to the main themes which have emerged, their scope, funding and methodology. Gaps in research will also be identified.

Scope

6.44 The geographical scope of the studies has been mixed. The thematic inspection of the police was a Scotland wide study (HMIC, 2001), the two studies on racist victimisation and action taken to counter racial harassment were UK wide studies, which included information collected from Scotland (Chahal and Julienne, 1999; Simpson and Gravel, 2000). The review of anti-discriminatory law enforcement agencies took a European perspective (MacEwen, 1997). Some studies have covered either a few cities (MacLeod et al, 1996) or a few local authority areas (MVA Consultancy, 1996). Many other studies have been based in Glasgow/Strathclyde Region (Ross, 1993; McCrae and Brown, 1995; Burman et al, 1998; Ditton et al, 1999) and Edinburgh (Lee et al, 1996; BCDP, 1997; Netto and MacEwen, 1998a). One study has been conducted in South Lanarkshire (Hampton, 1999).

6.45 These studies have not tended to focus on any particular ethnic group. A few studies have considered the experiences of women (Harvie, 1991; McCrae and Brown, 1995) and one study has considered the experiences of young people (Hampton, 1998).

Perspectives of the studies

6.46 Some studies have considered the perspectives of minority ethnic people, particularly in relation to their experience of racial harassment, their experience of crime, their attitudes to the police and their access to legal services. Most of these studies have taken a qualitative approach, drawing on data collected from semi-structured interviews or focus group discussions.

6.47 Other studies have reviewed the policy and practice of various elements of the criminal and civil justice system including the police, the tribunals, the district and sheriff courts, the Procurator Fiscal's Office and the Crown Office. A few studies have considered the effectiveness of the multi-agency approaches in tackling racial harassment and domestic violence.

Funding

6.48 The Scottish Executive Central Research Unit has emerged as a major funder of research. The Joseph Rowntree Foundation has funded at least two studies in this area. Local authorities, universities and voluntary organisations have separately funded a small number of studies.

RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Main Themes	Identified Gaps	Recommendations
<i>Criminal Justice</i>		

<p>The fear and experience of racial harassment is a major concern for minority ethnic people and has been the sole focus of many studies or a phenomenon which emerges in many other studies.</p> <p>The recent thematic inspection of the police found that it was currently not possible to obtain a credible picture of race crime, and suggested that ineffective recording practices may be a factor.</p>	<p>There is little information about the geographical areas in which racial harassment occurs on a national scale.</p> <p>Information on where minority ethnic people are most susceptible to racial harassment (for example, the home, workplace, school, on the streets) is also lacking, although forthcoming research is expected to provide some of this information.</p>	<p>A feasibility study of the potential for developing a centrally co-ordinated system for recording and monitoring racial incidents on a Scotland-wide basis would be very useful. Such research would include an investigation into the opportunities and constraints of co-ordinating data on racist incidents that are currently maintained by the police and local race equality councils.</p>
<p>Some limited research has been undertaken to evaluate the effectiveness of legislation enacted by Parliament to tackle racist crime. This includes forthcoming research to evaluate the use of the new offences of racial harassment and racially aggravated conduct.</p> <p>There has been limited research on the effectiveness of approaches to tackling racial harassment, and a multi-agency approach has been strongly recommended.</p>	<p>The process of reporting, recording and tracking racial harassment, including its classification as a crime or aggravated offence by different police forces and procurators fiscal is underdeveloped.</p> <p>Little is known about the effectiveness of multi-agency measures for tackling racial harassment across Scotland. Forthcoming research by Clark and Moody is likely to be valuable in this respect.</p>	<p>Research into best practice in responding to racial harassment under the new legislation would provide valuable guidance for the police and Crown Office in particular.</p> <p>It would be useful to build the capacity for periodic evaluation into research and data collection in this area, to allow examination of what changes have been made, why and to what effect.</p>
<p>Most studies in this area have considered the perspectives of victims of harassment. Some research attention has also been directed towards the response of public authorities to the phenomenon.</p>	<p>Little is known about the profile of perpetrators and the explanations for racist crime.</p> <p>The extent to which Procurators Fiscal decide to proceed with the prosecution of cases involving a racial motivation, once such cases have been reported to them, is unknown.</p>	<p>Quantitative and qualitative research on the profile of perpetrators and explanations for such crime would usefully complement the victim-centred focus of many studies on racial harassment.</p>
<p>Minority ethnic people's experiences of crime and victimisation, and their attitudes towards the police have been the subject of some research, although conflicting results have been obtained from some research studies.</p> <p>Analysis of the ethnic minority booster sample of the Scottish</p>	<p>Little is known about minority ethnic people as agents of the criminal justice system, for example, as police officers or solicitors.</p> <p>Some information relating to the former is likely to be obtained from</p>	<p>The response of the justice system to the implementation of the Stephen Lawrence Action Plan, particularly with reference to police employment policy and practice, should be evaluated over time.</p> <p>A comprehensive assessment of</p>

<p>Crime Survey and associated qualitative research is expected to provide additional information in the above areas.</p> <p>Some monitoring of recruitment in the public sector of the criminal justice system may result from the new duties embedded in the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000.</p>	<p>Onifade's forthcoming study.</p>	<p>the impact of the new duties of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 on the public sector, including the criminal justice system, is required. This should address how the new duties are to be embedded in policy and practice in different areas and over a period of time.</p>
<p>Some attention has been paid to minority ethnic people's experiences of Scottish criminal courts, including the extent to which they are represented in Sheriff and District Courts and their access to translating and interpreting and other services.</p> <p>More effective monitoring of the interaction of minority ethnic people and the criminal justice system is expected to follow the implementation of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000.</p>	<p>There is a lack of disaggregated information at various stages of the Scottish criminal justice system, rendering invisible the different patterns of contact by minority ethnic people and the decision-making processes of its agents at different points of the system.</p> <p>There are currently no figures that provide a detailed breakdown of numbers, offences and disposals. Other stages of the system (police stops, bail and remand decisions, community orders, rates of acquittal, disposals etc.) are not monitored by ethnicity. It is thus not presently possible to identify whether minority ethnic people are over-represented in Scottish courts.</p>	<p>Consideration should be given to how best research can identify the extent to which institutional racism may be disadvantaging minority ethnic people, as those charged with offences, those detained but not charged and as prisoners, and to how progress can be monitored.</p>
<p><i>Civil Justice System</i></p>		
<p>A small number of independent studies have reviewed the implementation of the Race Relations Act 1976, the effectiveness of the legislation and the role of enforcement agencies.</p> <p>Access to legal and support services have been considered in a few studies.</p>	<p>Very limited research has been undertaken of minority ethnic people's experiences within the civil justice system.</p> <p>An evaluation of Tribunals and Sheriff Courts has yet to be undertaken.</p> <p>An evaluation of the processes for seeking remedies for racial discrimination, including issues related to proof, has not yet been carried out.</p> <p>The extent to which the work force in the civil justice system is reflective of the ethnic composition of the population it serves is also not known.</p>	<p>Qualitative and quantitative research of minority ethnic people's experience of the civil justice system in discrimination and non-discrimination cases is a priority. In discrimination cases, an analysis of complaints by category and by complainant together with a review of process and outcomes would help to identify problems with the present arrangements.</p> <p>An evaluation of Tribunals and Sheriff Courts would be useful. The comparative experience of 'race'-based cases with other categories may raise issues including the adequacy of translating and interpreting provision, perceived credibility of witnesses and the handling of cases by the bench.</p>

		<p>Evaluation of the processes for seeking remedies should be made, including issues related to proof and the willingness of the Scottish courts and tribunals to infer discrimination from breaches of the relevant codes of practice.</p> <p>Evaluation of the effectiveness of equal opportunities policies in the civil justice system would be useful.</p>
<p>The National Strategy to Address Domestic Abuse in Scotland recognises that there are specific issues faced by women and children from minority ethnic communities, which need to be addressed in the development of services.</p>	<p>Very limited research is available on the circumstances of minority ethnic women and children escaping from domestic violence and the adequacy and appropriateness of current provision for them.</p>	<p>Research into the experiences of minority ethnic women and children who are victims of domestic violence and the adequacy of existing service provision is identified as a priority area.</p>

REFERENCES

- Black Community Development Project (1998) *Second needs survey report*. Edinburgh: BCDP
- Bowes, A M, Dar N S and Sim D F (1990b) 'Racism and Harassment of Asians in Glasgow'. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* Vol.13 No.1 pp 71-79.
- Burman, M, Mann, L and Bourque, N (1998) *Feasibility Study of Legal Representation among white and ethnic minority criminal accused*. Edinburgh: Scottish Office Central Research Unit
- Brown, A, Breitenbach, E and Myers, F (1994) *Equality Issues in Scotland: A Research Review* Manchester: Equal Opportunities Commission
- Centre for Public Law with the Judge Institute of Management Studies (1999) *Independent Review of the Enforcement of Anti-Discrimination Legislation* Cambridge: University of Cambridge
- Chahal, K and Julienne, L (1999) '*We can't all be white!*': *Racist victimisation in the UK* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation
- Clark, I and Moody, S (forthcoming) *Ethnic minority victims of racist crime in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Scottish Executive Central Research Unit
- Commission for Racial Equality (1997) *Response to the consultation document on new offences of racial harassment and racially motivated violence* London: CRE
- Commission for Racial Equality (1998) *Third Review of the Race Relations Act 1976: consultative paper*, London: CRE
- Commission for Racial Equality (2000) *Making a difference in Scotland: the CRE Work in 1999/2000*. Edinburgh: CRE
- Commission for Racial Equality (2001) *The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry: An action plan for Scotland*. Edinburgh: CRE
- Ditton, J, Bannister, J, Farrall, S and Gilchrist, E (1999) *Attitudes to crime, victimisation and the police in Scotland: a comparison of white and ethnic minority views* Edinburgh: Scottish Office Central Research Unit
- Ferry, A., Kelly, E and Onifade, D (1999) 'Equal under the law: a matter of interpretation?' In *Police, The Voice of the Service, Police Federation of England and Wales*, vol xxxi, no 9: pp 23-27
- Hampton, K (1998) *Youth and Racism: perceptions and experiences of Young People in Glasgow*. Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University
- Hampton, K (1999) *Experiences of Racism and Racial Harassment in South Lanarkshire*. Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

Harvie, L (1990) '*Fighting the whole world*' *Action-research on sexual violence against Asian women in Glasgow* Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Stirling

Harvie, L (1991) 'Sexual violence and the voluntary sector: Asian women and wife abuse' In Bowes, A M and Sim, D F (eds.) *Demands and Constraints: Ethnic Minorities and Social Services in Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations

Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary (2001) *Without Prejudice? A thematic inspection of police race relations in Scotland* Edinburgh: HMIC

Home Office, (1998). *Ethnicity and Victimisation: Findings from the 1996 British Crime Survey* London: Home Office Research and Statistics Directorate, Issue 6/98

Kelly, E (2000) 'Racism, Police and Courts in Scotland', *Scottish Affairs* No 30: pp 141-160.

Kelly, E (2000) *Legal Interpreting and translation – A commentary*, www.thelockerbiertial.com

Lee, C, Nasra N and Egan A (1996), *Whose Community? The needs of Black and Minority Ethnic People in Wester Hailes* Edinburgh: Wester Hailes Anti-Racism Project

Lemos, G (2000) *Racial harassment: action on the ground*. London: Lemos and Crane

MacEwen, M (ed.) (1997) *Anti-Discrimination Law Enforcement: A Comparative Perspective*, Aldershot: Avebury

MacEwen, M (2000) 'Racial Harassment: the legal response' *International Journal of Discrimination and Law*, Vol.4, No 2: pp 119-151

MacEwen, M, Dalton, M and Murie, A (1994) *Race and Housing in Scotland: A Literature Review and Bibliography* Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit/School of Planning & Housing, Edinburgh College of Art/Heriot-Watt University

MacEwen M and Third (1997) *Ethnic minority access to public housing: SEMRU 1997 survey of local authorities: summary of key findings*. Edinburgh, School of Planning and Housing, Edinburgh College of Art/Heriot Watt University

MacLeod, M Prescott, L and Carson, L (1996) *Listening to Victims of Crime: Victimisation episodes and the criminal justice system in Scotland* Edinburgh: The Scottish Executive

McCrae, R and Brown, U (1995). *No Voice - No Choice: A Report on Domestic Violence within Black and Ethnic Minority Communities* Glasgow: Strathclyde Regional Council

McCrudden C Smith D J, and Brown C (1991) *Racial Justice at Work*, Policy Studies Institute: London

McEvelly, L (1998) *Out of sight, out of mind: an evaluation of personal safety for black and ethnic minority women in Edinburgh* MA Social Policy, Department of Social Policy,

University of Edinburgh

Myers, F and Brown, A (1997) *Gender Equality in Scotland: A Research Review Update* Manchester: Equal Opportunities Commission

Netto, G (2000) 'Partners in name only? The involvement of black/minority ethnic voluntary organisations in co-ordinated approaches to tackling racial harassment' *Journal of Public Policy and Administration* Vol. 15, No. 3: pp 75-91

Netto, G and MacEwen, M (1998a) *Countering Racial Harassment through co-ordinated action: a strategic review of policies and procedures in Edinburgh*. Edinburgh: The Scottish Office Central Research Unit

Netto, G and MacEwen, M (1998b) *The Care Guide to joint action on racial harassment* Edinburgh: City of Edinburgh Council

Onifade, D (forthcoming) *A pilot study on the experiences of black and minority ethnic police officers in Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Reid-Howie Associates (forthcoming) *Study of stop and search among white and minority ethnic young people in Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Ross, J (1993) *Access to Justice for Ethnic Minorities*. Glasgow: Scottish Consumer Council

Ross, J (2000) 'The Burden of Proving Discrimination', *International Journal of Discrimination and the Law*, Vol. 4, No 2: pp 95-117

Sampson, A and Phillips, C (1992) *Multiple Victimisation: racial attacks on an east London estate* London: Home Office Police Department

Scottish Executive (1999a) *The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry: An Action Plan for Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Scottish Executive (2000) *Equality in Scotland: Guide to Data Sources* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Scottish Executive (2001) *The Stephen Lawrence Inquiry: Review of Scottish Executive Action Plan - Review by the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry Group* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

The MVA Consultancy (1996) *Foreign Language Interpreters in the Scottish Criminal Courts* Edinburgh: The Scottish Office Central Research Unit

Unknown (1996) 'Ethnic Minorities in the Police Force' *Equal Opportunities Review* Vol. 68: pp. 10-18

Virdee, S (1997). Racial Harassment in Modood, T Berthoud, R Lakey, J Nazroo, J Smith, P Virdee, S and Beishon, S (eds.) *Ethnic Minorities in Britain*. London: Policy Studies Institute

CHAPTER SEVEN RACE, EMPLOYMENT AND ENTERPRISE

INTRODUCTION

7.1 A recent paper published by the Scottish Executive, *The Goal of Full Employment* (Scottish Executive, 2001a), states that one of its aims is 'employment opportunity for all.' It notes significant improvements in the condition of Scotland's labour market over the last few years, and observes a strong performance by the market compared to the standards of recent decades. It finds low rates of unemployment, especially in youth and long-term unemployment, and reveals that employment and vacancies are at or around 'record levels'. However, it also acknowledges the existence of communities in Scotland with persistently high levels of unemployment and concludes that in order for the goal of full employment to be achieved, levels of employability in these areas have to be increased. People with children and people with disabilities are mentioned but not minority ethnic communities.

7.2 A review of the Careers Service (Scottish Executive, 2001b) put forward the need for 'an inclusive all age careers service that individuals can turn to at different transition points' which is impartial, confidential and client-centred.' Whilst issues in relation to ethnicity and careers advice are not explored in any detail, the review recognises that the Careers Service has a critical role to play in the Government's social justice and equality of opportunity agenda. Minority ethnic groups are identified as one group amongst others who may merit specific focus. Following from this, the Scottish Executive has also proposed the establishment of 'Careers Scotland', a unified service for every area, which is intended to provide a national voice for careers guidance and to set national standards (Scottish Executive, 2001c).

7.3 Within the legislative context, the introduction of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000 will extend and strengthen the provisions of the Race Relations Act 1976, and place a new positive, enforceable duty on all public authorities. This will involve scrutiny of their race equality policies in a number of areas, including employment. This makes an assessment of research relating to employment and enterprise issues of minority ethnic communities particularly timely.

7.4 Although employment is one of the most critical factors which define the experiences of minority ethnic communities, the data available for Scotland on employment issues is limited and fragmented, a view reinforced recently by the REAF sub-committee on Enterprise and Lifelong Learning in drawing up its recommendations (REAF, 2001). Existing research tends to support the trends identified by Modood (1997) in depicting a picture of racial inequality, but also of divergence in the employment experiences of minority ethnic groups, which is becoming increasingly marked. A more plural analysis of race and the way in which it intersects with other types of discrimination based on gender, religion and culture (Modood, 1992; Bhavani, 1994) is clearly desirable.

7.5 Employment patterns are closely related to poverty and affect minority ethnic peoples' experience of housing, education and other public services, the subject of other chapters in this report. In particular, close links have been established between socio-economic status and health (Davey-Smith et al, 2000). Closely related to employment is enterprise, of particular significance to minority ethnic communities, given their high rates of self-employment and their concentration within a limited range of industries.

7.6 This chapter will consider Scottish-based research in both employment and enterprise. First, we consider the statistical sources available on employment and minority ethnic people. Next, we consider research that explores the employment issues relevant to specific groups: youth, women and refugees. This is followed by an examination of research related to the existence, nature and implementation of equal opportunities policies with regard to employment, including employer/employee perspectives and recruitment. We then examine studies on minority ethnic businesses/enterprises. Finally, an overview of research is presented which identifies the scope of the studies, the methodologies employed, main themes and identified gaps. Recommendations for further research are also provided.

STATISTICAL SOURCES

7.7 While there are a number of potential secondary data sources (for example, the Labour Force Survey, the General Household Survey and the Scottish Household Survey) on the labour market position of minority ethnic groups in the UK, most of these are of limited value to the Scottish context. The main reason for this is related to sampling variability and the problems of disaggregating minority ethnic data based on small sample sizes (Green and Owen, 1995). In the absence of more comprehensive recent data, the 1991 Census and the 1991 Scottish Office Survey continue to provide the basis for a number of studies on employment issues.

Employment and Social Class

7.8 The employment picture which is presented by analysis of the 1991 Census is a complex one, indicating on the one hand, some evidence of relative advantage, and on the other, considerable disadvantage. Some indicators of apparent achievement in the four major cities, which have been recognised as crude by Dalton and Hampton (1994), are:

- the proportions of Indian, Black and Chinese communities in Social Class 1 (Professional) is significantly greater than the white majority: this is most marked in the Indian community where 1 in 6 of the workforce is professional compared to 1 in 20 in the white majority
- higher proportions of Chinese are classified as skilled manual workers than the white majority, and higher proportions of Pakistanis are classified as managerial, a possible reflection of their representation in the retail service sector
- in Social Classes 4 and 5, most communities are under-represented compared to the white majority (Dalton and Hampton, 1994: 9-10).

Concentration of Economic Activity in Certain Industries and Types of Organisations

7.9 However, a very different picture emerges when the employment patterns of minority ethnic communities across occupations and industries are observed. Analysis of the 1991 Scottish Office Survey shows that ethnic minorities are generally employed in a fairly narrow range of occupations and industries: the distribution, catering, hotels and repairs industries employed 45% of ethnic minority males and 47% ethnic minority females, compared with 11% of white males and 23% white females (Scottish Office, 1991: 50).

7.10 Further findings from the 1991 Scottish Office Survey reveal a concentration of activity among ethnic minorities in certain sectors and work settings:

- a higher proportion of ethnic minority householders than white householders worked for private companies and a smaller proportion worked for a local authority
- 12% of ethnic minority employed males and 34 % of ethnic minority employed female householders worked in a family business, compared to 3% and 1% white males and females
- the extent to which ethnic minority householders were employed in family business varied across the individual minority ethnic groups: Indians 12%, Pakistanis 5% and Chinese 25%. (Scottish Office, 1991: 76)
- 34% of male ethnic minority employed householders and 28% of the female equivalents worked in a workplace where all employees were of ethnic minority origin; this was especially the case with Chinese employees (Scottish Office, 1991: 80)

7.11 The above findings would appear to support Brown's observation (2000) that limited access to labour market leads minority ethnic individuals to seek work in their own communities, where the terms of employment and pay are often informally negotiated, resulting in breaches in employment and pay legislation. This can lead to positions characterised by low pay, and an acceptance of poor working conditions and exploitation (Chaudhry, 1996). This situation is reinforced by the fact that ethnic minorities, especially Chinese males, are less likely than their white counterparts to join a trade union (Scottish Office, 1991).

Self-employment: positive choice or alternate route into employment?

7.12 Self-employment was revealed to be the predominant form of employment amongst ethnic minority communities: self-employment rates were approximately 5 times higher for the ethnic minority population (50 % of minority ethnic males) than for the white population (9 % of white males). The figures for females were 35% and 7% respectively (Scottish Office, 1991: 50). The study observed that the self-employment rates for ethnic minority males in Scotland were higher than those for Britain as indicated by the Labour Force Survey (1986-1988), where self-employment rates were 28% for Indians and 23% for Pakistanis/Bangladeshis (Scottish Office, 1991: 67).

7.13 There is conflicting evidence as to whether self-employment is a positive choice or an alternative route to employment. Deakins et al study (1995) found that whilst discrimination was not perceived as a 'primary motivating factor' in entry decisions among entrepreneurs, it affected subsequent business development decisions. In contrast, several studies suggest that self-employment is often the main alternative route into employment due to experience of discrimination in the labour market and limited occupational choice (Hampton and Bain, 1995; de Lima, 1999; Brown 2000). In this context, self-employment amongst minority ethnic groups is not a sign of affluence especially when one considers two issues: the sectors they operate in, that is, catering, retail and distribution and repair, sectors of the economy which are generally characterised by low pay and poor conditions of work; and the high proportions of self-employed who earn below the average earnings (Hampton and Bain, 1995; Brown, 2000)

Working conditions

7.14 The 1991 Scottish Office Survey also provided information on working conditions:

- on average, ethnic minority employees work longer hours than their white counterparts: ethnic minority males worked 45.8 hours on average, white males 43.6 ethnic minority females 37.9 and white females 29.7.
- amongst the ethnic minorities, Chinese males were especially likely to work longer hours (50.9 on average)
- ethnic minority males were more likely to be in part-time work than white males; however, a larger proportion of white females were in part-time work (Scottish Office, 1991: 77)
- ethnic minorities were more likely to work anti-social hours (before 6 a.m. or after 6 p.m.) than their white counterparts (Scottish Office, 1991: 78)

7.15 More recently, similar trends regarding length of working hours have been identified in the Labour Force Survey 1998 and 1999, and a SEMRU study which focused on the experience of poverty among minority ethnic women in Glasgow (Hampton, 1999). The last study found that at least half of the main earners in the households worked over time on a regular basis and a third claimed that they relied on the extra income brought in by overtime work. Overtime was undertaken mainly by Chinese, Indian Sikh and Pakistani employees, who were either self-employed or working in the catering industry.

Unemployment Rates

7.16 Unemployment rates have consistently showed higher levels of unemployment between minority ethnic people than the general population. The 1991 Scottish Office Survey found:

- a higher percentage of ethnic minority individuals were unemployed compared to the white population: 19% male minority ethnic individuals in the labour market were unemployed compared with 14% white males

- the minority ethnic female unemployment rate was more than double that of their white counterparts: 21% and 10%, respectively (Scottish Office, 1991: 49)

7.17 Analysis of the 1991 Census data concurs in revealing high unemployment rates among ethnic minority communities, and in finding that unemployment rates for ethnic minority females are twice as high as those for white majority females (Dalton and Hampton, 1994). A more recent study in Glasgow (Hampton, 1999) supports these trends. The 1991 Scottish Office Report also highlighted the factors likely to make ethnic minority people more vulnerable to unemployment:

- ethnicity: Unemployment rates were highest for Pakistanis (26%) and lowest for Chinese (8.5%)
- age: The greatest minority ethnic-white difference was found for males aged 45-64 and females 16-34
- location: The unemployment rate was higher for Glasgow than elsewhere for both minority ethnic groups and white individuals (Scottish Office 1991: 49)

7.18 Although the minority ethnic sample size in the Labour Force Survey is too small to provide reliable and robust data, recent data from the 1998 and 1999 sweep indicates that the rates of unemployment have persisted: employment rates for non-whites were 48% and for whites 71% (Scottish Executive, 2000:1). The same data source reveals that differences are even more marked when gender is taken into account: 32% non-white women were in employment compared with 68% white women (Scottish Executive, 2000: 1).

THE EMPLOYMENT EXPERIENCES OF SPECIFIC GROUPS

7.19 Research indicates that young people, women and refugees face specific problems in accessing the labour market. This section focuses on some of the key issues that have emerged.

Young people

7.20 According to the Labour Force Survey (1998 and 1999) 57% of the minority ethnic population were under 30 years old compared to 38% of the white population, yet only a few studies have focused on their employment experiences in Scotland. This included the 1991 Scottish Office Survey, which included a sample of young people in addition to the sample of ethnic minority householders. The survey reveals some striking similarities in the employment patterns of both samples. Levels of unemployment in young people was clearly gendered, employment was restricted to certain industries and workplace settings, and working hours were long:

- there were higher unemployment rates for young ethnic minority males than young ethnic minority females

- 50% of employed young people work in distribution, hotels, catering and repairs
- young people work an average of 40.6 hours a week
- a third of young people work in an exclusively Chinese or Asian workplace
(Scottish Office, 1991: 49-51)

7.21 However, the 1991 Scottish Office Survey also revealed that one in six young people were in jobs coded as professional/manager/employer and 49% of those that were employed worked in other non-manual jobs. The same survey also showed that a higher percentage of ethnic minority males than their white counterparts who were aged 16-34 were likely to be in full-time education (27% and 14%) and less likely to be in the labour market (68% and 83%).

7.22 However, other research reveals that despite higher educational qualifications, many minority ethnic youth encountered racial discrimination in their attempts to get a job (Conboy, 1992; Shing and Thornley, 1994; CRE, 1996, de Lima, 1999; Brown, 2000). The CRE (1996) study, conducted in the North of England and Scotland, found that ethnic minority youths got low responses to job applications: white applicants were three times more likely than Asians and five times more likely than Black applicants to be called for interview. Shing and Thornley's study of young Chinese in Glasgow reported that many felt that they did not make good use of their qualifications, expressed dissatisfaction with their work situation and generally felt that job opportunities were limited.

7.23 Research has also revealed that participation among minority ethnic youth in work and training schemes is low. Bent et al (1999) found that despite the claims that the New Deal programme had been promoted to all sections of the community, only 16% of their 100 respondents in their study had heard of this initiative. However, it appears that once minority ethnic youth had accessed the programme, this did not prove to be a satisfactory experience: of the approximately 800 minority ethnic people, aged 18-24, who entered the programme between 1998-2000, 540 left the scheme during this period (Scottish Executive, 2000b cited in Brown, 2000). In a wider context, the experiences of minority ethnic people have also been considered in a qualitative study of young participants of the New Deal for Young People programme (Connor et al, 2001).

7.24 Young peoples' use of the career advice service has also been found to be low (Conboy, 1992; deLima, 1999). Among the factors which account for this are lack of understanding of the nature of the service, the voluntary nature of the service and negative experiences (Conboy, 1992; de Lima 1999). Conversely, a number of career services often have little information, understanding or contact with minority ethnic communities (de Lima 1999).

7.25 A comparative study of 45 Muslim and 71 non-Muslim secondary school girls in Glasgow and Bradford sought to explore factors which affect career aspirations. The findings suggested that Muslim female pupils perceived little difference between their parents on issues relevant to their careers, including higher education. Further, there were minimal differences in the way in which Muslim and non-Muslim girls rated themselves on a range of selected personal attributes related to career choice. Such attributes included being independent, fighting for one's beliefs, having leadership ability, being self-reliant and being able to make decisions easily. However, the research reveals that despite the supportive attitudes of parents

towards their daughters' career aspirations, their knowledge base was often limited, pointing to the need for the development of communication lines between parents and career services (Sian, 1990).

Women

7.26 In relation to employment as well as many other aspects of contact with public services and poverty,

“black women’s experience is specific and different from white women’s. These differences are not constant (author’s emphasis): factors such as race, gender, age and class have a mediating influence, cutting across each other to produce both similar and different experiences between black and white women.” (EOC, 1994:5)

7.27 Although Scottish-based research in the area is limited, existing evidence is supported by evidence in England (Bhavani,1994) and the following issues are highlighted:

- self-employment is higher among minority ethnic women than white women, often hiding low pay and poor conditions of work (Chaudhry, 1996)
- minority ethnic women have lower levels of economic activity compared to white women, with Pakistani women having the lowest participation rates, and those of Chinese women approaching that of white women
- the participation rates of minority ethnic women in government training initiatives is low (Brown, 2000)

7.28 The 1991 Scottish Office Survey also found an interaction between unemployment, ability to speak English and ethnicity. Ethnic minority males who were fluent English speakers were almost equally likely as ethnic minority males who were not English speakers to be in the labour market or full time education. However, ethnic minority females who were fluent English speakers were more likely to be in the labour market in jobs or full time education than those who were non-fluent English speakers. Lack of fluency in English as a potential barrier to employment has been raised as an area which requires further examination (Chaudhry, 1996). A Glasgow-based project, Meridian, is planning to carry out some research on education, training and employment opportunities for black and minority ethnic women.

Refugees

7.29 Four studies consider the employment needs of refugees (The Black Economic Development Research Limited, 1993; Partners in Economic Development Limited, 1994; Reiss, 1994; McFarland and Walsh et al, 1994; Summerfield, 1999). Of these, McFarland and Walsh and Walsh et al (1994) offer the most comprehensive coverage. Among the main themes are the:

- high proportion of refugees who had been in professional, managerial or white collar work in their own countries

- high rates of unemployment among refugees, including high rates of long-term unemployed
- unwillingness of employers to recognise overseas qualifications
- employment of refugees in jobs which are not commensurate with their qualifications and experience
- willingness of most refugees to obtain any sort of work, and to undertake training
- lack of effectiveness of training programmes in enabling refugees to secure employment

7.30 The above factors are borne out in Reiss' (1994) study, which focused on refugee doctors and revealed their 100% unemployment in Scotland, related to their difficulties of obtaining registration from the General Medical Council. The root of the problem was identified as the absence of a refugee policy in any of the relevant medical institutions, a finding which, given the high unemployment rates in this group of people, is likely to be applicable to a number of public institutions.

RACE EQUALITY POLICIES AND PRACTICE IN EMPLOYMENT

7.31 Research related to race equality policies and practice issues in the areas of housing, education, social care, health and access to justice have been discussed in the relevant chapters. Here we limit our discussion to studies that have not been considered in those chapters. These include a study undertaken by the CRE in relation to the private sector (CRE, 2000), and an unpublished document on recruitment and retention within the Scottish Executive (CERES, 2000).

7.32 An examination of the state of equal opportunities policy and practice in the private sector labour market in Scotland by the CRE (2000) revealed that while the vast majority of employer respondents stated that they had an equal opportunities policy in place, and for most, this included race issues, responses on the impact of their policy upon workplace practices were 'less encouraging'. 61% of those with an equal opportunity policy stated that their policy consisted of nothing more than a written statement, or in some cases, an unwritten statement about equality.

7.33 The CERES study sought to identify black/minority ethnic peoples' perceptions of the Scottish Executive as an employer and areas of work they were currently employed in and might be interested in. It also identified good practice, which addressed the issue of under-representation. The overall conclusion of the study suggested that, as in the study of the private sector commissioned by the CRE, there was a gap between equal opportunities policy and practice. Mechanisms for addressing issues related to race equality were absent. The possibility of a gap between policy and practice in relation to the public sector was also briefly highlighted in Conboy's (1992) study.

MINORITY ETHNIC BUSINESSES/ENTERPRISES

7.34 Research undertaken by the REAF Sub-Committee on Enterprise and Lifelong Learning revealed that there is a dearth of published research on this subject in Scotland (REAF, 2001). Existing research falls broadly into three categories:

- surveys of minority ethnic businesses
- qualitative studies on convenience stores and corner shops
- access to advice and training in relation to minority ethnic businesses

7.35 The operation of minority ethnic businesses and enterprise has to be understood against the wider context of globalisation and international businesses in general, and small and medium size enterprises (SMEs) in particular (Deakins et al, 1995). The evidence suggests that minority ethnic businesses are concentrated in a limited range of areas, such as clothing, catering, retailing and personal services, and less in manufacturing (Deakins et al 1995; REAF, 2001), which Deakins et al see as potentially constraining growth.

7.36 Some of the main themes arising from the studies are:

- lack of knowledge and access to available support
- limited access to training
- lack of awareness of other competitors
- the need for diversification and development
- competitive threat from a number of areas

(Deakins et al 1995, 1997; Bent et al, 1999)

Access to Sources of Finance

7.37 Research suggests that minority ethnic entrepreneurs continue to rely on personal and internal sources of finance for business start up (Deakins et al, 1995; Adebayo, 1997; Bent et al 1999). Research undertaken in Edinburgh found that approximately 90% of those in the retail sector would approach their family and friends before the Bank (Wallace, 1999:63). However, Deakins et al also found that the take up and importance of bank finance is higher than previous studies would suggest, showing similar trends to other entrepreneurs and small firm owners. There were some worrying signs: the study detected a heavy reliance on short-term overdrafts, often large, and for prolonged periods of time, and further investigation revealed that relationships with bank managers were often problematic.

Access to Business Support and Training

7.38 Most studies show that with the exception of banks, solicitors and accountants, there continues to be a distinct lack of use of business support agencies, such as Local Enterprise Companies and Enterprise Trusts (Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centre (EMEC), 1992, SEMRU 1992, Deakins et al, 1995; de Lima 2001; REAF, 2001). A study undertaken by SEMRU in 1992 attempted to draw together training provision which minority ethnic businesses could access, which was mainly based in England but included some Scottish initiatives. Studies by Bent et al (1999) and Wallace (1999) found that very few of their respondents had heard of such agencies. Where there has been access to such services, low levels of satisfaction have been recorded (EMEC, 1992)

7.39 Minority ethnic entrepreneurs have also tended not to access training mainly due to lack of knowledge and language barriers (Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centre, 1992; Deakins et al, 1995; REAF, 2001). Evidence suggests that there is a demand for specific training, such as VAT compliance advice training, with one study identifying a preference for bilingual training (EMEC, 1992). In addition, the Deakins et al study (1997) found that management issues, such as human resource development and delegation were significant barriers to future development.

Enterprise development and growth

7.40 A number of studies point to intense competition, shifting consumer demands and increasing regulatory demands being made of small and medium-sized enterprises in sectors such as catering and retail, where minority ethnic businesses are primarily located. Many studies highlight the fact that minority ethnic businesses are now facing a critical stage and that in order to survive, entrepreneurs will have to diversify and adopt innovative strategies (Deakins et al, 1995; Bent et al, 1999, Wallace, 1999). The studies by Bent et al and Wallace found limited awareness among these entrepreneurs of how competition with other businesses might impact on their own business.

7.41 Key factors which have been identified in relation to enterprise development are marketing, networking, and diversification strategies, of which innovation and change is an aspect (Bent et al, 1999; Deakins et al, 1997). The barriers to successful diversification and innovation were identified as short- and long-term finance and racial prejudice.

7.42 The Department of Business and Management at Queen Margaret College in Edinburgh is currently conducting some research on competition within the Asian restaurant market. The internal and external barriers to SME development among members of the Central Scotland South Asian community is also the subject of a doctoral thesis currently being undertaken at the same department. A doctoral thesis on the topic of ethnic minority enterprise is also being currently undertaken at the Paisley Business School of the University of Paisley.

OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH

7.43 In this section of the report, the research considered above will be considered in relation to their scope, funding and methodology. The main themes, identified gaps and recommendations for future research will also be identified.

Scope

7.44 Despite the significance of employment as a defining factor in the experience of minority ethnic people in Scotland, and substantial evidence of disadvantage in the 1991 Census and the 1991 Scottish Office survey, very limited Scottish-based research has been undertaken. There has only been one national study, covering the private sector in Scotland. Much of the other research which has been undertaken, both on labour market issues and enterprise, has tended to be restricted geographically to Edinburgh and Glasgow, with the identified exception being Adebayo's (1997) study.

7.45 Some of the studies audited have focused on specific ethnic groups, for example, the study by Siann (1990) focused on young Muslim girls, Adebayo (1997) on the Afro-Caribbean population, and Hampton (1999) on women's experiences. The studies on ethnic businesses and enterprise have mainly focused on Asian businesses.

Funding

7.46 Research on employment and enterprise has been funded through a variety of means depending on the aspect of employment being researched. The CRE has funded research relating to the existence, nature and implementation of race equality policies. One study was funded by the Scottish Executive for its own internal purposes (CERES, 2000).

7.47 Research related to business and enterprise issues have been funded through a variety of means: universities and colleges, the Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centres in Edinburgh and Glasgow, local authorities, the Scottish Higher Education Funding Council (SHEFC) as well as through a package of funding including the National Lottery Charities Board.

Methodology

7.48 A number of studies could be described as combining both qualitative and quantitative approaches (Ethnic Minority Enterprise, 1992; Bent et al, 1999; CRE 2000) with sample sizes of between 100 and 500. The main methods used were postal questionnaires, telephone surveys and interviews. Studies using predominantly qualitative approaches included Conboy (1992) Sian (1990), Deakins et al (1995) and Farland and Walsh (1995) and the main methods used were guided questionnaires and interviews.

RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Main Themes	Identified Gaps	Recommendations
<p>There are some signs of relative advantage among certain minority ethnic communities. However, economic activity among these communities appears restricted to a narrow range of occupations and industries (that tend to feature low pay and poor working conditions) and organisation types (such as family businesses and other private sector companies).</p> <p>Self-employment is five times higher in minority ethnic communities than the general population; there is conflicting evidence as to whether this is a positive choice or an alternative route into employment in response to racial discrimination and limited occupational choice.</p>	<p>There is a lack of current, robust statistical data on employment disaggregated by minority ethnic group, in Scotland.</p> <p>There is a lack of information on the constraints and opportunities facing minority ethnic groups in the labour market.</p>	<p>A plural analysis of the labour market which takes into account the interaction of factors such as gender, age, culture, and religion in shaping the experience of minority ethnic groups would enable us to arrive at a greater understanding of the constraints and opportunities faced by these groups.</p>
<p>There is well-documented evidence of racial discrimination in employment practice, particularly in relation to recruitment practices in the private sector.</p>	<p>Studies of race equality policy and practice in the public and third sectors that consider employment practices and their impact on minority ethnic people is lacking.</p> <p>Little is known about the experiences of minority ethnic groups who are in employment.</p>	<p>There is a need for evaluative studies of the existence, nature and implementation of equal opportunities policies, with particular regard to employment, in the public and voluntary sector in the key areas of housing, education, social care, health care and the criminal and civil justice systems.</p>
<p>Unemployment rates are consistently shown to be higher for minority ethnic communities in comparison with the white majority.</p>	<p>The effects of multiple discrimination on employment opportunities have been under-researched; in particular, there is an absence of research on the barriers to employment among specific groups such as minority ethnic women and their access to training and other forms of support.</p>	<p>An in-depth exploration of the complex ways in which minority ethnic women's career aspirations and access to employment and training are shaped by racism, sexism and class differences is a priority. This should include barriers to participation in, and experiences of, the labour market.</p>
<p>Young people from minority ethnic backgrounds appear to experience specific barriers in seeking employment and accessing training opportunities.</p>	<p>There is limited Scottish-based research on the experiences of young minority ethnic people in relation to careers advice, access to work, experiences of government programmes (including New Deal)</p>	<p>An exploratory study into minority ethnic young people's career aspirations and access to employment and training, including barriers to, and experiences in, the labour market</p>

	[See also Education Chapter p46].	is a priority.
Studies of the work experiences of refugees show a high proportion have been in professional, managerial or white collar work in their own countries; high rates of unemployment; an unwillingness of employers to recognise overseas qualifications and employment of refugees in jobs that did not reflect their qualifications and experience.	There is a lack of research that investigates methods for overcoming the barriers faced by refugees in securing employment.	Research that considers the development of models of policy and practice, which may serve to enhance refugees' opportunities in the labour market is a priority.
Minority ethnic businesses and enterprises face competitive threats in a number of areas, are concentrated in a limited number of sectors, have poor access to business training, support and advice, rely heavily on personal networks for finance and face racial discrimination.	Gaps in research include lack of information on the business involvement of Chinese, African, African Caribbean communities, as well as a lack of baseline data on the extent and nature of minority ethnic businesses in Scotland and their contribution to the Scottish economy.	A snapshot study of minority ethnic small and medium-sized enterprises in Scotland is required. This should include quantitative data on sectors of operation, size, scale and turnover, ownership and operation patterns and geographical location, as well as qualitative data on access to finance, business advice and support, motivational factors, and barriers to diversification and innovation.

REFERENCES

- Adebayo K (1997) *The Development of ethnic business in Aberdeen: Afro-Caribbean* (sic) MBA thesis, University of Aberdeen
- Bent, R, Seaman C and Wallace, C (1999) *Convenience Stores and the Ethnic Retailer Independents Under Pressure and Threat*, Queen Margaret University College, Edinburgh
- Bhavani, R (1994) *Black Women in the Labour Market: A Research Review*, Equal Opportunities Commission: Manchester
- Brown, U (2000) *Race, Ethnicity and Poverty*, Briefing Sheet 12, The Scottish Poverty Information Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University
- CERES (2000) *Black/Minority Ethnic Recruitment and Retention Project*, Summary Report, CERES, University of Edinburgh
- Chaudhry, F (1996) *Race and Poverty in Strathclyde: Issues and Opportunities*. Glasgow: Strathclyde Poverty Alliance:
- Commission for Racial Equality (1996) 'We regret to Inform You...' CRE: London
- Commission for Racial Equality (2000) *Equal Opportunities and Private Sector Employment in Scotland*, CRE: Edinburgh,
- Conboy, M (1992) *Still Not an Issue?* Stirling: Central Racial Equality Council
- Connor, W. Ritchie, J. and Woodfield, K. (2001) *Experiences of New Deal: Qualitative Profiles of Young Participants* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive
- Dalton, M. and Hampton, K. (1994) *Scotland's ethnic minority community 1991 A Census Summary* Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University
- Davey-Smith, G, Chaturvedi, N, Harding S, Nazroo, J and Williams, R (2000) Ethnic Inequalities in Health: a review of UK epidemiological evidence. *Critical Public Health* Vol. 10 No 4: pp 377-408
- de Lima (1999) 'Research and Action in the Scottish Highlands', in Henderson, P and Kaur, R (eds), *Rural Racism*, London: Community Development
- de Lima, P (2001) *Needs not Numbers: An exploratory Study of Minority Ethnic Groups in Rural Scotland*, London: Commission for Racial Equality
- Deakins D, Majmudar M and Paddison, A (1995) *Ethnic Minority Enterprise Development in the West of Scotland*, University of Paisley
- Deakins D, Majmudar M and Paddison, A (1997) 'Developing success strategies for ethnic minorities in business: evidence from Scotland' *New Community*: Vol. 23, No. 3: pp 325 - 342

Ethnic Minority Enterprise Centre (1992) *A Survey Carried out for Strathclyde Regional Council Partnership Office and Glasgow Development Agency*, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

Equal Opportunities Commission (1994) *Equal Opportunities for Black and Ethnic Minority Ethnic Women in Scotland*, EOC: Glasgow

Green A E and Owen D F (1995) 'Ethnic Minority Groups in Regional and Local Labour Markets in Britain: A review of Data Sources and Associated Issues' *Regional studies* Vol. 29 No.8: pp.729-735

Hampton, K. (1999) *The Poverty Experiences of Black and Minority Ethnic Women in Glasgow*, Research Paper Number 11 Series 2, SEMRU, Glasgow Caledonian University

Hampton, K. and Bain, J. (1995) *Poverty and Ethnic Minorities in Scotland*, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

Labour Force Surveys (1998 and 1999)

<http://www.Scotland.gov.uk/library3/society/equality/esem-01.asp> accessed on 6th June 2001

McFarland E and Walsh D (1995) *Refugees in Strathclyde Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit Research Paper: Number 6*, Glasgow Caledonian University

Modood T (1992) *Not easy being British: Colour, Culture and Citizenship* London: Runnymede Trust and Trentham Books

Modood T (1997) 'Employment' in Modood, T, Berthoud, R, Lakey, J, Nazroo, J, Smith, P, Virdee, S and Beishon, S (eds.) *Ethnic Minorities in Britain*, London: Policy Studies Institute

Partners in Economic Development Limited (1994) *Evaluation of the Edinburgh Refugee Training Programme: final report Edinburgh District Council*, Department of Economic Development and Estates

REAF (2001) *Race Equality Advisory Forum Sub-Committee on Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Draft Action Plan*, February 2001

Reiss, G (1994) *Refugee doctors in Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Refugee Council.

Scottish Office (1991) *Ethnic Minorities in Scotland* Central Research Unit, Edinburgh: Scottish Office.

Scottish Executive (2000a) *Equality in Scotland: Ethnic Minorities* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Scottish Executive (2000b) *New Deal for Unemployed People in Scotland - Statistics to end May 2000* Edinburgh: Central Statistics Unit, Scottish Executive

Scottish Executive (2001a) *The Goal of Full Employment* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Scottish Executive (2001b) *Duffner Report - Career Service Review: Scottish Executive Response to the Consultation* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Scottish Executive (2001c) *Careers Scotland - The Way Forward. Scottish Executive Response to the Consultation Process*. Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department, Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit (1992) *Ethnic Minority Economic Development: Existing Research*, SEMRU, Glasgow Caledonian University

Shing M and Thornley, E (1994) *Glasgow's Young Chinese: Skills Audit*, Glasgow: The Strathclyde Chinese Co-ordinating Committee

Siann, G (1990) *Parents, Careers and Culture: The views of Muslim Girls*, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit Research Paper, Number 8, Glasgow Caledonian University

Summerfield, E (1999) *Attitudes of Employers in the Lothian and Strathclyde to the Employment of Refugees*. Edinburgh: Lothian Management Centre/Scottish Refugee Council

The Black Economic Development Research Ltd (1993) *Research study on training and employment for ethnic minorities in Edinburgh and Lothian* Edinburgh District Council, Department of Economic Development and Estates

Wallace, A (1999) *C- Store Retailing and the British South-Asian Retailer: A Pilot Study of the Edinburgh South Asian C-Store Retailer*, BA (Hons) Retail Business, Queen Margaret University College, Edinburgh

Walsh, D McFarland E and Hampton, K (1994) *Refugees in Lothian: the experiences and aspirations of refugees and asylum seekers in Lothian* Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University

CHAPTER EIGHT RACE AND POVERTY

INTRODUCTION

8.1 Academic and policy orientated debates on poverty have recognised that poverty impacts on groups differently and that some groups of people and regions are more vulnerable to poverty than others,. However, the 'colour-blind' approach to researching this subject continues to prevail in Scotland, rendering the experience of poverty amongst minority ethnic groups invisible. This situation is exacerbated by the lack of current and accurate statistics on minority ethnic groups in Scotland.

8.2 The research studies discussed in this chapter recognise that the roots of poverty in minority ethnic communities may be similar to that of the white population and that some aspects of poverty may be similarly experienced by both white and minority ethnic populations. However, the studies also highlight that the experience of minority ethnic groups may be compounded by the experience of discrimination, isolation and exclusion as well as by specific cultural and religious practices (Hampton and Bain, 1995; Berthoud,1998; Brown, 2000). The studies also take the view that poverty represents inequalities in living standards which are not restricted to levels of income and money, although these factors have a direct impact on poverty. Rather, the experience of poverty is linked to issues such as unequal access to employment opportunities, housing, education, social care, health services and the experience of harassment and hostility.

8.3 The preceding chapters in this report have demonstrated that there is widespread evidence to show that discrimination exists in a number of key areas, such as access to housing, education, social care, health, employment opportunities and so on. It is also widely recognised that racist victimisation and discrimination can have severe consequences for the lifestyles, health and well-being of individuals and the communities they belong to. Whilst Brown (2000) warns against assuming a simplistic correlation between discrimination and poverty and highlights the need to be aware of the complexities, it is clear that discrimination is an important additional variable to the poverty experiences of minority ethnic people.

8.4 Given that earlier chapters have discussed the extent to which minority ethnic communities are disadvantaged and discriminated against in key areas, the focus of this chapter is on income poverty. We begin by discussing statistical sources of information on poverty, in particular information on earnings, income and welfare benefits. We then identify some factors emerging from the limited research in this area which is likely to contribute to the poverty experiences of minority ethnic people. Finally, we consider research on issues of multiple discrimination in relation to poverty in relation to specific groups of people. Finally the last section summarises the scope and methodology or perspectives employed in the studies. The main themes arising from the research are summarised with a view to identifying gaps and making recommendations for further research.

STATISTICAL SOURCES

8.5 A UK wide study (Berthoud,1998) based on an analysis of the Family Resources Survey and Social Security in 1994/95 and 1995/96 reveals that while there is a narrowing of

differentials on the issue of economic status between majority and minority groups, there is also evidence which suggests that some groups may be more vulnerable to poverty than others. For example, Pakistanis and Bangladeshis were considered to be the poorest groups in Britain: 60% are poor, four times the poverty rates than whites. The focus of the survey was on income poverty: each household's total net income (before housing costs) was added up and divided by a measure of the number of the people in the household and compared with the national average. Those below half the average were defined as poor. Contributory factors identified by the study include high unemployment, low levels of economic activity amongst women, low pay and large family sizes amongst these groups.

8.6 Scottish-based research on poverty and minority ethnic groups highlights the difficulties of accessing statistical data on minority ethnic groups within this context (Hampton and Bain, 1995; Brown, 2000). Although surveys such as the Labour Force Survey, The Scottish House Condition Survey and the Scottish Household Survey disaggregate data by ethnicity, the size of the sample tends to be too small to allow for reliable interpretation. There are cost implications to consider in obtaining a sample, which is sufficiently large to enable detailed disaggregation; there are also confidentiality issues associated with the disaggregation of data from small minority ethnic groups. Studies on poverty in Scotland have therefore tended to rely on a combination of data based on the last Census, the 1991 Scottish Office Survey (which was restricted to the four Scottish cities) and UK wide surveys such as the Labour Force survey (including disaggregated data for Scotland where this is available). It is possible that the 2001 Census, which elicited information on religious background, may yield data that allows some quantitative analysis of the influence of religion (and the possibility of religious discrimination) on poverty. It is recognised by those working in the field that the quality of data available for Scotland tends to be of variable quality and inconsistent in its coverage of minority ethnic groups and regions within Scotland (Brown, 2000). Below, we consider the limited data that is available on earnings and income, and welfare benefits.

Earnings and income

8.7 The 1991 Scottish Office Survey provides some data on earnings and income but points out that caution has to be exercised in reviewing the data on income and earnings due to the poor response rate and the uncertainty surrounding the reliability of the responses. Generally, the findings indicate a lower standard of living for minority ethnic people compared to white people due to the following factors:

- 74% of the minority ethnic sample compared to 57% of the white sample had an income of less than £10,000 per annum
- ethnic minority households have a higher dependency ratio than white households, that is, the ratio of the number of dependents to the number of earners is higher in the former than the latter (2.97 and 1.57, respectively)
- the dependency ratios of Pakistani households was the highest at 4.02

8.8 Evidence of regional variations in earnings also emerged: Edinburgh had the lowest proportion of ethnic minorities earning under £10,000 per year, whilst Dundee and Aberdeen (combined) had a higher proportion earning £20,000 and above (Scottish Office, 1991: 89)

Welfare benefits

8.9 The 1991 Scottish Office Survey found that ethnic minority householders or their spouses were more likely than white households to receive Child Benefit (69% and 34%) and Family Credit (7% and 1 %) but less likely to receive Old Age Pensions (4% and 25%). These differences were attributed to different age structure and household compositions in the sample. These trends have been supported by a study by Glasgow City Council (1992, cited in Hampton and Bain, 1995) which found that while the uptake of benefits amongst minority groups were similar to that of the city as a whole, minority ethnic households were more likely to receive Family Credit (18% compared to only 1% of the Glasgow population) and, less likely to receive Housing Benefit (7% compared to 22% for the whole of Glasgow).

8.10 In the absence of current and accurate sources of data, it is difficult to assess the extent to which this pattern is still relevant. However, it is recognised that there are a number of barriers in accessing welfare benefits, including immigration policies and residence rights, language, and direct and indirect discrimination (Alcock, 1997; Hampton and Bain, 1995, Brown, 2000). Alcock (1997) argues that the relative exclusion of black people from the labour market in Britain has meant that they are more likely to be dependent on the benefits system. The combination of low levels of benefits and the experience of discrimination within the benefits system means that dependency on the benefits system is closely associated with poverty for black communities.

EXPERIENCE OF POVERTY AMONGST MINORITY ETHNIC GROUPS IN SCOTLAND

8.11 The extent to which cultural factors contribute to poverty is unclear. Factors considered to be relevant include the observance of certain religious practices and rituals, differences in language abilities, household size and structure and the observance of certain customs, for example, supporting dependents abroad. With respect to the last factor, the 1991 Scottish Office Survey found that 21 % of ethnic minority households sent money to dependents abroad, ranging from 15% for Indian Households to 27% for Chinese households (Scottish Office, 1991: 87).

MULTIPLE DISCRIMINATION AND POVERTY

8.12 Minority ethnic groups are not homogenous and it is widely accepted that there is a need to take into account the complex interrelationship between factors such as, gender, class, location, religion, age and disability when researching poverty. Evidence also suggests that some minority ethnic groups are more vulnerable to poverty than others, because of their gender and/or age (Hampton and Bain, 1995; Hampton, 1999; Brown, 2000). The experiences of three groups are discussed below.

Women

8.13 The only identified study on poverty experiences of black and minority ethnic women is Hampton's (1999) study. The study suggests that these women are vulnerable to poverty,

due to a combination of factors: economic, social, cultural and the experience of racism and discrimination. More than half of the respondents in the study associated poverty with unemployment, part-time and low pay, and a third attributed the high rates of unemployment and the existence of poverty to Government and Local Authorities' policies. The majority of the respondents in this study felt that black and minority ethnic women were more likely to be vulnerable to poverty, either because of racial or gender discrimination.

8.14 Closer examination revealed that women felt that two main factors contributed to their disadvantaged position: 'external' racism, emanating from the majority white community; and, 'internal' cultural pressures, which affected some of the minority ethnic women more than others. In relation to the latter, a number of Indian and Pakistani women, pointed to communication difficulties and the wearing of traditional forms of dress, which made them more vulnerable to labour market discrimination. The vulnerability of minority ethnic women to poverty was exacerbated by traditional views on the role of women within the family, which restricted their ability to participate in the labour market.

Young people

8.15 Chaudhry (1996:12) study suggested that black youths were disproportionately affected by changes in the benefits system, lack of training and employment opportunities. As documented in the chapter on employment, many faced considerable racial discrimination in obtaining employment. A recent study which investigated the impact of racism on youth found that racism was a daily occurrence for young people and experienced in a wide range of settings, (for example, schools, streets, shops and neighbourhoods) making access to key services and to employment problematic (Hampton, 1998). The career aspirations and expectations of young minority ethnic people are under-researched.

Older people

8.16 Chaudhry (1996) suggests that the small numbers of older minority ethnic people are more likely to be suffering from poverty than their white counterparts as their needs are often ignored in policy and planning. Carlin (1997) points out that many may not be entitled to pensions due to their pattern of employment. Certainly, research cited in the chapter on social care have found that fewer minority ethnic older people receive home support services relative to the white population, and the majority are not aware of housing opportunities to which they are entitled. Furthermore, mainstream services, such as day care centres, are often inaccessible and/or culturally insensitive

OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH

8.17 In this section we will consider the research that has been cited in this chapter and identify the main themes, the scope, funding and the methodology of the research reviewed and the gaps in research on poverty.

Scope

8.18 No national study has investigated this area. With the exception of The Scottish Office Survey in 1991, which covered Edinburgh, Glasgow, Dundee and Aberdeen cities, all the other studies reviewed were restricted mainly to Glasgow.

8.19 Whilst several studies have alluded to variations in experiences of poverty amongst minority ethnic groups, only one study that has sought to focus on the experiences of a specific group, black and minority ethnic women in Glasgow (Hampton, 1999). Little is known about the experience of poverty amongst young people, diverse ethnic and religious groups, refugees, Gypsy Travellers and older people, though evidence of their racially disadvantaged position has been evidenced in preceding chapters. Regional variations, including the rural and urban dimensions, have also not been considered.

Funding

8.20 With the exception of the 1991 Scottish Office Survey, the majority of studies reviewed have been funded by voluntary organisations, local authorities, research units and lottery funding.

Methodology

8.21 The research cited in this chapter is mainly qualitative with the exception of the 1991 Scottish Office Survey. The main method used in the qualitative studies were interviews and focus groups. Attempts were made to make the sample representative of the minority ethnic population in a particular locality. Some studies attempted to provide an overview of poverty experiences based on the available literature (Brown, 2000; Hampton and Bain, 1995). Others have sought to develop an understanding about how poverty is experienced by minority ethnic groups in Scotland through empirical research, with a view to identifying needs and also strategies to address these needs (Chaudhry, 1996; Hampton, 1999).

RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Main Themes	Identified Gaps	Recommendations
<p>It is recognised that poverty impacts on different communities in different ways and that vulnerability to, and experience of, poverty by minority ethnic communities may be linked to issues such as unequal access to services, discrimination and harassment.</p>	<p>There is a lack of data on income and access to and take up of welfare benefits amongst minority ethnic groups in Scotland.</p> <p>Little is known about the way in which discrimination contributes to poverty, for example in the labour and housing markets.</p>	<p>A study focusing on the pathways of minority ethnic people into and out of poverty and the duration of poverty in comparison with the majority population is needed.</p> <p>Research on specific issues/barriers faced by minority ethnic groups in accessing benefits would be useful.</p>
<p>A 'colour blind' approach to the research and analysis of poverty persists.</p>	<p>Minority ethnic people tend to be invisible in most studies on poverty and in anti-poverty strategies.</p>	<p>A longitudinal study on the impact of anti-poverty strategies on the poverty experiences of minority ethnic people, including those living in rural areas, is a priority.</p>
<p>There are differences within and between minority ethnic groups in their experiences of poverty.</p>	<p>Only one study examining the effect of multiple discrimination on poverty was identified through this audit.</p> <p>Recent studies on poverty and disadvantage in rural areas have failed to take into account the experiences of minority ethnic households.</p>	<p>Qualitative research into the way in which poverty affects different minority ethnic groups in relation to multi-dimensional factors such as employment, ethnicity, cultural factors, religion, age, gender, disability, sexual orientation and geographical location is a priority.</p>

REFERENCES

- Alcock, P (1997) *Understanding poverty*, Hampshire: Palgrave
- Berthoud, R (1998) *The incomes of ethnic minorities*, York: The Joseph Rowntree Foundation
- Brown, U (2000) *Race, Ethnicity and Poverty*, Briefing Sheet 12, The Scottish Poverty Information Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University
- Carlin H (1997) The housing needs of older people from minority ethnic groups in Bowes, A M and Sim, D F (eds.) *Perspectives on Welfare* Aldershot: Ashgate
- Chaudhry, F (1996) *Race and Poverty in Strathclyde: Issues and Opportunities*. Glasgow: Strathclyde Poverty Alliance
- Hampton, K (1999) *The Poverty Experiences of Black and Minority Ethnic Women in Glasgow*, Research Paper Number 11 Series 2, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University
- Hampton, K and Bain, J (1995) *Poverty and Ethnic Minorities in Scotland*, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University
- Hampton, K (1998) *Youth and Racism*, Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Glasgow Caledonian University
- Scottish Office (1991) *Ethnic Minorities in Scotland*. Edinburgh: Central Research Unit, Scottish Office

CHAPTER NINE RACE AND RURAL SCOTLAND

INTRODUCTION

9.1 The position of minority ethnic groups in rural Scotland has to be understood against the background of the debate on 'what is rural', the absence of minority ethnic perspectives in policy debates and strategies in relation to rural areas and the dominance of research on minority ethnic people in urban areas. The Scottish Office (1998) document *Towards a Development Strategy for Rural Scotland* set out a strategy for rural areas, while the more recent Scottish Executive (2000) document *Rural Scotland: A New Approach* described the Executive's vision for rural areas, emphasising the need for rural development policies which recognise and reflect the diversity of Scotland. *Rural Scotland: A New Approach* acknowledged the importance of understanding and tackling rural poverty and social exclusion in a general rural context, and Ministers subsequently set up the Rural Poverty and Inclusion Working Group, which will publish its report soon. It is likely that this report will touch upon issues affecting minority ethnic groups in rural Scotland.

9.2 This audit of research has revealed a dearth of writing on the experiences of minority ethnic communities who live in rural Scotland. Most research has tended to concentrate on those living in Glasgow followed by Edinburgh, much less in the other cities and hardly any at all related to those living in the rural areas. Similarly, minority ethnic people who live in rural areas of Scotland do not appear to any significant extent, in research on rural areas (e.g. Shucksmith et al 1996, Shucksmith and Phillip, 2000, de Lima, 2001). The closest related studies are therefore those related to the situation of minority ethnic groups in rural England (Henderson and Kaur 1999) or urban Scotland. Yet a focus on policy-oriented research related to race and rural areas is important for two reasons: the existence of a Rural Affairs Department in the Scottish Executive which is responsible for developing policies and strategies for rural areas in Scotland, and the particular circumstances of minority ethnic households in rural areas.

9.3 This chapter is concerned with examining the few studies that consider minority ethnic communities who live in rural Scotland. First, the availability of statistical sources will be considered, followed by a summary of the debate about what is 'rural', drawing on some studies undertaken on rural areas of Scotland, with a brief reference to English writing on the subject. We then identify the main features of the minority ethnic population living in rural areas based on a study commissioned by the Commission for Racial Equality (de Lima, 2001). Drawing from a few other studies, an overview of the key issues affecting the lives of minority ethnic groups in rural Scotland will be presented, and some methodological considerations discussed. The last section will present an overview of the research considered in this chapter, including the scope and funding of existing studies, and will identify gaps in existing research. Proposals for future research will also be provided.

STATISTICAL SOURCES

9.4 There are no specific statistical data sources on minority ethnic groups in rural areas, apart from the 1991 Census, and there has been no research undertaken to draw together information on minority ethnic groups in rural areas from the Census. The spatial distribution of minority ethnic groups has been briefly dealt with in Chapter 1. The only other main source of statistical information on minority ethnic groups in Scotland, the 1991 Scottish Office Survey was restricted to the four main cities of Edinburgh, Glasgow, Aberdeen and Dundee.

DEBATES ON THE 'RURAL' AND THE INVISIBILITY OF MINORITY ETHNIC GROUPS

9.5 The question of how 'rural' is defined has attracted considerable academic debate, giving rise to competing definitions, from those relying on single issues (such as population density) to those using a combination of variables (such as population density, age structure, dwellings, lack of amenities and occupational structure) (Copus et al. 1998). The Scottish Executive (2001) has also undertaken considerable work on 'rural definitions'. To a large extent, definitions of what is rural have tended to be closely related to the objectives of the research.

9.6 However, the constructions of rurality have often tended to emphasise the myth of the 'rural idyll', focusing on harmony and happiness through notions of the existence of 'organic' communities. The powerful images of the rural as homogenous and a 'good place to live' are embedded in popular culture and evidence suggests that this ideology continues to endure, and has a powerful influence on the way in which rural life is perceived and, at times, experienced. Presenting a contrary picture, recent Scottish-based research has examined the extent of rural poverty and challenged the romantic myth of the 'rural idyll' (Shucksmith et al, 1996).

9.7 Debates on definitions of 'rural' combined with cultural assumptions about the 'rural' has led to three issues being highlighted, all of which have significance in relation to how minority ethnic groups experience rural life:

- the use of the term 'rural' tends to hide the diversity in size, remoteness, economy, culture, etc. between different settlements
- the extent to which rural settlements are socially cohesive differ, and with it, the potential to consider the experiences of 'communities of interest' which may span rural areas as a whole, and the rural/urban divide
- there is a danger of endorsing the urban/rural dichotomy, creating an impression that people in rural areas do not face the same difficulties as those in wider Scottish society; evidence suggests that the social distinctiveness of rural communities is beginning to erode due to changing patterns of employment, consumption, mass media and so on.
(Hope et al, 2000)

9.8 Research, mainly in England, (see Agyeman, and Spooner, 1997) has demonstrated the long established links between ideas of rurality, ethnicity and ethnic purity. The purity of

rural areas is often juxtaposed with the pollution of urban areas and cities have been aligned with 'racial degeneration'. Rural landscapes can become 'signifiers of national identity' where the emphasis on 'identity' is perceived as being 'white'. Little research has been undertaken on these issues and debates in Scotland; the closest Scotland has come to dealing with racism in a rural context is in relation to the issue of 'incomers' and the 'Englishing of Scotland'.

9.9 The debate on who is 'local' and who is 'an incomer' in a rural context has provided an opportunity to debunk the myth of rural communities as 'homogenous'. The specific characteristics associated with being 'local' are having roots, and belonging and having ancestry locally; the 'incomer', on the hand, is associated with negative characteristics such as lack of roots, not belonging, recent arrival and being a fugitive (Jedrej and Nuttall, 1996). Related to these assumptions, not all those who live in rural areas feel they can participate in the community or gain entry into the 'community of neighbourliness' (Jedrej and Nuttall, 1996; Shucksmith et al, 1996; Cloke et al, 1997; Henderson and Kaur 1999). Most of the research in this area has tended to focus on the experience of the English migrating into rural areas of Scotland. There has been little consideration of where minority ethnic groups fit into this framework. However, this issue is currently the subject of research as part of a doctoral thesis with the University of Stirling (de Lima, ongoing (a)).

9.10 An examination of more recent documents on rural Scotland, including literature on social inclusion and service provision in rural areas, suggests that the presence and the voices of minority ethnic groups in rural communities continue to be neglected and ignored (Shucksmith and Phillip 2000; Hope et al, 2000). Apart from a brief mention in Shucksmith and Phillip's (2000) review on social inclusion in rural areas, which acknowledges that some groups are more likely to face exclusion than others because they suffer from 'powerlessness' and 'inequality of opportunity' for example, women, elderly people, and ethnic minorities, there is very little else in the document that acknowledges the specific experiences of minority ethnic groups in rural areas.

SOCIO-DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE

9.11 Comprehensive information on the socio-demographic profile of minority ethnic groups across rural Scotland is not available. Outside the regions of Strathclyde, Lothian, Tayside and Grampian, there is an ethnic minority population in each of the regions, including the predominately rural areas of Orkney, Shetland and the Western Isles (de Lima, 2001). The de Lima (2001) study is the only identified study that explicitly sets out to examine the experience of minority ethnic groups in rural areas in Scotland. The study focused on four rural areas of Scotland, Angus, North Ayrshire, The Highlands and Western Isles, the choice of these areas being based on the Shucksmith et al (1996) study on disadvantage in rural Scotland, in order to provide some form of comparison with other rural dwellers. These areas were selected to include different types of rural areas in relation to characteristics such as, 'remoteness, population density, the strength of the local labour market and social and cultural variables'. (Shucksmith et al 1996: 29). The study identified the following features of rural minority ethnic groups:

- its small size, ranging from 0.4% to 0.5% of the total population in each area

- diversity of ethnic and cultural backgrounds: while the extent to which the dominant groups (Pakistanis, Chinese and Indians) varied across each of these areas, substantial numbers identified themselves as belonging to the 'Other' and 'Black Other' categories of the 1991 Census
- its dispersed pattern of settlement: most households tended to be scattered throughout rural areas with the area of residence determined mainly by economic opportunities and personal considerations, for example, setting up a business or marriage
- generally, similar patterns to minority ethnic groups in Scotland have been revealed in relation to age structure, household size, housing patterns and employment: they are a young population, have larger than average household size, are predominantly owner-occupiers and self-employed (de Lima, 2001).

KEY ISSUES WHICH AFFECT THE LIVES OF MINORITY ETHNIC GROUPS IN RURAL AREAS

9.12 Much of the information in this section is based on research conducted by Fife Regional Council (1991), the North Ayrshire District Council (1993) and the de Lima study (2001). The local authority studies were undertaken quite some time ago and some of the issues highlighted by these reports may have been addressed. Some caution has to be exercised too, in using the de Lima study to obtain a full picture of minority ethnic experiences in rural areas, due to the small sample size (39 householders or their nominees).

9.13 Despite these limitations most, if not all, of the findings of the rural studies tend to confirm that the experiences of minority ethnic groups are not altogether dissimilar on most issues from that of urban minority ethnic groups in Scotland or those living in rural areas in England. However, minority ethnic communities in rural areas are caught in a paradoxical situation, distinct from that faced by their urban counterparts. On the one hand they are 'invisible', in that their presence is not widely acknowledged and their particular needs are not recognised in policy and service delivery, and on the other hand, they are highly 'visible' within the community and are therefore, possibly particularly vulnerable to racial discrimination and harassment.

9.14 As many of the issues related to access to services, employment, education, racial harassment and poverty have already been discussed at length in the other chapters, this section will be restricted to highlighting those issues particular to the rural context. Particular attention will be paid to the discrimination minority ethnic communities face because their numbers are small, an argument regularly employed by rural agencies. These issues will be discussed under three sub-headings: access to services and views of service providers, experience of racial harassment and experience of community life in rural areas, focusing specifically on social isolation.

Access and provision of services

9.15 Many of the underlying issues which shape and underpin service provision and access to services in rural areas generally apply to all those who are living in these areas. However, there are particular implications for minority ethnic groups due to the specificity of their needs and circumstances:

- A lack of baseline information on minority ethnic groups
- The small, diverse and dispersed nature of the communities, combined with the attitude amongst service providers that the numbers are too small to merit any attention or investment of resources
- Lack of understanding and awareness of racial equality issues and the prevalence of the 'no problem here' attitude: evaluation of race equality policies have revealed that they were either non-existent, or patchy, and rarely used proactively to promote race equality issues (MacEwen and Third, 1997; de Lima, 1999; de Lima, 2001)
- Lack of employment opportunities, generally faced by all those living in rural areas (Shucksmith and Phillip, 2000), but likely to be exacerbated by racial discrimination of minority ethnic people in the labour market, as evidenced by research more fully discussed in the chapter on Race, Employment and Enterprise
- Social isolation is a major issue, due to the dispersed and diverse nature of rural minority ethnic residents, with limited opportunities for people from minority ethnic backgrounds to meet others from the same background (Fife Regional Council, 1991; North Ayrshire District Council, 1993; de Lima, 2001)

9.16 The predominant assumption among many service providers seems to be that minority ethnic groups do not have any needs because they are small in number, 'invisible' and 'silent'. Undoubtedly, the question of how to provide services to diverse and very scattered communities is a real issue. This underlines the need to consider more innovative ways of delivering services, such as the use of mobile services and/or the use of technologies such as video-conferencing, which have to date, received little attention. In recognition of this, the CRE have recently commissioned a study on rural racism, which is intended to identify the problems and define practical policy recommendations (de Lima, ongoing b).

Racism and discrimination

9.17 Studies on minority ethnic groups living in rural areas reveals that the problems of racism and discrimination are very much part of their lives, and that at best, minority ethnic are just as exposed to discrimination and racist abuse in rural areas as in urban areas. At worst, they are more likely to be vulnerable to harassment because of their greater visibility and the lack of mechanisms to tackle the phenomenon and provide support for victims.

9.18 The Fife Regional Council (1991) and de Lima (2001) studies have both identified racial harassment (including name-calling, damage to property and assault) and discrimination (in areas such as employment, access to services etc.) as a regular occurrence in rural areas,

confirming the findings of studies undertaken in other parts of rural UK (Dhalech, 1999; Jay, 1992). However, in many small communities and towns, there is a real fear that going to the police with complaints may attract reprisals from the perpetrators of harassment and for those who are self employed, have repercussions on their business, as many of the abusers are also often customers. This is exacerbated by the lack of infrastructure in many rural areas across Scotland which provide support for those who are victims of racial harassment, although this appears not to be the case for Fife Council.

Experience of living in rural areas and social isolation

9.19 Despite evidence of racial harassment and discrimination, the respondents in the CRE study identified multiple advantages to living in their area, with 'peace and quiet' identified as the main advantage in all four areas, by over half of the respondents. Respondents frequently compared their situation with those who live in urban areas with crime and other problems, whereas by comparison, rural areas were perceived to be peaceful, trouble-free, free of crime, and generally associated with a better quality of life. Feelings of safety were associated with living in a small rural township where everyone was known. This raises an interesting question about the extent to which minority ethnic groups in rural areas have themselves internalised the myth of the 'rural idyll'.

9.20 The majority of the minority ethnic respondents in the CRE study expressed feelings of social isolation. Research conducted through the Black Families Talking Project in London between 1994 and 1996 (cited in Lee and Murie, 1999) indicated that many ethnic minority communities coped with feelings of exclusion and isolation from the white majority through a strong cultural identity of their own, strengthened by community spirit, group meetings, and cultural and religious networks. However, in rural areas, such networks are much less likely to exist and the sparse numbers of people from minority ethnic groups make community support much more difficult. The most frequently mentioned disadvantage was the lack of contact with others from the same ethnic or cultural background. Remoteness and isolation were associated in the minds of most, with not being able to access and maintain for themselves and their children, aspects of their culture, such as their food, religious rites and rituals. This was a source of constant concern amongst most respondents.

9.21 The experiences of young minority ethnic people in a rural community, the Highlands, is the subject of an ongoing piece of research. The research is being undertaken as part of the Social Inclusion Monitoring and Evaluation Project for the Highlands and Council (de Lima and University of Stirling, ongoing c).

OVERVIEW OF RESEARCH

9.22 In this section, we will consider the research that has been cited in this chapter and identify the main themes, scope, perspectives and funding of the research considered. We will also identify gaps in research on minority ethnic groups in rural areas.

Scope and funding

9.23 The discussion in this chapter has been based on a small number of qualitative, small-scale studies, limited in scope geographically, and in relation to sample sizes and issues covered. The Fife Regional Council (1991) study considered the views and experiences of minority ethnic groups in relation to access and use of services, the experience of racism, and the attitudes of the public sector as service providers. The North Ayrshire District Council (1993) survey focused on identifying the health and social needs of the Chinese Community in North Ayrshire. The studies funded by both local authorities were intended to inform, influence and shape their strategies in relation to minority ethnic people. The CRE-funded study (de Lima, 2001) covered four rural areas across Scotland: Angus, North Ayrshire, The Highlands and the Western Isles and was intended to plug the gap in research and provide an overview of how minority ethnic groups experienced rural life. Two ongoing projects also consider rural race issues (de Lima, forthcoming b and c).

Methodology

9.24 The nature of the rural population makes access to individuals or households for research purposes quite problematic. One of the recurrent issues which emerges from the studies is the lack of accurate statistics on minority ethnic groups in rural areas. In this context, research has sought to develop profiles based on a combination of methods, the census, electoral rolls, telephone and business directories, and contact with specific services and specialists who are known to be in contact with minority ethnic groups.

9.25 Further, there are methodological challenges in researching small, dispersed and potentially vulnerable communities. Being the single household or individual in a small rural community can make minority ethnic people reluctant to become involved in research despite guarantees of anonymity and confidentiality. Overcoming these fears requires considerable sensitivity on the part of the researcher, and it is important to build rapport, empathy and trust between interviewee and researcher (de Lima, 2001). Research in rural areas also begs the question of whether the term 'community' is appropriate.

RESEARCH THEMES, GAPS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Main Themes	Identified Gaps	Recommendations
<p>The key issue relating to rural minority ethnic populations is how to address the needs of small, scattered and diverse communities, compounded by a lack of understanding of race equality issues amongst public, private and third sector agencies in these areas.</p>	<p>There is a lack of baseline statistical data and socio-demographic information on minority ethnic households in rural areas; this makes it difficult to identify similarities and differences in different parts of rural Scotland.</p>	<p>In-depth qualitative research is required to identify and document the experiences of those minority ethnic people who live in different rural areas, including island, mainland and other non-urban locations.</p>
<p>The experiences and views of minority ethnic groups are largely invisible in academic debates and key policy documents relating to rural Scotland.</p>	<p>Insufficient attention has been paid to including the experiences and views of minority ethnic groups in rural research and policy-making and in shaping strategies for the delivery of services in rural areas.</p>	<p>Action research into innovative and effective methods for consulting with, and mainstreaming the views of, minority ethnic people living in rural areas is a priority.</p>
<p>The difficulties faced by minority ethnic groups in urban areas in accessing services are compounded by lack of recognition of their particular needs in rural areas.</p> <p>Minority ethnic groups are particularly vulnerable to racial harassment due to their greater 'visibility' and the absence of an infrastructure in rural areas to tackle racial harassment.</p> <p>There are limited employment opportunities for minority ethnic people, in common with most rural dwellers, and this may be exacerbated by vulnerability to racial discrimination.</p>	<p>Inadequate attention has been paid to developing models of practice and service delivery appropriate to small, scattered and diverse populations living in rural areas, including strategies for tackling racial harassment.</p> <p>There is a lack of an overview on equality issues and policies, specifically race equality policies, which would enable examples of good practice and areas for improvement to be identified.</p>	<p>A study of models of practice and service delivery appropriate for minority ethnic groups living in rural areas is a priority.</p> <p>This should include an exploration of infrastructures for tackling racial harassment.</p>
<p>The social isolation of minority ethnic groups, related to lack of access to community networks and support, is heightened by the lack of recognition of cultural diversity by the public sector.</p>	<p>There is an absence of studies that examine the support available to minority ethnic groups in rural areas.</p>	<p>An exploration of the effects of social/cultural isolation on minority ethnic people living in rural areas, including young people, women, older people, gay men and lesbians and those with restricted mobility, would draw attention to the limitations of informal support available to these communities.</p>

REFERENCES

- Agyeman, J. and Spooner, R. (1997) *Ethnicity and the Rural Environment* in Cloke, P. and Little, J. (ed) 'Contested Countryside Cultures', London: Routledge
- Cloke P and Little, J (ed.) (1997) *Contested Countryside Cultures*, London: Routledge
- Copus, A K, Gourlay, D, Chapman, P and Shucksmith, M (1998) *Small area data sources for socio-economic typologies of Rural Scotland* Edinburgh: The Scottish Office Central Research Unit
- de Lima (1999) *Research and Action in the Scottish Highlands*, in Henderson, P and Kaur, R (eds), *Rural Racism*, London: Community Development
- de Lima, P (2001) *Needs not Numbers, An exploratory study of the experiences of minority ethnic groups in rural Scotland*, London: Commission for Racial Equality
- de Lima (ongoing, a) *The Invisible Communities of the Highlands*, PhD, University of Stirling
- de Lima (ongoing, b) *Rural Racism: Mapping the Problem, and Defining Practical Policy Recommendations* London: Commission for Racial Equality
- de Lima and Erskine, A (ongoing c) *The Experiences of minority ethnic young people in the Highlands*, University of Stirling/Highlands and Islands Council
- Dhalech M (1999) *Challenging Racism in the Rural Idyll*, London: National Association of Citizens Advice Bureaux
- Fife Regional Council (1991) *Race Equality in Fife* Fife: Fife Regional Council
- Henderson, P and Kaur, R (eds), (1999) *Rural Racism*, London: Community Development Foundation
- Hope S, Anderson, S, and Sawyer, B(2000) *The Quality of Services in Rural Scotland*, Edinburgh: Scottish Executive Central Research Unit
- Jay, E (1992) "Keep Them in Birmingham" *Challenging Racism in South-West England*. London: Commission for Racial Equality
- Jedrej C and Nuttall, M (1996) *White Settlers*, Luxembourg: Harwood Academic Publisher
- Lee, P. and Murie, A. (1999) *Literature Review of Social Exclusion* Edinburgh: The Scottish Office
- MacEwen, M and Third, H (1997) *Ethnic minority access to public housing: Survey of local authorities in Scotland, Summary of key findings* Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit, Edinburgh College of Art/Heriot Watt University

North Ayrshire District Council (1993) *Survey of the Health and Social Needs of the Chinese Community Living in Ayrshire*-Report to the Joint Planning Team, September 1993, North Ayrshire District Council

Scottish Executive (2000) *Rural Scotland: A New Approach*, Rural affairs Department, Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Scottish Executive (2001) *Scottish Economic Report* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

Scottish Office (1998) *Towards a Development Strategy for Rural Scotland* Edinburgh: Scottish Office:

Shucksmith, M , Chapman, P, Clark, G M, Black, S and Conway, E (1996) *Rural Scotland Today*, Hants: Avebury

Shucksmith, M and Phillip, L (2000) *Social Exclusion in Rural Areas: A literature Review an Conceptual Framework*, Edinburgh: Scottish Executive Central Research Unit

CHAPTER TEN SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

INTRODUCTION

10.1 The main objective of this audit was to identify research literature (both published and unpublished) to set a context and steer for the proposed new research programme related to minority ethnic people in Scotland. The research included in this audit has been entered into an electronic database, which is intended to make the studies readily accessible to interested individuals or organisations. In an introductory chapter, which outlines the purpose, scope, focus and theoretical framework of the audit, we made explicit our intention to examine the identified research from a ‘race’ perspective. This means that we use this construct in a broad political sense to make explicit the social inequalities that impact on minority ethnic people as a consequence of racism.

10.2 We reviewed identified material under eight subject headings: housing, education, social care, health, access to justice, employment and enterprise, poverty and rural areas. Each chapter presented an overview of the material, drawing out the scope, perspectives of the studies and sources of funding. The main themes of the studies and gaps in existing research were also summarised. Based on this, suggestions for future research in this area were made.

10.3 This concluding chapter is divided into three parts. In Section 1, we draw together and summarise the patterns of research. Section 2 discusses cross-cutting themes that have emerged across the subject areas covered. Section 3 discusses some common gaps. Section 4 provides general recommendations for a future research programme.

PATTERNS OF RESEARCH

10.4 There was a dearth of robust, statistical data on minority ethnic people, with the 1991 Scottish Office Survey and the 1991 Census continuing to provide the basis for many studies. Coverage of the first was restricted to the four Scottish cities and the three main ethnic groups, while analysis of the second has been limited to certain geographical areas. Qualitative research, which explicitly aimed to explore the findings of the survey in more depth, was also rare.

10.5 Large-scale studies were few and far between, as were comparative studies between the minority and majority population and longitudinal studies that were able to monitor and record change. There were few national or regional studies: instead, there was a predominance of small-scale qualitative studies that were restricted to local areas.

10.6 Many studies articulated the needs and experiences of users and potential users of services, calling attention to existing gaps and mismatches in service provision. These studies might be described as action-oriented studies, motivated by the desire to influence policy and drive change. Very few studies were concerned with evaluating the extent to which lead organisations had mainstreamed race equality in their organisational structures and processes, or been effective in implementing policy and meeting targets.

10.7 The main areas in which research activity has been concentrated are in housing, education, social care and health. Less research attention has been directed towards access to justice and employment and enterprise, and even less towards poverty and rural issues. Then, there are areas in which very little research has been conducted which are related to identity and participation in the democratic process.

10.8 Many studies were broadly concerned with the experiences of minority ethnic people, although there were some attempts to reflect the diverse ethnic backgrounds within this population. Where studies did focus on a particular ethnic group, this tended to be either the South Asian or the Pakistani population. The Chinese population, which is the second largest minority ethnic population in Scotland, received scant attention. Thus, while there are several studies on older people, more is known about those who are of South Asian origin than those who are from the Chinese, African, African-Caribbean or other communities.

10.9 The majority of studies were Glasgow-based with some including the Strathclyde region; the next geographical area in which research activity was concentrated was Edinburgh. Very few studies were identified in the other cities and hardly any at all in the rural areas. A few studies collected data from Scotland along with other parts of the UK.

10.10 While a large number of organisations and individuals have commissioned or undertaken discrete studies of relevance to the audit, the particular interests of a few organisations and individuals working in this area over a sustained period of time has strongly influenced the pattern of research. Patterns of research have also been strongly influenced by the priorities and criteria of funders, as well as those who have been successful at obtaining funding. We have seen little evidence of strategic planning of research related to minority people within an overall agenda that seeks to challenge racism and eliminate racial disadvantage and discrimination within Scotland.

CROSS CUTTING THEMES

10.11 This section discussed eight cross-cutting themes which have emerged from the policy areas considered:

- invisibility of minority ethnic people in statistical data and policy documents
- access to public services
- appropriateness of public services
- racial disadvantage, discrimination and harassment
- multiple discrimination
- recruitment, employment and retention of minority ethnic workers
- mainstreaming versus specialist provision

- multi-agency working
- experiences of refugees and asylum-seekers
- experiences of Gypsy Travellers

Invisibility of minority ethnic people in statistical data and policy documents

10.12 This audit has revealed that across a wide spectrum of policy areas, minority ethnic people are invisible in official statistical data sets, related to the use of services. This invisibility has a number of effects:

- Quantitative analysis of minority ethnic people's points of contact with services is ruled out
- Comparisons between the majority and the minority ethnic population are not possible
- The decision-making processes of those in authority at points of contact with minority ethnic people are not open to scrutiny
- The monitoring of change, or lack of it, is not possible

10.13 The absence of the powerful analytical tool of ethnically disaggregated statistics hinders the ability of organisations to evaluate the accessibility and appropriateness of their services for all sections of the population. Further, the invisibility of minority ethnic people in a number of key strategic documents across the policy spectrum perpetuates a 'colour-blind' approach that does not take into account the existence of a multi-ethnic, multi-faith and multi-lingual population.

Access to public services

10.14 A number of factors influence minority ethnic people's ability to access public services such as housing, education, social care, health, access to justice, welfare and benefits, and their entry to the labour market. A major contributory factor is the existence of equal opportunities policies in public institutions and the extent to which they are implemented and monitored.

10.15 With a few notable exceptions, there has been little evidence to suggest that lead organisations have evaluated the extent to which they have mainstreamed race equality in their organisational structures and processes, or been effective in implementing and monitoring equal opportunities policies. As a consequence, we are not aware of the extent to which key organisations have provided race equality training for their staff, consulted with minority ethnic communities, made efforts to publicise their services or liased with community-based organisations to increase access to services.

10.16 However, substantial research evidence from the key policy areas of housing, social care and health informs us of the low levels of knowledge and use of a range of existing services of minority ethnic people. Further, the few comparative studies which have been undertaken in these areas consistently demonstrate the lower knowledge and use by minority ethnic people of existing services in comparison to control groups of the majority population.

There is strong evidence to support the view that low uptake of services is not related to lack of need, but rather, related to lack of knowledge on the part of minority ethnic people and other barriers which inhibit access to public services.

10.17 In relation to education, the lack of a coherent picture of minority ethnic people's access to a range of educational services and provision covering nursery, compulsory and post-compulsory education is a key issue. A recurrent finding emerging from a number of small-scale studies which have been carried out in this area is the need for education establishments and providers to improve consultation and communication on an informed basis with minority ethnic communities and families. The need for effective consultation has also emerged in other areas, particularly in relation to social care services.

10.18 Structural factors such as the role and decision-making processes of 'gate-keepers', including the criteria used to facilitate or restrict entry into services and the labour market, are crucial. In housing, a substantial body of research documents barriers to the social rented sector, including the discriminatory criteria in allocation policies. This is despite statistical evidence that minority ethnic communities (particularly the Pakistani community) are more likely to live in overcrowded housing and are over-represented in Below Tolerable Standard housing and accommodation where amenities are either absent or shared. In social care, little attention has been paid to examining the cultural sensitivity of assessment procedures of social work departments. This is despite the low levels of use of these services by these communities. In the area of health services, the effectiveness of various clinical instruments in identifying mental illness among minority ethnic people has been found to be severely limited. Communication difficulties between general practitioners and minority ethnic people also affect the quality of the treatment received.

10.19 In employment, comparative research revealed that ethnic minority youths got lower responses to job applications than white applicants; other research showed low awareness and levels of participation in the New Deal programme. Research conducted in rural areas suggests that the minority ethnic population in these areas face additional difficulties in accessing services to those faced by their urban counterparts, due to lack of recognition of their circumstances and particular needs by service providers.

Appropriateness of public services

10.20 Closely related to the accessibility of public services is the extent to which services are culturally sensitive and appropriate. Key issues here are effective communication and the extent to which the design and delivery of services takes into account individual needs, including cultural and religious requirements.

Need for greater sensitivity to differences in language resources

10.21 In the areas of housing, social care, health and access to justice, a body of literature documents difficulties in communication between minority ethnic people and service providers. A recurrent theme is the lack or inadequacy of interpreting services in public institutions, including the courts. Difficulties in communication lead to the inability of professionals to fully appreciate the circumstances of minority ethnic people, which may result

in a tendency to draw on stereotypical assumptions. It also inhibits the extent to which users can make informed choices about services. In the courts, the lack of adequate interpreting services potentially limits minority ethnic people's ability to understand court proceedings, thereby undermining the fundamental principle of equality before the law. Additionally, in the field of education, differences in language resources point to the need for teacher education courses to prepare teachers to adequately support the bilingual learner in the classroom.

10.22 It has also been observed that difficulties in communication are not merely the result of differences in language resources, and that other factors also play a role in making communication difficult, including power differentials and racism. Predictably, studies that examine the appropriateness of public services for minority ethnic people call for greater awareness and responsiveness to language differences, within the context of equal opportunities policies. This is closely related to the need to provide anti-racist training to staff at all levels.

Importance of greater flexibility in the design of services

10.23 Despite current policy developments which emphasise a needs-led approach to service provision, research evidence suggests that there is little flexibility in the services which are offered to minority ethnic communities. Hence, in housing, there is a shortage of a wide range of accommodation which takes into account the diversity of size in minority ethnic families and a lack of recognition of the importance of safety from racial harassment. In education, while some evidence exists of multicultural education being included within the curriculum, by and large, this inclusion has not been systematic across all schools, education authorities or curriculum areas. The need to design and develop social care services which take into account particular preferences has also been raised, including the duty placed upon providers of services by the Children (Scotland) Act 1995 for children to pay due 'regard to children's religious persuasion, racial origin and cultural and linguistic backgrounds'. In the area of health, the need to evaluate the effectiveness of existing mainstream health promotion strategies for minority ethnic communities has emerged. The need for greater cultural sensitivity in hospital-based services has also been observed, with respect to diet, religious practices and cultural norms.

Racial disadvantage, discrimination and harassment

10.24 One of the notable findings of this audit is that minority ethnic people are racially disadvantaged in several key policy areas. In the area of housing, their disproportionately low rates of occupation of local authority housing has led to their low take up of Right to Buy; this has meant that this group has foregone the opportunity to invest in heavily discounted council housing. Their route into owner-occupation is also more difficult; there is evidence that minority ethnic households pay significantly higher mortgage repayments than the majority population, although their incomes are lower and less secure.

10.25 In social care, the lack of culturally sensitive services leads to a low uptake of statutory services or to low levels of satisfaction with these services. It also results in a reliance on the black and ethnic minority voluntary sector or on informal sources of support, where this is available.

10.26 The health status of certain minority ethnic groups, in particular South Asian women, has also been found to be worse than the majority population, in several respects related to coronary heart disease. Migrants who have long resided in Glasgow fare worse than recent migrants and this is not related to positive selection of the latter. Mental health problems emerge as a particular concern among minority ethnic groups, as evidenced by the numerous community-based studies which have addressed this area, as well as other studies. Further, the influence of racism has been found to impact on minority ethnic peoples' experiences of accessing and using health services.

10.27 In the area of employment, although there is evidence of upward mobility among certain minority ethnic groups, there is a concentration of economic activity in a narrow range of occupations and industries, which tend to be characterised by low pay and poor working conditions. Economic activity also appears to be limited to certain types of organisations such as family businesses and other companies in the private sector. There is conflicting evidence as to whether self-employment (five times higher than in the majority population) is the result of choice or lack of alternatives in the labour market. Support for the latter possibility is found in evidence of discrimination in the private sector; the extent of discrimination in employment in the public sector is unknown due to lack of research in this area. However, statistical evidence has consistently shown that unemployment rates of the minority ethnic population are higher than in the majority population.

10.28 Although it is unwise to assume a simplistic correlation between discrimination and poverty, it is clear that discrimination is an important additional variable to the poverty experiences of minority ethnic communities. It affects the housing circumstances of these communities, their access to social care and health services, their entry into the labour market, and their psychological well-being. In studies of poverty in rural areas, the experiences of minority ethnic people has not been considered; hence little is known about the extent to which these experiences are influenced by discrimination.

10.29 The increasing incidence of racial harassment in Scotland needs to be understood against the wider context of racial disadvantage and racial discrimination. The phenomenon emerges as a key concern in several policy-related areas, and as such, merited particular attention in the chapter on Race and Access to Justice. Safety from racial harassment is a key factor in influencing minority ethnic people's choice of housing. It affects the lives of young people in schools and on the streets, and the extent to which they feel fully able to participate in public life. In several studies conducted by local authorities, issues of racism and racial harassment emerge as key concerns for minority ethnic people. Studies of refugees and asylum-seekers also document regular experience of this phenomenon.

10.30 A particular facet of the experience is minority ethnic people's lack of trust in the ability and willingness of public authorities (including housing authorities, teachers and the police) to take appropriate and effective action against perpetrators and to fully support them. The need for co-ordinated action between the criminal justice system, local authorities and voluntary agencies in tackling the phenomenon has been highlighted. Although there is no evidence to suggest that the incidence of racial harassment is greater in rural areas, there is some evidence to suggest that there is a lack of infrastructure to tackle such incidents.

Multiple discrimination

10.31 Multiple discrimination was evidenced to a varying extent in a number of areas: in the interaction between racial discrimination, age, gender and disability. At the level of service planning and delivery, lack of information and understanding about the circumstances of minority ethnic people is compounded by even less understanding and knowledge of the extent to which their requirements for services might be influenced by disability, gender, age and sexual orientation.

Disability

10.32 In housing, special needs provision has largely failed to acknowledge and accommodate the requirement for specially designed or adapted housing in minority ethnic communities, for example, those with physical disabilities, and for those who need care and support as a component of their housing. The lack of knowledge of the scale and nature of special needs among minority ethnic people has been identified as one of the main factors that hinder the provision of appropriate housing.

10.33 Special needs education (SEN) has also been under-researched: key aspects of SEN policy and practice relating to the social inclusion of minority ethnic disabled children and their families have received little attention. This includes issues related to the identification and assessment of such children, their representation, placement, progression and attainment. It is also important to consider multi-agency support services and human resources issues.

10.34 Issues of disability among minority ethnic people in the areas of social care and health services have also received little attention; the few studies which have addressed this issue tend to be community-based projects and include the perspectives of carers, suggesting unmet need in this area. Here, the limited research, which has been undertaken, has indicated that efforts to ensure effective communication may have to take into account differences in language resources related to ethnicity as well as disability. For example, a study of Deaf Asian people found that British Sign Language (BSL) was their main form of communication, and that they had little understanding of Urdu and Punjabi whereas the reverse was true of their parents. Consequently, the need to employ bilingual BSL interpreters in the health services was identified. Other forms of disability or impairment in minority ethnic people do not appear to have been addressed.

Gender

10.35 Few studies have examined the experience and support available to women from a minority ethnic background who face domestic violence, despite this being a major focus of research activity in the majority population and the subject of a high profile Zero Tolerance Campaign. The limited research that exists indicates that the acts of violence faced by these women are not necessarily perpetrated by men but include violence by other members of the family. Since incidents of domestic violence are not ethnically monitored, it is difficult to estimate the scale and nature of the problem. However, early studies have observed a lack of housing and social care provision for women and children who are escaping from domestic

violence.

10.36 In relation to access to health care, there is statistical evidence that a higher percentage of ethnic minority females have difficulty in communicating in English with general practitioners compared to ethnic minority males. There is some evidence to suggest that this might lead to a lower referral rate to specialist services. Qualitative research relating to the access and use of health services by South Asian women has highlighted the importance of disentangling the effects of racism from other effects, such as gender, class or the power of professionalism while suggesting that racism is a distinctive feature of their relationship with health services. Encouragingly, research has also demonstrated that women did not present themselves as passive victims of a discriminatory or racist society; instead they took a number of strategies to prevent the deterioration of their own psychological health and were active participants in the negotiation of health care.

10.37 Statistical evidence on employment show that minority ethnic women have lower levels of economic activity compared to white women, with Pakistani women having the lowest participation rates and those of Chinese women approaching those of white women. There is also statistical evidence, which indicates that lack of fluency in English is a greater barrier to participation in the labour market in ethnic minority females than ethnic minority males. Self-employment has also been found to be higher among minority ethnic women than white women, often hiding low pay and poor working conditions. Related to this, qualitative research on the poverty experiences of black women has found that their vulnerability is related to a number of social and economic factors, the experience of racism, as well as 'internal' cultural pressures which hinder their ability to fully participate in the labour market.

Age

10.38 Studies on older people have tended to focus largely on South Asian people; hence less is known about the circumstances of older people from the Chinese, African-Caribbean and African and other communities. Early studies on housing had observed that older minority ethnic people had not benefited as much as their white counterparts from a growing volume of sheltered community housing produced in both the public and private sectors. The lack of research in this area has been identified as a factor that has hindered specialist provision for this group; since then, there has been some limited research in this area.

10.39 In addition to demonstrating lower levels of knowledge and use of domiciliary support services among minority ethnic older people than the majority population, studies on older people suffering from dementia reveal how the lack of culturally sensitive services exacerbates the confusion and anxiety that they experience. Mainstream services, such as day care centres, are often inaccessible or inappropriate. These studies also point out that existing areas of unmet need in minority ethnic communities are likely to increase as the proportion of older people in these communities increases. There is also some limited evidence, which suggests that older people might be particularly susceptible to poverty since they may not be entitled to pensions due to their pattern of employment.

Recruitment, employment and retention of minority ethnic workers

10.40 The need for a workforce which is ethnically representative of the population it serves has emerged as a cross-cutting theme in the key areas of housing, education, health, social care, and access to the civil and criminal justice system. In housing, this has led to the establishment and subsequent evaluation of Positive Action for Training in Housing Scheme.

10.41 In education, the need to raise the participation of minority ethnic people on teacher education courses has been recognised, along with the need to develop teacher competency for working in multi-lingual and multi-faith classrooms. The importance of providing role models in the form of minority ethnic teachers has also been recognised. However, little appears to have been done by teacher education providers to achieve this outcome.

10.42 Growing concern of the under-representation of minority ethnic people as social workers has led to scrutiny of policies related to the attraction, recruitment, training, support and assessment of black social work students. Despite evidence of some good practice, such policies have been found to be fragmented in approach and lacking in strategy. Although the proportion of social work staff who are of minority ethnic origin is largely unknown, at least one study has found that among those black people working in social care, the majority were either in the lower grades or employed part-time or on a sessional basis. The role of black workers and their caseload has also received some consideration; it has been pointed out that it is important not to allocate such workers only to black clients, since this might result in their marginalisation. However, the precise role that such workers will play and how they might be supported in this has not been fully considered.

10.43 At the level of Scottish health authorities and NHS Trusts, little research has been conducted on employment practices, the proportion of minority ethnic people who have been employed, the grades at which they have been employed and their distribution across Scotland. However, in the criminal justice system, some progress has been observed in terms of research attention to the employment of minority ethnic people in the police force. In the civil justice system, the employment of minority ethnic people does not appear to have been the focus of research attention. However, it is significant that there is a perception in such communities that solicitors did not have the necessary expertise to deal with issues related to discrimination or immigration, or an understanding of cultural differences.

Mainstreaming versus specialist provision

10.44 The benefits of mainstreaming versus specialist provision in implementing equal opportunities policies has emerged in a number of areas. Among the factors considered are the estimation of costs against benefits and the preference of users. The need for specialist provision has been questioned in areas where minority ethnic communities are already responsive. Further, in the voluntary sector, there is some evidence that some black-led agencies catering for minority ethnic people were keen for the services to be mainstreamed and did not wish to be separate. From the user perspective, there is also evidence that as long as services are culturally sensitive, minority ethnic people would be willing to use them and would not necessarily prefer separate provision. However, the ability of mainstream services to respond adequately and effectively to diverse and specific interests has also been questioned; there is substantial evidence in this audit of the difficulties faced by minority ethnic people in accessing and using statutory services.

10.45 A key consideration has been the role of the black voluntary sector, and its ability to adequately provide specialist services in the face of limited funding and lack of political power. The strengths of the sector were understood to be its intimate knowledge of needs, cultural background and awareness of race equality issues, and extensive experience of working with this section of the population. Some of its limitations were found to be the lack of a political voice and the inability to plan strategically, due to limited and short-term funding. Despite this, there is growing agitation for black-led housing associations in the face of continuing disadvantage in the housing circumstances of some minority ethnic communities. These continue to be absent in Scotland in contrast to their growing presence in England. The evidence would appear to suggest that the development of both forms of provision is desirable and that the availability of both would allow users greater choice and flexibility.

Multi-agency working

10.46 Whilst the cross-cutting theme of multi-agency working has been advocated in a number of policy areas, it was noticeable by its absence as a focus of research activity. One of the main areas in which its desirability has been pointed out is in the potential for collaborative work between mainstream statutory or voluntary projects and black- and minority ethnic-led voluntary agencies. Such collaboration would enable agencies to draw on the complementary strengths and expertise of those involved. Multi-agency working can also facilitate access to services through the co-ordination of effective systems of referrals. More generally, the need for stronger links between providers in housing, social care and health has also been pointed out in the context of community care policies.

10.47 Multi-agency working has also been advocated as a means of countering racial harassment and supporting victims of domestic violence. Both phenomena involve statutory and voluntary organisations and the criminal justice system. Among the merits of such an approach is the bringing together of a wide range of specialist skills and experience to take action against perpetrators, support victims and plan and implement preventive strategies. There is evidence that such mechanisms are in place in some areas.

Experiences of refugees and asylum seekers

10.48 The circumstances of refugees and asylum seekers in Scotland have been considered in several chapters of this audit. Most recent research has drawn attention to the implications of the provisions in the Immigration and Asylum Act 1999, including the voucher system and the role of the National Asylum Support System, the agency negotiating arrangements with local authorities such as Glasgow, and private contractors.

10.49 Among the concerns that have been raised in relation to housing are that block tender arrangements may result in the provision of sub-standard accommodation and inadequate support for a vulnerable and often visibly identifiable minority. Education providers too appear uncertain as to the entitlement of refugees and asylum seekers to educational and employment opportunities. Other concerns are the racial harassment and hostility that is often experienced by these groups. Not surprisingly, mental health problems have emerged as an issue for refugees and asylum-seekers, many of whom have been traumatised by their experiences.

10.50 Research into employment opportunities for refugees has revealed that although a high proportion of refugees had been in professional, managerial or white collar work in their own

countries, there is a high rate of unemployment. One of the main barriers is the lack of recognition of overseas qualifications; many refugees were employed in jobs that were not commensurate with their qualifications and experiences. Research has found that most refugees are willing to obtain any sort of work, and to undertake training; however the effectiveness of training programmes in enabling refugees to secure employment has also been questioned. Clearly, it is important that the situation of asylum-seekers and refugees is closely monitored.

Experience of Gypsy Travellers

10.51 A recent study of Gypsy Travellers has found both a reduction and changing pattern in travelling. The experience of discrimination was reported to be a daily experience by many Travellers. Housing was seen as one of many options for accommodation, and was sometimes used temporarily. The study identified a need for appropriate site location, design and rules.

10.52 Access to and use of public services, in particular, accommodation, advice and information was an emergent issue, as was the need for culturally appropriate service delivery. In education, the analysis of the attendance and participation patterns of Gypsy Travellers within school provision and the uptake of lifelong learning opportunities have been considered.

10.53 Difficulties faced by Scottish Gypsy Travellers in accessing health services include their inability to register with a health service, the low use of health visitors, the possibility of eviction or removal while pregnant, and low rates of immunisation. The undertaking of seasonal counts of this population by local authorities has been recommended; however, more qualitative research that monitors the extent to which the requirements of Gypsy Travellers are mainstreamed in service provision is also needed.

GAPS IN RESEARCH

10.54 Apart from the specific gaps that have been identified for each subject area, this audit has revealed some general gaps in research relating to minority ethnic issues.

Current statistical data

10.55 The absence of current, robust statistical data across all subject areas hinders our understanding of similarities and differences between minority ethnic groups and the majority population. Statistical data relevant to the concerns of minority ethnic people is needed in order to monitor change, or the lack of it, in key policy areas.

Evaluation of equal opportunities policies

10.56 Across each subject area examined, the relative absence of evaluative studies is striking, given the current emphasis on mainstreaming equality issues. Little is known about such practice in relation to employment issues, the provision of training, mechanisms for consulting with minority ethnic groups, the use of services by such groups and satisfaction levels relating to these services. Without such evaluation, there is little accountability and

considerable scope for complacency.

Diversity between minority ethnic groups

10.57 Apart from a few demographic studies, which have examined statistical data, little is known about the diversity that exists between minority ethnic groups, including Gypsy Travellers and refugees. Little is known about the Chinese and smaller minority ethnic groups, such as the African, African-Caribbean, Bangladeshi and Arab communities, those of mixed parentage or those who live in rural areas. Existing statistical evidence suggests that not all minority ethnic groups are equally disadvantaged; comparative research of minority ethnic groups would add to our understanding of diversity and similarities between them.

Minority ethnic young people

10.58 Although the proportion of young people in the minority ethnic population is larger than in the majority population, their views and experiences have been under-researched. Little is known of their educational and career aspirations, an area which is of obvious importance given the current concentration of minority ethnic people within a limited range of occupations, industries and types of business. The lack of attention to children's views and experiences of social care services is also of concern.

Minority ethnic women

10.59 The experiences of minority ethnic women have received scant attention except in the area of health services. This is despite evidence of domestic violence in these communities as well as higher unemployment rates and poverty. Little is known about the interaction of race, gender, age and class on women's access to and experiences in the labour market. Women's educational and career aspirations are also under-researched.

Minority ethnic disabled people

10.60 The experiences of disabled people in minority ethnic communities and the accessibility and appropriateness of current service provision has also received little research attention across a broad spectrum of relevant policy areas including, housing, education, social care, health and employment. Little is known about policy and practice initiatives.

Minority ethnic people living in rural areas

10.61 The relative absence of a rural dimension to research relating to minority ethnic people is of particular concern given that geographically, a large proportion of Scotland is rural. The concentration of minority ethnic people in urban areas does not preclude the need for examining the circumstances of the small, diverse and dispersed minority ethnic population that is spread across every local authority area in Scotland.

Influence of religion and religious discrimination

10.62 Little is known about the influence of religion and religious discrimination among minority ethnic groups. Qualitative research in this area will supplement the statistical data on religious background, which will be obtained from the 2001 Census.

Identity and participation

10.63 This audit has revealed that questions of identity and involvement in the democratic process by minority ethnic groups are only just beginning to be raised. .

PROPOSED TOPICS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

10.64 At the end of Chapters 2 to 9, an overview of research presents the main themes emerging from identified research, significant research gaps identified and proposed topics for future research for each subject area. In this section, we propose five areas which have been identified as priorities for further research and which have cross-cutting relevance:

Five topics of cross-cutting relevance

Evaluation and development of systems for ethnic monitoring

10.65 Research which will evaluate existing systems of ethnic monitoring across the key areas of housing, education, social care, housing, the civil and criminal justice systems, training and employment, and support the development of new systems, where necessary. The research should cover:

- the type of information to be collected
- the purposes for which it should be collected
- who should collect it
- means of supporting participants in this process (those who will provide the data, data collectors and policy-makers)
- methods for analysing data
- guidance to interpreting and using data

Support for the development of a national strategy for interpreting and translating services

10.66 Research that will support the development of a national strategy for interpreting and translating services in the key policy areas. Such research should include:

- identification of the languages which are spoken, written and read in Scotland (including those spoken by asylum-seekers and refugees)
- examination of means of increasing access to interpreting services
- the adequacy of existing provision
- an evaluation of existing standards for interpreters and translators
- training available to professionals in working with interpreters and translators

Evaluation of the impact of race equality policies and practice

10.67 Research which evaluates the impact of race equality policies and practice in key areas such as housing, education, social care, health, training, employment and enterprise and criminal justice. While the evaluation of policy and practice related to race equality is of cross-cutting relevance, the significance and scope of such an exercise for each subject area is determined by the extent to which lead public organisations have undertaken such evaluation.

Issues related to identity

10.68 Issues related to identity. This should include explorations of self-description, affiliation to religion, languages used, differences between first, second and third generations, differences within and between groups, identification with Scottishness/Britishness, and sense of belonging.

Issues related to active citizenship

10.69 Issues related to active citizenship including membership of political parties and concepts of volunteering.

10.70 Interestingly, the topics identified in 10.65-10.67 are closely related to areas identified as priority areas for the new Scottish Parliament by the Commission for Racial Equality (1999). In addition, it is important to ensure that research includes a rural dimension in studies that focus on Scotland as a whole, as well as develops comparative perspectives between urban and rural populations.

Selected Research Topics by Area

10.71 The following section summarises selected topics for future research for each subject area:

SELECTED TOPICS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH IN SUBJECT AREAS

Housing

- Review of the implications of the Housing (Scotland) Act 2001 for minority ethnic communities
- Research on special needs housing provision, including a feasibility study of the potential role of black- and minority ethnic-led housing associations in this provision
- Research into the nature and extent of homelessness in minority ethnic communities and the adequacy and appropriateness of existing service provision for minority ethnic homeless people

Education

- Evaluation of the effectiveness of the Scottish Executive, HMI (Education), Teaching and Learning Scotland and education authorities in meeting their duties under Race Relations legislation
- Investigation of the effects of racism, particularly institutional racism, on equal access and fairness at all levels of education for current and future minority ethnic learners
- Examination of race equality issues in early years provision in terms of access and participation, parental involvement, ethos and curriculum, development of explicit anti-racist approaches and the performance of minority ethnic pupils

Social Care

- National audit of social work policy and practice with regard to race equality. To include scrutiny of equal opportunities policy and practice, information and publicity on service availability, ethnic monitoring of services, employment practice and training of staff
- Review of the accessibility and appropriateness of services for minority ethnic children, including pre-school provision, children in care, fostering and adoption.
- Review of research, policy and practice on the experiences of disabled people from minority ethnic communities. To include a review of social work department practice as well as that of relevant national voluntary organisations.

Health

- Evaluation of the accessibility and appropriateness of health services for all minority ethnic groups. To include an investigation of the mechanisms used to consult with minority ethnic communities about service development
- Research into the routes by which minority ethnic people access statutory mental health services, the appropriateness of intervention strategies employed and the level of community-based support available
- Evaluative study of health promotion strategies for minority ethnic communities, in areas identified as key strategic health priorities. To include an exploration of the advantages and disadvantages of a targeted approach to health promotion

Access to Justice

- Evaluation of the response of all aspects of the justice system to the implementation of the Stephen Lawrence Action Plan
- Qualitative and quantitative research of minority ethnic people's experiences of the civil justice system in discrimination and no-discrimination cases
- Research into the experiences of minority ethnic women and children who are victims of domestic violence and the adequacy of existing service provision

Employment and Enterprise

- Exploratory study of minority ethnic young people's career aspirations and access to employment and training, including barriers to, and experiences in, the labour market
- Exploratory study of minority ethnic women's career aspirations and access to employment and training, including barriers to, and experiences in, the labour market
- Snapshot study of minority ethnic small and medium-sized enterprises in Scotland. To include quantitative information on sectors of operation, size, scale and turnover and qualitative information on access to finance, business support and advice

Poverty

- Longitudinal study on the impact of anti-poverty strategies on the poverty experiences of minority ethnic people, including those living in rural areas
- Study focusing on the pathways for minority ethnic people into and out of poverty, and the length of time spent in poverty in comparison with the majority population

Rural Areas

- Action research into innovative and effective methods for consulting with, and mainstreaming the views of, minority ethnic people living in rural areas
- Study of models of practice and service delivery appropriate to minority ethnic groups in rural areas. To include an exploration of infrastructures for tackling racial harassment
- Exploration of the effects of social/cultural isolation on minority ethnic groups living in rural areas. To include young and older people, women and those with restricted mobility

METHODOLOGICAL ISSUES

10.72 In this section, we consider some methodological issues that are of more general relevance not only in relation to researching issues related to minority ethnic people, but also for other research relating to social justice and inclusion.

The importance of a user led perspective and an ethical code

10.73 In the context of community care policies, the involvement of users in monitoring and evaluative exercises is a legal requirement. This has acted as a spur to many social scientists to consider the extent to which users may be involved across the whole research process, as members of advisory groups, researchers and interviewers. However, as Beresford and Croft note (1993) although user involvement is intended to contribute to their empowerment, not all involvement is empowering. As long as users remain the subjects of research, they are involved in an unequal relationship where the power to interpret, and convey the findings of the research to a wider audience remains in the hands of the researcher. From such an argument it would follow that if users are to share a more equitable role in the research process, then the identity of the researcher has to be carefully considered. However, user-led research is more than a question of identity: it situates itself as a social process, makes explicit the position it is speaking from and pays as much attention to the processes through which research is conducted as to the outcome and dissemination of research (see for example, Mental Health Foundation, 1999)

10.74 The implications of taking a user-led perspective within an overall programme of research relating to minority ethnic groups are manifold and cannot be fully considered here. However, one of the main implications of taking such a perspective is a careful consideration of the negotiation of power at every stage of the research process. The responsible exercise of power and responsibility by all those involved suggests the value and importance of an ethical code for researching 'race' (Scottish Association of Black Researchers, 2001).

Moving from a needs-based approach towards a reflective approach to policy and practice

10.75 The current programme of Scottish Executive research is contextualised within a wider framework of policy-practice development. We would advocate that a central focus of further research should be the manner in which policy is currently implemented, monitored and evaluated. A number of action-oriented studies identified in this audit have examined 'needs' on the part of selected minority ethnic groups of people with the intention of informing policy and practice. We suggest that a fundamental shift in focus towards research is required towards examining how race equality issues might be mainstreamed into policies and practices and how the effectiveness of this can be appropriately evaluated. Incorporating a longitudinal dimension to research efforts will entail additional costs but is likely to increase the relevance of research to policy and practice, hence adding to the value of research.

The incorporation of research into policy and practice

10.76 One means of increasing the relevance of research to policy and practice and facilitating evidence-based policy-making is to consider how elements of research might be incorporated into practice. To take one example, despite the current emphasis on consultation, this audit has identified groups of people (notably women, young people and parents of young children) who do not feel included in consultative mechanisms. However, some evidence of good practice from local authorities has also been revealed, including the identification of the need for new projects or posts to address issues that have emerged. An investigation of mechanisms for effective consultation with minority ethnic people, which is undertaken within various institutional settings, would be of immediate and direct relevance to practice.

10.77 The use of a 'case-study' approach, which draws from the caseloads of a group of practitioners, would allow practitioners/researchers to draw broader implications for service delivery from the circumstances of individual users of services. Such an approach would be particularly valuable for investigating the circumstances of smaller minority ethnic groups or groups which are subject to multiple discrimination. Some research might usefully include the identification of requirements for service delivery, the action which was taken and an evaluation of such action, as well as the need for further action, if necessary. Such research might encourage reflection of how practice might be altered to ensure that race equality is embedded and mainstreamed into the structures and processes of public institutions. A centrally co-ordinated programme of research relating to minority ethnic people might seek to support, compile and widely disseminate practice-based research in a broad spectrum of policy-related areas.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE PROPOSED LARGE-SCALE SURVEY

10.78 The proposed large-scale survey has already been the subject of close examination (System 3, 2001). It is not possible to comment on the strengths and limitations of various proposals of the study here in the time available. Instead, some topics that might be considered for possible inclusion are provided in Appendix 2, including some topics that have either been stimulated by, or drawn from Modood et al (1997) and the 1991 Scottish Office Survey.

REFERENCES

Beresford and Croft (1993) *Getting involved: a practical manual*. York: Open Services Project and Joseph Rowntree Foundation

Commission for Racial Equality (1999) *Racial Equality Matters: an agenda for the Scottish Parliament*. Edinburgh: CRE

Scottish Association of Black Researchers (2001) *An Ethical Code for Researching 'Race', Racism and Anti-racism in Scotland*. SABRE: www.sabre.ukgo.com

Mental Health Foundation (1999) *User-led research* London: Strategies for Living Project, Mental Health Foundation

Modood, T Berthoud, R, Lakey J Nazroo, J, Smith, P, Virdee, S and Beishon, S (1997) *Ethnic minorities in Britain* London: Policy Studies Institute

System 3 (2001) *Scoping Study for a National Survey of Scotland's Minority Ethnic Populations* Edinburgh: Scottish Executive

APPENDIX 1: QUESTIONNAIRE CIRCULATED TO AGENCIES

Survey of Research on Minority Ethnic People in Scotland (1990 Onwards)

PART 1: CONTACT DETAILS

Name:

Job title:

Organisation:

Address:

Tel No:

Fax:

E-mail:

PART 2: DETAILS OF RESEARCH YOU HAVE CONDUCTED/COMMISSIONED

If you or your organisation have previously conducted or commissioned research on minority ethnic people in Scotland from 1990 onwards, please complete Table 1. *Please note that this includes both published and unpublished research.*

If you or your organisation are currently involved in conducting or commissioning research in this area, please (also) complete Table 2.

If you or your organisation are planning to conduct or commission research in the next five years, please (also) complete Table 3.

GUIDANCE NOTES FOR COMPLETION OF TABLES

1. *Title.*

Full title as it appears on the research report.

2. *Name/s*

Name of the author or authors in the order that they appear on the report.

3. *Year*

Year in which report was completed.

4. *Subject*

Please categorise the **main** subject area/s of the research using one or more of the following headings:

- A. Housing
- B. Education (including community education)
- C. Access and Use of Other Public Services (including Health and Social Work)
- D. Employment, Enterprise and Poverty
- E. The Role of the Voluntary Sector
- F. Access to Justice (Including Civil Law and Criminal Justice)
- G. Rural Issues
- H. Other (please specify)

5. Population Studied

Where applicable, please state the section of the population which is the focus of the research e.g. Black women, Chinese elders, Muslim children.

6. Scope of research

This audit is concerned solely with research for which data was collected in Scotland. This includes research whose findings have wider implications for the rest of the UK. However, it does not include UK-wide studies which may include Scotland.

You are requested to indicate whether the research conducted is:

- A. National (i.e. a Scottish-wide study)
- B. Regional (please specify which Scottish region/s)
- C. Local (please specify the locality/localities)

7. Output of research

Please state whether the main output/s of the research has been published/unpublished. If it is a published report, please state by whom.

If it is not published, please indicate whether it is:

- A. A report for internal circulation only
- B. A report for external dissemination
- C. Dissertation (please specify academic level e.g. MA, PhD etc)
- D. Other (please specify)

8. Key words

Please fill in up to four key words which best describes the contents of your research e.g. accessibility, appropriateness. These key words will be used in a searchable database.

9. Main themes

In this space, you are invited to describe the main themes which have emerged from the research in which you have been involved, e.g. lack of culturally sensitivity services, need for consultation and participation, importance of a multi-agency approach.

10. Organisation which initiated/led the research

Where applicable, please name the organisation responsible for initiating the research. This may be either the organisation which commissioned the research or the one which proposed the research/took the lead in seeking funding for the research.

11. Funding of research

Was additional funding made available for the research?

- A. Yes
- B. No
- C. Not applicable

If yes, please specify by whom. For example, the Scottish Executive, local authority, research council, charitable trust and/or other funding body. NB. In some cases, the funder may be the same organisation which initiated the research.

12. Related publications

Please give details of any subsequent publications which are related to the main project output. For example, papers in academic/professional journals and/or books or book chapters.

If a paper in journal, please specify author/s, year, title of paper, name of journal, issue number and page numbers

If a book, please specify author/s (editor/s), year, title, publisher, place published.

If a chapter in book, please specify author/s, year, title of chapter, title of book, editor/s, publisher, place published.

13. Accompanying materials

If you are able to provide a copy of **one or more** of the following with the completed questionnaire, please tick to indicate which documents you are supplying:

A. The main research report

An executive summary

An abstract

Any related publication/s

An executive summary or an abstract would be very helpful in enabling us to include your work in the review. If you are unable to provide a copy of any of the above, please inform us where we might be able to obtain this ourselves.

End of Guidance Notes

1. Have you **previously** conducted or commissioned research on minority ethnic people?
Please delete as appropriate: *Yes/No*

If yes, please complete Table 1. There is space in the table to provide details of two research projects. Please photocopy Table1 if necessary.

Table 1. Research previously conducted or commissioned on minority ethnic people

Item	<i>Research Project 1</i>	<i>Research Project 2</i>
Title		
Author/s		
Year		
Subject area		
Population		
Scope		
Output		
Key words (up to 4)	1. 2. 3. 4.	1. 2. 3. 4.
Main themes		
Lead organisation		
Funder		
Related Publications		
Accompanying materials (please tick)	A. The main research report B. An executive summary C. An abstract D. Any related publication/s	A. The main research report B. An executive summary C. An abstract D. Any related publication/s

2. Are you **currently** conducting or commissioning research on minority ethnic people?
Please delete as appropriate: *Yes/No*

If yes, please complete Table 2. There is space in the table to provide details of two research projects. Please photocopy this sheet if necessary.

Table 2. Research currently being conducted or commissioned on minority ethnic people in Scotland

Item	<i>Research Project 1</i>	<i>Research Project 2</i>
Title		
Author/s		
Expected year of completion		
Subject area		
Population		
Scope		
Output		
Key words (up to 4)	1. 2. 3. 4.	1. 2. 3. 4.
Emerging themes		
Lead organisation		
Funder		

Are you **planning** to commission or conduct research on minority ethnic people in Scotland in the next 5 years? Please delete as appropriate Yes/No

If yes, please complete Table 3. There is space in the table to provide details of two research projects. Please photocopy this sheet if necessary.

Table 3. Future research on minority ethnic people in Scotland

Item	<i>Research Project 1</i>	<i>Research Project 2</i>
Title		
Author/s		
Subject area		
Scope		
Output		
Key words (up to 4)	1. 2. 3. 4.	1. 2. 3. 4.
Lead Organisation		
Funder		

In which areas do you think further research on minority ethnic people would be useful?

PART 3: DETAILS OF RESEARCH UNDERTAKEN BY STUDENTS

5. Are you currently supervising any undergraduate/postgraduate dissertations on minority ethnic people in Scotland, or have you previously supervised any such dissertations in the last 5 years? Please delete as appropriate: *Yes/No*

If yes, please complete Table 4 and photocopy if necessary.

Table 4. Supervision of minority ethnic research undertaken by students

Student's Name	Title of project	Course (e.g. BA in Housing Studies)	Year completed

6. Alternatively, are you currently providing a placement within your organisation for any student undertaking research on minority ethnic people in Scotland, or have you previously provided such a placement in the last 5 years?

Please delete as appropriate: *Yes/No*

If yes, please complete Table 5 and photocopy if necessary.

Table 5. Provision of placements for students undertaking minority ethnic research

Student's Name	Title of project	Course (e.g. BA in Housing Studies)	Year completed

PART 4: AGREEMENT TO MAKE THE INFORMATION PUBLIC

The details that you provide, including contact details, will be recorded on a database which may be made accessible to the public by the Scottish Executive. If you do not wish the details you have provided to be made publicly accessible, please tick this box:

PART 5: OTHER USEFUL CONTACTS

8. Are you in touch with any individuals or organisations which have conducted research on minority ethnic people in Scotland in the last 10 years?

If so, please provide us with the following details:

a. Name

Organisation

Tel No:

E-mail:

b. Name

Organisation

Tel No:

E-mail:

Please return the completed questionnaire to

*Dr. Gina Netto
Assistant Director
Scottish Ethnic Minorities Research Unit
Edinburgh College of Art/Heriot Watt University
79 Grassmarket
Edinburgh
EH1 2 HJ*

Thank you very much for your help

APPENDIX 2: TOPICS FOR PROPOSED LARGE-SCALE SURVEY

Housing

Household composition

Years head of household living in UK

Division of household into age-bands

Tenure

Actual and preferred

If owner occupied - Whether property previously owned by council

If social rented sector - Entitlement to buy and action taken

Density of occupation

Number of occupants and rooms

Financing of house purchase

Availability of loans/grants

Size of mortgages, loans and deposits

Deposit sources

Housing Type

Sharing and amenities

Quality of housing

Proximity to shops and facilities

Need for Adaptations

Neighbourhood

Vulnerability to crime and racial harassment

Satisfaction with house, neighbours and neighbourhood

Education

Qualifications gained

Nature of qualifications

Where were qualifications gained (within the UK/overseas, and if overseas-where from?)

Registered with any UK professional body

Ever attended a Scottish FE or HE (short courses, modules, postgraduate courses, undergraduate courses)

Education and lifelong learning

Awareness of adult education programmes

If yes, location and provider and whether vocational or non-vocational

Take up of education courses post school

Vocational or non-vocational and reason for take up

Who funds the attendance of courses - employer? self? other?

If employer, is this part of staff development?

Early Years Provision (for families with under -5s)

Take up of early years provision

If yes, nature of provision and funded by whom? If no, why not?

Social Care

Languages spoken

Main language and level of literacy/numeracy level

Other languages and literacy/numeracy level

Awareness of interpreting and translation services

Ever used?

If yes, when and which service?

Older People

Access to home support services

Long-term limiting illness

Health

Self-assessment of health

Registration with GP

Use of GP

Ease of communication

If difficult, use of interpreters

Use of oral health services

Use of in-patient services

Use of ante-natal and post-natal services

Those with children

Immunisation rates

Contact with health visitors

Access to justice

Racial harassment

Physical attack, property damage,

Verbal abuse in the last year

Extent of repeat victimisation in last year

Type of perpetrator involved in worst type of harassment/most frequently responsible for harassment

Whether or not reported to police

Whether satisfied by police action

Self-admission of racial prejudice

Employment

Full, part-time, self-employed

Employed, unemployed

If employed, by sector, by organisation type

Occupation

Nature of current work - does respondent use qualifications the respondent feels they have trained for?

Attitude of respondent to certain types of work (e.g. teaching, lecturing, civil service)

Salary scales and job status level (e.g. managerial, clerical)

What respondent is qualified for

Hours worked

Whether anti-social hours

Membership of a trade union

Working conditions

Ethnicity of colleagues
Ethnicity of supervisees
Experience of racial harassment in workplace
Trade union membership

Poverty

Levels of income
Ability to meet regular expenses
Ability to provide regular meals
Ability to buy children's clothes
Whether main earner
Number of earners
Number of non-earners
Access to Benefits
Housing benefits
Income Support
Family credit
Contact with government initiatives
Involvement in community-based organisations
Access to Training

Rural Areas

Access to and involvement in religious and community organisations
Access to social networks: family, friend and travel distance
Travel distance: to friends and family, to nearest town or essential services

Active Citizenship

Membership of a political party. If so which?
Involvement with community initiatives e.g. volunteering.
If yes, nature of volunteering? If not, why?
Awareness of existence of the Commission for Racial Equality, Racial Equality Councils, any local organisation working with minority ethnic or racial issues

Identity and Culture

Self Perceptions of identity of the respondent (avoiding use of current Census classifications)
Faith: active or passive